

**Modern-Day Trafficking of Young Children (< 13): Prevalence, Severity, Familial Offenders, Production of Child Abuse Materials, and Organized Crime Networks**  
Updated February 10, 2026, by Ellen Lacter, Ph.D.

Presented at the International Human Trafficking and Social Justice Conference, September 17-19, 2025. Website: <https://www.traffickingconference.com>

Ellen Lacter, Ph.D., is a California licensed psychologist with expertise in treatment of dissociative disorders, victims of ritualistic abuse, torture-based mind control, child sex-trafficking, and production of child abuse materials. She is published and maintains a website on these subjects: [www.endritualabuse.org](http://www.endritualabuse.org), to help survivors and educate therapists and the public.

Four descriptor words: Trafficking: Familial, Crime Networks

250-Word Presentation Summary:

The nature of child trafficking crimes is rapidly evolving in the modern era, related to the growth of the internet and advances in technology. This presentation presents recent data reported by the U.S. Department of Justice, Europol, Interpol, Internet Watch Foundation, WeProtect Global Alliance, and others, that indicates: 1) exponential increases in distribution of child sexual abuse materials (CSAMs) on the internet, recorded, live-stream and on-demand; 2) increasingly brutal, sadistic, and torture-level CSAMs; 3) a trend toward victimization of younger children, including toddlers and infants; 4) increased coercion of children to harm other children in online abuse; 5) familial sex trafficking and production of CSAMs is prevalent and under-reported; 6) organized crime networks are producing CSAMs and trafficking children; 7) child abuse by ritualistic abuse networks has been further substantiated; 8) online sexual extortion of children apart from any physical contact; 9) use of artificial intelligence to generate CSAM and extort victims; 10) increased networking amongst offenders on dark web forums to further their crimes; 11) offenders have a technological advantage in concealing their crimes, exceeding the investigative capacities of law enforcement and, 12) an abundance of CSAM is produced on U.S. soil. Young children are in greater danger than ever before. We have an obligation to understand these trends, to recognize victims as they present in psychotherapy and to law enforcement, to educate others, to advocate for inclusion of this content within our agencies and professional organizations, and to advocate for greater funding of law enforcement and legislative change.

Four Objectives:

1. Present current forensic and psychological research on the nature and prevalence of modern-day sexual abuse and sex trafficking of children aged 12 and under.
2. Dispel myths about the nature of child sexual abuse, child sex trafficking, and production of child sexual abuse materials (CSAMs).
3. Present current forensic and psychological research on the increased brutality and younger age of victims in modern-day child sexual abuse, child sex trafficking, and production of CSAMs.
4. Present current forensic and psychological research on child sex trafficking perpetrated by: a) family perpetrators, and b) by organized crime networks.

## Table of Contents

Introduction .....	Page 5
Overview: Modern-day Crimes Against Children under 13: A Changing Landscape.....	Page 8
What is Child Sex Trafficking? .....	Page 10
Appropriate Terminology.....	Page 12
A. General Definitions.....	Page 12
B. Terms to Avoid.....	Page 13
I. Exponential Increases in Production and Distribution of Child Sexual Abuse Materials (CSAMs) on the Open/Surface, Publicly-accessible and Dark Web/Net. ....	Page 14
A. Forms of CSAM. ....	Page 15
B. An Abundance of CSAM is Produced on U.S. Soil. ....	Page 17
C. Exponential Growth in Distribution of CSAMs. ....	Page 18
D. Revenue from CSAMs. ....	Page 21
II. Exponential Increases in Production and Distribution of Live-stream and On-Demand CSAM .....	Page 22
A. What is Live-Stream On-Demand CSAM/Live Distant Child Abuse?. ....	Page 22
B. Problems Posed by Live Distant Child Abuse for Law Enforcement.....	Page 23
III. Perpetrators’ Startling Technological Advantage in Concealing Dark Web Distribution of CSAMs, Far Exceeding the Investigative Capacities of Law Enforcement.....	Page 24
A. How Offenders Use Advanced Technology to Evade Law Enforcement.....	Page 25
B. Meta Defies Law Enforcement Warnings Not to Implement End-to-End Encryption .....	Page 28
C. Internal Challenges for Law Enforcement in Investigation of CSAMs. ....	Page 30
D. Efforts to Counter Online Sexual Exploitation and Abuse.....	Page 31
E. Failure by the Government and Technology Industry to Prioritize Safety of Children .....	Page 32
IV. Under-Representation of the Prevalence of Familial Sex Trafficking of Children. ....	Page 32
A. Salter and Wong Literature Review on Familial Sex Trafficking (2024).....	Page 34
B. Canadian Centre for Child Protection 2016 Data on CSAM and 2017 Survivor Survey .....	Page 35
C. Pacheco, Buenaventura & Miles Study: Ten Male Familial Trafficking Survivors (2023).....	Page 37
D. Raphael’s Depth Interviews of Four Victims Trafficked by their Parents. ....	Page 38
E. White, Robichaux, Huang & Leo Chart Review: Familial Sex Trafficking Victims (2024).....	Page 38
F. Impact of Technology and High Financial Incentives on Familial Child Sex Trafficking	

.....	Page 39
V. Increasingly Brutal, Sadistic, and Torture-level Abuse Against Children and a Trend Toward Victimization of Younger Children, Including Infants and Toddlers. ....	Page 40
A. Rating Systems for Severity of CSAM Abuse. ....	Page 40
B. Findings of ECPAT and Interpol (2018).....	Page 42
C. Findings of the United States Department of Justice. ....	Page 45
D. Data from the National Center for Missing and Exploited Children. ....	Page 46
E. Findings from the Canadian Centre for Child Protection Tipline Report. ....	Page 46
F. Internet Watch Foundation Data .....	Page 52
G. The International Justice Mission Report (2020). ....	Page 53
H. Case Example: Criminal Convictions of “Hurtcore” Sex Offender Peter Scully .....	Page 54
I. Case Example: Ian Watkins. ....	Page 55
J. Testimony to Congress by Flint Waters, Lead Agent for the Wyoming Internet Crimes Against Children Task Force, 2008.....	Page 56
K. Torture Level Abuse of Prostituted Women.....	Page 57
VI. CSAM Offenders Regularly Coerce Children to Harm Other Children. ....	Page 58
VII. Increased Evidence of Organized Criminal Child Abuse/Trafficking Networks.....	Page 61
A. The Hydrant Programme Report: <i>Group-Based Offending Publication</i> .....	Page 62
B. Canadian Centre For Child Protection Research on Organized Abuse.....	Page 65
C. Victim Reports of Consumers Seeking Brutal CSAM of Young Children.....	Page 67
D. The Franklin Child Sex Trafficking Network.....	Page 68
E. The Epstein/Maxwell Child Sex Trafficking Network. ....	Page 68
VIII. Greater Evidence of Child Abuse and Trafficking in Ritualistic Abuse Networks... .	Page 72
A. Disinformation Propaganda Campaigns to Discredit the Realities of Ritualistic Abuse and Abusive Mind Control.....	Page 73
B. Empirical and Forensic Evidence of Ritualistic Abuse.....	Page 74
C. Cases with Criminal Convictions with Elements of Ritualistic Practices.....	Page 82
D. Ritual Abusers Traffic Victims to Other Hands-on Offenders and in CSAM Production .....	Page 107
E. Evidence of Human Trafficking and CSAM Raise Credibility of Ritualistic Abuse .....	Page 109
F. Cases with Intersections Between Ritual Abuse and Human Trafficking and CSAM Production and Distribution .....	Page 109
G. The Evidence of Abusive Mind Control.....	Page 116
H. Coerced Perpetration within Ritual Abuse. ....	Page 121
I. Hanson Report (2025) on the Murder of Children Organized Ritualistic Abuse .....	Page 124
J. Ritualistic Abuse as Family-Based Non-State Torture.....	Page 125
K. Lived-Experience Accounts of Ritualistic Abuse and Mind Control.....	Page 126

IX. Increased Networking among Child Abuse and Trafficking Perpetrators on Dark Web  
Forums, Chatrooms, Etc., to Further Their Crimes. . . . . Page 128

X. Extreme Increases in Online Sexual Extortion of Children Apart from Any Physical Contact  
Between Perpetrators and Victims . . . . . Page 131

XI. Use of Generative Artificial intelligence (GAI) to Generate or Alter CSAM and Extort  
Victims. . . . . Page 134

XII. Greater Evidence of Abuse in Daycare and Schools. . . . . Page 137

XIII. Greater Evidence of Clergy Abuse. . . . . Page 139

XIV. Indications of Increased Use of Drugs to Abuse and Control Victims . . . . . Page 139

XV. Greater Evidence of Child Abuse Within Children’s Recreational Organizations. . Page 140

XVI. Increased Abuse and Neglect Secondary to Increased Poverty and Homelessness  
. . . . . Page 140

Who Needs this Information?. . . . . Page 140

References. . . . . Page 143

## Introduction

Hello to everyone. I am Ellen Lacter, psychologist in San Diego, California.

I want to thank the Human Trafficking and Social Justice Institute for putting on this incredible conference and for accepting my proposal to present on:

### **Modern-Day Trafficking of Young Children (< 13): Prevalence, Severity, Familial Offenders, Production of Child Abuse Materials, and Organized Crime Networks**

I will be covering some very difficult content today – the extreme abuse of young children.

This material is especially difficult for child abuse survivors and for anyone who has young children or grandchildren. Please brace yourself and feel free to take a walk or log out as needed.

I began my professional career as an art therapist in the 1970s. In the 1980s, I became a licensed psychologist. I have worked in private practice with children, teens, and adults for 40 years.

Professionally, I grew up with the field.

In the **1980s**, we all came to understand the prevalence of child sexual abuse and its devastation.

By the **late 1980s and early 1990s**, therapy clients were describing torture-level abuse inflicted by groups of abusers on multiple victims in terrorizing ceremonies that included the worship of destructive deities – ritualistic abuse. We also began to understand that unbearable abuse forms dissociated identities, Multiple Personality Disorder, now called Dissociative Identity Disorder.

We were on the front lines. Terrified clients were telling us things they could tell no one else.

Research bears this up. For example, the Canadian Centre for Child Protection conducted a survey of adults victimized as children within production of child sexual abuse materials (CSAMs), and found that for the 96 respondents whose abuse was uncovered/discovered/disclosed, 75% had **only** told a therapist” (C3P), 2017a, p. 25).

In the **early 1990s**, a number of important studies corroborated the reality of abuse (Snow & Sorenson, 1990; Kelley, 1992b; Waterman, Kelly, Olivieri, & McCord, 1993; Jonker & Jonker-Bakker, 1991, 1997; Bybee & Mowbray, 1993; Faller, 1994). However, forensic data lagged behind.

In the **mid-1990s**, a large disinformation campaign was waged by *the False Memory Syndrome Foundation* [FMSF] in the press and on the internet to deny the veracity of:

1. dissociative amnesia,
2. recovered memories,
3. children’s disclosures of abuse,

4. Multiple Personality Disorder, and
5. ritualistic abuse and abusive mind control.

The FMSF accused therapists of inducing false memories of abuse. They encouraged clients to pursue licensing board complaints and lawsuits against therapists. Many therapists were intimidated into silence about what they knew to be true.

The Canadian Centre explains the harm caused by such large-scale disavowal (C3P, 2017a, p.39):

“The efforts of perpetrators to silence their accounts through threats and violence was in many ways perpetrated by institutionalized forces of disavowal and disbelief that actively undermined their efforts to seek care and support, and prevented them from finding justice for the crimes committed against them and witnessed by them”

In **1996/1997**, I obtained powerful corroboration in two cases of ritualistic abuse and abusive mind control.

With this as my foundation, in **2000**, I created my website: [www.endritualabuse.org](http://www.endritualabuse.org) to share my knowledge about ritual abuse and abusive mind control, to expose the disinformation for what it was, and to advocate for victims.

In the **late 1990s** and **2000s**, I came to understand that ritual abuse offenders regularly:

1. film their sadistic sexual abuse of children for financial profit and to control them with threats and shame,
2. traffic victims to other hands-on offenders for profit and to increase their trauma load,
3. coerce their victims to harm other victims, beginning in early childhood.

By **2011**, I had conducted research and written theoretical academic publications on ritual abuse and abusive mind control (Lacter, 2008; Lacter 2011; Lacter & Lehman 2008).

As an outspoken advocate for victims, I was a convenient target. The FMSF ridiculed me in their online newsletters – three times! I was “earning my stripes.” I am glad my advocacy mattered enough for the FMSF to attack me! I have also been called a “conspiracy therapist,” along with many other therapists who recognize the reality of ritual abuse and abusive mind control (see: <https://greyfaction.org/resources/proponents/who>).

I have learned to expect such attacks. I take them in stride. I believe they are inevitable when we stand up against organized crime.

By the **2010s**, I was bearing witness to client descriptions of extreme levels of sadism within the

production of child abuse materials apart from ritualistic abuse. Once again, I had to come to terms with something unthinkable. By the 2010s, technology had facilitated enormous growth in the production and distribution of child abuse and torture materials. Accordingly, consumers were seeking novel and more sadistic content, including victimization of very young children. I learned that coercion of victims to harm other victims was a mainstay of this abuse as well.

**Prior to 2015**, there was not a lot of law enforcement data corroborating victim-survivor accounts of these levels of sadism. Victims were describing these forms of brutal and systematic abuse mostly in therapy offices. These were not “false memories.” These were terrified, horrified, and heart-broken people, many still being abused as adults.

However: *The Times They Are a-Changin’*, Bob Dylan

**Since about 2015**, we have been witnessing a significant shift in awareness of extreme and highly sadistic forms of abuse. The data, including and importantly law enforcement data, has been catching up with what victims have been telling psychotherapists for years.

In addition, the nature of crimes against children is rapidly evolving in the modern era, in large part due to the impact of technology. Young children are in greater danger than ever before.

I believe that we have an obligation: 1) to understand these emerging trends, 2) to recognize child and adult victims as they present in psychotherapy, 3) to assign credibility to victim accounts when they report to law enforcement, 4) to advocate for inclusion of this content in the training, policies, and treatment guidelines of our agencies and professional organizations, and 5) to advocate for greater funding of law enforcement and legislative change to protect victims.

This data on evolving forms of extreme and sadistic abuse is the content of my presentation.

I know that absorbing this content, in itself, causes trauma. However, I believe that we must knit this knowledge into our beings and suffer the sorrow that follows. Victims can sense this in us and it forms a psychological space for them to disclose abuse of this severity. And once we know about this abuse, we often become part of larger efforts to educate others and to create change.

In the words of civil rights freedom fighter, John Lewis:

“If not us, then who? If not now, then when?”

I will now present on psychological and forensic findings on the evolving nature of child sexual abuse and trafficking in the modern era, including highly sadistic abuse of very young children.

The Human Trafficking and Social Justice Institute has made available to conference attendees my complete working document. I have added some updates to that document herein.

## **Overview: Modern-day Crimes Against Children under 13: A Changing Landscape**

The nature of child sexual abuse and trafficking crimes against children is rapidly evolving in the modern era. It is essential that all organizations that address child abuse, including psychotherapy organizations that address child abuse and trauma, educate their membership and the public on these emerging trends. It is my hope that professional societies such as the *American Psychological Association*, the *American Psychiatric Association*, *The International Society for Traumatic Stress Studies*, *The International Society for the Study of Trauma and Dissociation*, and others, will include in their conferences, trainings, and treatment guidelines content on the necessity of psychotherapists staying current on the evolving nature of crimes against children.

Psychological and forensic findings on the evolving nature of child sexual abuse and trafficking in the modern era provide evidence of the following:

1. We are seeing exponential increases in production and distribution of child sexual abuse materials (CSAMs) and child torture materials, recorded, live-stream, and on-demand, on the open/surface, publicly-accessible internet, and dark web/net.
2. Familial sex trafficking and production of CSAMs is prevalent and under-reported.
3. An abundance of CSAM is produced on U.S. soil.
4. There is a trend toward increasingly brutal, sadistic, and torture-level abuse of children in CSAM and other child trafficking.
5. There is a trend toward victimization of younger children, including infants and toddlers.
6. Child abuse perpetrators are more regularly coercing children to harm other children.
7. There is increased evidence of organized criminal child abuse and trafficking networks.
8. Child abuse by ritualistic abuse networks has been further substantiated.
9. Offenders have a startling technological advantage in concealing production/distribution of CSAMs and child torture materials, far exceeding law enforcement's investigative capacities.
10. Child sexual abuse offenders, including CSAM producers and consumers, are increasingly networking on dark web forums, chat rooms, etc., to encourage and normalize child sexual abuse and child torture, and conceal their crimes from law enforcement.
11. We are seeing very recent extreme increases in online sexual extortion of children apart from any physical contact between perpetrators and victims.
12. Generative artificial intelligence (GAI) is being used to generate or alter CSAMs and to

extort victims.

13. There is greater evidence of abuse in daycare and schools.

14. There is greater evidence of clergy abuse.

15. There are indications of increased use of drugs to abuse and control victims

16. There is greater evidence of child abuse within children's recreational organizations

17. We are seeing increased abuse and neglect secondary to increased poverty and homelessness.

I will now expand on each of these issues in my discussion of the psychological and forensic findings on the evolving nature of child sexual abuse and trafficking in the modern era, including highly sadistic abuse of very young children (starting on p. 14).

## What is Child Sex Trafficking?

Per the United States Department of Justice (2023a):

Child sex trafficking refers to the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, obtaining, patronizing, or soliciting of a minor for the purpose of a commercial sex act. United States Department of Justice (2023a). Child sex trafficking.  
Full text: <https://www.justice.gov/criminal/criminal-ceos/child-sex-trafficking>

Per the United States Code 18 U.S.C § 1591\*, “commercial sex acts” include “any sex act, on account of which anything of value is given to or received by any person,” including “money, goods, personal benefit, in-kind favors, or some other kind of benefit.” The statute does not require that the defendant or victim crosses state or international lines. Furthermore, “When the victim is a minor, Section 1591 does not require proof that the defendant used force, threats of force, fraud, or coercion, or any combination of those means, to cause the minor to engage in a commercial sex act.”

\* United States Code 18 U.S.C § 1591- Sex trafficking of children or by force, fraud, or coercion

Child Sex Trafficking is prohibited by 18 U.S.C. § 1591. This statute makes it a federal offense to knowingly recruit, entice, harbor, transport, provide, obtain, or maintain a minor (defined as someone under 18 years of age) knowing or in reckless disregard of the fact that the victim is a minor and would be caused to engage in a commercial sex act. “Commercial sex act” is defined very broadly to include “any sex act, on account of which anything of value is given to or received by any person.” In other words, it is illegal both to offer and to obtain a child, and cause that child to engage in any kind of sexual activity in exchange for anything of value, whether it be money, goods, personal benefit, in-kind favors, or some other kind of benefit. Section 1591 also makes it a crime for individuals to participate in a business venture that obtains minors and causes them to engage in commercial sex acts.

Section 1591 is called “Sex trafficking of children or by force, fraud, or coercion.” Most people think of “trafficking” as involving movement across state or international borders. However, Section 1591 does not require proof that either the defendant or victim crossed state or international lines.

When the victim is a minor, Section 1591 does not require proof that the defendant used force, threats of force, fraud, or coercion, or any combination of those means, to cause the minor to engage in a commercial sex act.

If the victim was under the age of 14 or if force, fraud, or coercion were used, the penalty is not less than 15 years in prison up to life. If the victim was aged 14-17, the penalty shall not be less than 10 years in prison up to life. Anyone who obstructs or attempts to obstruct the enforcement of this statute faces as many as 20 years imprisonment. Defendants who are convicted under this statute are also required to pay restitution to their victims for any losses they caused.

Department of Justice (2023b). Citizen's Guide To U.S. Federal Law On Child Sex Trafficking  
<https://www.justice.gov/criminal/criminal-ceos/citizens-guide-us-federal-law-child-sex-trafficking>

Despite the broad scope of this code, most reports on child sex trafficking by mainstream media and government agencies focus on disenfranchised teenagers who are vulnerable to stranger-traffickers who coerce them into prostitution. For example, the 2023 Federal Human Trafficking Report indicates an average victim age of 16, a typical range of 14 to 17, and emphasizes victims who are homeless, runaways, impoverished, abuse substances and illegal immigrants, etc.

National reports that over-represent child sex trafficking as a crime against adolescents by

strangers include:

2023 Federal Human Trafficking Report:

p. 44: The top vulnerabilities for adult victims of human trafficking included: drug or substance abuse (33); no legal status (20); poverty or financial insecurity (17); being homeless (12); limited ability to speak or understand English (11); prior trafficking victim (9); LGBTQ status (1); and having been in the foster care system (1).<sup>37</sup>  
<https://traffickinginstitute.org/federal-human-trafficking-report/>

The National Child Traumatic Stress Network (undated). About child sex trafficking.

<https://www.nctsn.org/what-child-trauma/traumatypes/sex-trafficking/about-child-sex-trafficking>

This webpage provides examples of child sex trafficking that range from age 11 to 16. This is an example of how anti-trafficking material often neglects pre-adolescent children.

United States Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (2024). About Sex Trafficking.

<https://www.cdc.gov/sexual-violence/about/about-sex-trafficking.html>

This webpage states: “Perpetrators often target people experiencing poverty, living in an unsafe situation, or searching for a better life.” This representation neglects the prevalence of trafficking by family members.

Like many psychotherapists, most of my clients report sexual abuse, child sex trafficking, and abuse within CSAM production, that began well before the age of 13, often in early childhood and very close to home. Their abusers include parents, other relatives, nannies, babysitters, friends’ parents, neighbors, youth organizations, and child-serving institutions, including corrupt or infiltrated schools, preschools, daycare, religious institutions, health and mental health professionals, and instructors and coaches of extracurricular activities.

Many psychotherapy clients report that their early childhood abusers, usually family members, trafficked them to other offenders to be sexually abused, and also filmed the sexual assault they inflicted and distributed these child sexual abuse materials (CSAMs) to other offenders. Most reports on child sex trafficking omit or inadequately represent this trafficking of young children.

The prevalence of the production and distribution of CSAMs across the board, by family and by other abusers, is also much higher than is generally discussed in the mainstream media.

Most reports on human trafficking also do not capture the brutality of the abuse that our clients describe. Our clients tell us of extremely sadistic abuse, including being violently coerced to violently abuse other children.

Many of our clients also describe that their primary abusers belonged to, or provided them to, highly organized criminal networks that abuse multiple children. They describe this within:

1. Large-scale production and distribution of recorded, live-stream, and on-demand video of child sexual assault (CSAM) for financial profit,
2. Cult networks that abuse children within their spiritual ideologies, including sadistic rituals that include worship of malevolent deities – that is, ritualistic abuse, and,
3. Criminal groups with ethnic-hate and other political ideological agendas.

## Appropriate Terminology

Before going more deeply into the content of my presentation, it is important to be familiar with the correct terminology currently in use to discuss child exploitation, trafficking, and online abuse of children

### A. General Definitions

The terms, **Online Child Sexual Exploitation (OCSE)** and **Online Child Sexual Exploitation and Abuse (OCSEA)** are terms that are inclusive of multiple forms of online abuse:

OCSE includes a variety of sexual acts or interactions between an online predator and a child in a virtual setting. These may include grooming, catfishing, live video streaming, consuming child sexual abuse material (CSAM) (Zeyzus John, 2024, p.2)

The following terms are drawn from: Department of Homeland Security (2024). Know the Threat: Online Child Sexual Exploitation and Abuse.

<b>Child Sexual Abuse Material (CSAM) [aka: Child Sexual Exploitation Materials -CSEM and Child Sexual Abuse Imagery- CSAI]</b>	Any visual depiction of sexually explicit conduct involving a person less than 18 years old.
<b>Online Enticement and Coercion (Grooming):</b>	The sexual grooming process includes identifying a minor, establishing a connection by offering support and attention to the minor, befriending them, gaining their trust, gathering personal information about them, exploiting any vulnerabilities they may have, and lowering their inhibitions by talking, joking, and teaching a minor about sex.
<b>Sextortion*:</b>	Occurs when offenders use threats or coercive tactics to cause victims to produce and send sexually explicit imagery of themselves.
<b>Financial Sextortion:</b>	Occurs when minors are coerced into sending explicit images online and extorted for money.
<b>Livestreaming Child Sexual Exploitation (LCSE) [or Live Distant Child Abuse (LDCA)]:</b>	Occurs when an offender compels a child victim to engage in sexually explicit conduct during a broadcast, in real time, to one or more viewers.
<b>Generative Artificial Intelligence (GAI) CSAM:</b>	The production, through digital media, of child sexual abuse material and other wholly or partly artificially or digitally created sexualized images of children.

\* Europol, the European Union Agency for Law Enforcement Cooperation (2022), suggests that the phrase, “online sexual coercion and extortion of children” replace the term, “sextortion.”

Additional important definitions are provided by The International Justice Mission (2020). Report: “Behind The Screens A Compilation of Case Studies and Learnings about the Online Sexual Exploitation of Children (OSEC),” as follows:

<b>Online Sexual Exploitation [and Abuse] of Children (OSE[A]C):</b>	The trafficking of children to create new child sexual exploitation material, including through live-streaming, for demand-side sex offenders who pay for, direct, and view the abuse online.
<b>Demand-Side Offender:</b>	Any person who pays for, directs, and/or views child sexual abuse or exploitation online, including in livestreaming. Demand-side offenders in OSEC cases actively participate in the repeated sexual abuse of children by requesting or dictating specific abuse acts in advance or in real-time as it occurs via livestream.
<b>In-person Trafficker:</b>	Any person who sexually abuses or exploits a child by creating and selling new CSEM to demand-side offenders.

See: <https://respect.international/wp-content/uploads/2021/05/BEHIND-THE-SCREENS-A-Compilation-of-Case-Studies-and-Learnings-about-the-Online-Sexual-Exploitation-of-Children.pdf>

A relatively new term within CSAM is: “**hurtcore**.” It was likely first coined by abusers, such as Matthew Graham on his website [www.hurt2thecore](http://www.hurt2thecore). An early reference to “hurtcore” was in a 2018 Europol report that discusses an abuser forum that used this term to refer to rape, torture, gore, snuff and blackmail. The term speaks to the brutality of CSAM abuse in recent history.

## B. Terms to Avoid

The International Criminal Police Organization, INTERPOL, is a organization based in Paris that coordinates investigations made by the police forces of member countries into crimes with an international dimension. A 2024 Interpol publication on appropriate terminology states: “We encourage the use of appropriate terminology to avoid trivializing the sexual abuse and exploitation of children.” This document is based on The Luxembourg Guidelines (2016), developed by a group of 18 international partners, including INTERPOL. Interpol suggests:

<b>Terms to Use with Caution or Avoid</b>	<b>Recommended</b>
<b>Child pornography</b>	Child sexual abuse material (CSAM)
<b>Child sex tourism</b>	Sexual exploitation of children in the context of travel and tourism
<b>Child sex tourist</b>	Travelling perpetrators of child sexual offences
<b>Child prostitution</b>	Exploitation of children in/for prostitution
<b>Child prostitute, child sex worker</b>	Victim of sexual exploitation
<b>Customer, client, John</b>	Abuser, child sex offender
<b>Webcam child sex tourism or webcam child sex abuse</b>	Live online child sexual abuse [aka: Livestreaming child sexual exploitation (LCSE)]

## **I. Exponential Increases in Production and Distribution of Child Sexual Abuse Materials (CSAMs) on the Open/Surface, Publicly-accessible and Dark Web/Net**

The following powerful summary statement by John Shehan, Senior Vice President, Exploited Children Division and International Engagement, of the National Center for Missing and Exploited Children (NCMEC) (2024) delivered to the United States House Committee on Oversight and Accountability Subcommittee on Cybersecurity, Information Technology, and Government Innovation, sums up the history of production and distribution of child sexual abuse materials (CSAMs) in the last 50 years:

Prior to the 1990s, child sexual exploitation primarily occurred when a child was sexually abused and photos or videos of the abuse were made and physical copies of the imagery then shared with other individuals through the mail, in person, or in magazines sold at bookstores. As the Internet became more accessible to the general public in the 1990s, NCMEC identified a growing trend of offenders who were using the Internet to entice and sexually exploit children and openly distribute and share CSAM imagery. The Internet quickly evolved, and with it, an explosive new trend in how children were sexually exploited. On the Internet, offenders could easily share CSAM depicting rape and sexual abuse images and videos of children with others, regardless of where in the world they were. As different social media and file-sharing platforms emerged and the Internet grew more multifaceted and sophisticated, so did new online crimes against children. These crimes, often horrific in nature, were facilitated by multi-platform messenger/chat apps and classified ad sites, and include child sex trafficking, online enticement, sextortion, and financial sextortion. The development of anonymizing technologies that offenders could use to obfuscate their true identity and location further empowered offenders' sexual exploitation of children.

As smart phones and Internet connections have become more accessible worldwide at lower costs, most everyone now owns or has access to devices (including smart phones, tablets, and laptops) with a camera, an Internet connection, and near limitless, low-cost storage for images and videos. This has enabled offenders to create and disseminate CSAM wherever they are with a child and a connected device, and to compile larger collections of CSAM – often ranging into the hundreds of thousands of CSAM images and videos.

Finkelhor, Turner, & Colburn (2024) found that data on prevalence rates of child sexual abuse is significantly higher when surveys include questions about online sexual abuse.

A 2024 study of the viewing behavior of CSAM consumers (Wortley et al.) helps us understand the demand that fuels the exponential growth to CSAM distribution. They found that:

Participants reported that, when their viewing was at its peak, they spent on average 2.7 h (SD = 2.3) per day watching CSAM and 2.0 h (SD = 2.4) per day watching adult pornography.

In a 2024 articles titled “Accessing child sexual abuse material: Pathways to offending and online behaviour,” Wortley et al., describe a “tsunami” (citing WeProtect, 2019) in the increase of CSAMs since the advent of the internet, and that:

The Internet has allowed individuals, who in pre-Internet times would not have had the wherewithal to access CSAM, to satisfy even a passing curiosity about CSAM with ‘a click of a mouse’ (Quayle, 2012, p, 110). Research on adult community samples has reported prevalence rates for having viewed online CSAM of between 2 % and 5 % (Brown, 2023; Dombert et al., 2016; Seigfried-Spellar & Rogers, 2013; Seto et al., 2015). (p. 154)

## **A. Forms of CSAM**

Forms of CSAM include: 1) recorded, 2) livestream, and 3) “live-distant child abuse” (LDCA), i.e., viewers direct in-person abusers to perpetrate acts of abuse on demand via pay-per-view.

Production of CSAMs is inflicted both on a small scale, e.g., by home and community offenders, and by organized criminal networks, sometimes in large-scale clandestine production facilities.

The University of Nottingham Report (2023) describes three kinds of “supply-side” CSAM distributors (Ramiro, et al., 2019; Varrella, 2017; Terre des Hommes, 2013) (pp. 8 to 9):

**Individual operations.** Individual operations refer to children taking part in an activity independently, with no direct involvement from another individual. These children are often from homes that are not well-functioning and may endure physical or emotional mistreatment. They may find out about the activity by themselves through searching online or be encouraged to participate by their peers.

...

**Family-run operations.** Research has revealed that the majority of OSEC [online sexual exploitation of children] cases are usually family-oriented crimes, with the victim’s own biological parents or relatives being the perpetrators of the abuse (IJM\*, 2020, p. 51; Garcia & Manikan, 2014, p. 30; Terre des Hommes, 2013). In this form of abuse, mothers or other relatives take control of children and force them to do sexual activities that are recorded on camera (Dedase-Escoton, et al., 2020, p. 18). When parents are not directly involved, the abuse may be carried out by other people close to children, including family friends, neighbours, or other members of their local community (Terre des Hommes, 2013). [\*See International Justice Mission Report, 2020c]

...

**Cybersex dens.** Cybersex dens are covert operations, largely hidden in poor neighbourhoods, where trafficked or recruited children are forced by facilitators or traffickers to provide sexual activities for OSEC customers (Dedase-Escoton, et al., 2020, p. 18). Children may be targeted by unscrupulous individuals who use the internet and information communication technologies (ICTs) to offer them employment and a way to

make quick money (ECPAT France, 2022, p. 21). This activity can be conducted in private residences, as well as in large-scale underground organizations, which are often managed by organized criminal groups, including foreign nationals. [Note Peter Sculley case discussed below.] The size and complexity of these underground operations can vary, and they can be hidden behind legitimate businesses, such as internet cafés (ibid)

The Nottingham report (2023) has a significant focus on supply-side offenders, i.e., producers and distributors, in economically-disadvantaged countries. However, it also makes clear that CSAM crime crosses economic class:

Most respondents in Dedase-Escoton et al.'s study on OSEC highlighted poverty and the belief that it is a convenient way to earn money as significant risk factors for engaging in OSEC (Dedase-Escoton, et al., 2020, p. 36). It was reported that a lack of stable income and financial resources made facilitators and victims particularly susceptible to this form of abuse. Respondents stated that families often use poverty and the need to survive as a justification for subjecting their children to live streamed sexual acts (ibid). Additionally, it was pointed out that not all perpetrators are necessarily in a lower economic class, as these individuals may have well-off clients. Some respondents indicated that people may resort to OSEC to finance their 'wants', rather than their needs (ibid). (p. 12)

Victims in North America of CSAM production and sex trafficking of all social classes describe begin victimized within familial and large-scale organized crime networks.

The Nottingham report (2023) indicates that the majority of demand-side offenders, that is "consumer-customers," are from developed countries:

An analysis of OSEC customers revealed that they were predominantly male between 40 and 59 years old and from Western countries (Dedase-Escoton, et al., 2020, p. 18). OSEC customers were most commonly recorded to be from the United States, United Kingdom, Australia, and Western European/Nordic nations (IJM, 2020, p. 12). (p. 10)

Europol (2022a) has identified four key threats in the area of child sexual exploitation:

- 1. Peer-to-peer (P2P) networks and anonymised access like Darknet networks (e.g. Tor).** These computer environments remain the main platform to access child abuse material and the principal means for non-commercial distribution. These are invariably attractive for offenders and easy to use. The greater level of anonymity and the strong networking possibilities offered by hidden internet that exists beneath the "surface web" appear to make criminals more comfortable in offending and discussing their sexual interests.
- 2. Live-streaming of child sexual abuse.** Facilitated by new technology, one trend concerns the profit-driven abuse of children overseas, live in front of a camera at the request of westerners. [Note: This statement erroneously implies that North American and

European offenders do not livestream sexual abuse of children; this is a troubling myth.]

To a lesser degree, there is also some evidence that forms of commercial child sexual exploitation such as on-demand live streaming of abuse is also contributing to the rise of the amount of CSEM online.

Live distant child abuse [LDCA] has the most obvious links with commercial distribution of CSEM. As new and/or unseen CSEM is valuable currency within the offending community, live distant abuse is therefore a way to not only acquire more CSEM, but to simultaneously generate material with a high ‘value’.

**3. Online solicitation and sexual extortion.** The growing number of children and teenagers who own smartphones has been accompanied by the production of self-generated indecent material. Such material, initially shared with innocent intent, often finds its way to “collectors”, who often proceed to exploit the victim, in particular by means of extortion.

**4. Networking and forensic awareness of offenders.** Offenders learn from the mistakes of those that have been apprehended by law enforcement.

This list of threats is taken from Europol’s webpage on Child Sexual Exploitation. See: <https://www.europol.europa.eu/crime-areas/child-sexual-exploitation>

## **B. An Abundance of CSAM is Produced on U.S. Soil**

Mainstream coverage of child sex trafficking places emphasis on child sex trafficking, including CSAM production, that originates in economically disadvantaged countries, e.g., in South Asia and Central America. Significantly less attention is placed on trafficking and CSAM production by offenders in the United States and Europe.

This is not congruent with the research data. The fact is that CSAM production, distribution, and consumption is not “over there,” in economically-disadvantaged countries. It is right here in North America and Europe. We are a large portion of the producers and the customers.

A 2022 article by Rhiannon Williams in the *MIT Technology Review* titled: “The US hosts more child sexual abuse content online than any other country,” states:

The US hosts more child sexual abuse content online than any other country in the world, new research has found. The US accounted for 30% of the global total of child sexual abuse material (CSAM) URLs at the end of March 2022, according to the Internet Watch Foundation, a UK-based organization that works to spot and take down abusive content. <https://www.technologyreview.com/2022/04/26/1051282/the-us-now-hosts-more-child-sexual-abuse-material-online-than-any-other-country/>

Similarly, the University of Nottingham Rights Lab’s “Investigation into Financial Transactions

Used in the Online Sexual Exploitation of Children” (2023) states:

Nearly all of the world’s CSAM is located in Europe and North America, with the Netherlands alone accounting for 47% (Bracket Foundation, 2019, p. 6). Further, the supply-side component of OSEC is spreading quickly to developing markets as they gain access to modern technology and the internet. This enables them to easily access and share CSAM, which can be further distributed to a larger audience (ibid). This has the potential to create a dangerous environment for children in an increasingly wide pool of countries, as they become more vulnerable to exploitation by traffickers and perpetrators. (P. 20)

### **C. Exponential Growth in Distribution of CSAMs**

CSAM distribution has grown at an alarming rate in the age of the internet, especially in the past ten years. Many reports describe this growth as exponential and as outpacing the capacity of law enforcement to respond (Bursztein et al, 2019; Keller & Dance, 2019; Salter & Hanson, 2021).

In 2023, the United States Department of Justice (DoJ) issued a lengthy report to the United States Congress entitled: *Child Sexual Abuse Material: Working group report*. (United States Department of Justice, 2023c). ([https://www.justice.gov/d9/2023-06/child\\_sexual\\_abuse\\_material\\_2.pdf](https://www.justice.gov/d9/2023-06/child_sexual_abuse_material_2.pdf))

This DoJ report (2023c) begins by describing the gravity of modern-day online sexual exploitation crime and its rapid growth over the last 30 years:

Due to rapid technological changes, online child sexual exploitation offenses are increasing in scale and complexity. Individuals who seek to sexually exploit children through CSAM can do so from anywhere in the world by using digital devices and the internet. Modern smartphones are the ideal child exploitation tool for offenders, as they can be used to photograph, record, or watch live child sexual abuse; store CSAM on the device; access CSAM stored remotely; connect with victims and other offenders; and distribute and receive CSAM, through an endless variety of applications. The device itself and the applications often cloak this criminal activity with encryption.

The market for CSAM among individuals with a sexual interest in children drives the demand for new and more egregious images and videos. The push for new CSAM results in the continued abuse and exploitation of child victims, and the abuse of new children every day. When these images and videos are posted and disseminated online, the victimization continues in perpetuity. Children often suffer a lifetime of re-victimization knowing the documentation of their sexual abuse is on the internet, available for others to access forever. (P. 1)

The DoJ report (2023c) describes the many forms of internet technology that make CSAMs readily available:

CSAM is readily available through virtually every internet technology, including social networking platforms, file-sharing sites, gaming devices, and mobile apps. This has led to unprecedented growth in the volume of reports submitted to the CyberTipline operated by the National Center for Missing & Exploited Children (NCMEC). The CyberTipline provides a single interface where private citizens and companies, such as Electronic Service Providers (ESPs), can report suspected online child exploitation. (P. 2)

In a 2019, Bursztein et al. presented a longitudinal measurement study of online child sexual abuse imagery (CSAI) distribution at the World Wide Web Conference. They described growth in distribution of CSAM as exponential, and a high incidence of victims under 10 years of age and rape and sexual torture:

In this paper, we present the first longitudinal measurement study of CSAI distribution online and the threat it poses to society's ability to combat child sexual abuse. Our results illustrate that CSAI [Child Sexual Abuse Imagery, aka CSAM] has grown exponentially—to nearly 1 million detected events per month—exceeding the capabilities of independent clearinghouses and law enforcement to take action.

...

Child sexual abuse is a horrific crime affecting an estimated 9–19.7% of girls and 3–7.9% of boys [2, 31, 38]. These children endure indecent exposure, forced intercourse, and sex trafficking [33]. Even after escaping abusers, victims face immediate and lasting consequences such as a heightened risk of depression, substance abuse, and suicide [5, 23].

Compounding the enormity of this situation, in the last decade, child sexual abuse imagery (CSAI) has evolved to leverage online sharing platforms as a tool for distributing abusive videos and images. The children depicted are re-victimized every time the content is accessed. According to the Internet Watch Foundation, which reviews reports of CSAI in the United Kingdom, 53% of CSAI images depict the abuse of children under the age of ten and 28% of CSAI images involve rape and sexual torture [20]. (p. 1)

The National Center for Missing and Exploited Children (NCMEC) operates a Cybertip line that gathers statistics on detected CSAMs. Their statistics demonstrate that the threat posed by CSAM crimes is growing at a very dangerous rate. As of February, 2024, the NCMEC reports:

Just 5 years ago, in 2018, NCMEC received 18.4 million CyberTipline reports containing 45 million images, videos and other content. Just four years later in 2022, NCMEC received over 32 million reports and more than 88 million pieces of content. Last year, NCMEC received more than 36 million reports containing more than 105 million pieces of content. Since its inception over 25 years ago, the CyberTipline has received more than 186.2 million reports containing more than 530.8 million images, videos, and other content relating to child sexual exploitation. Currently, NCMEC receives on average more than 99,000 CyberTipline reports every day.3 (NCMEC, 2024)

In 2013, 500,000 CyberTipline reports were received by NCMEC. In 2024, it was 29.2 million:

2013	500,000
2014	1,106,072
2015	4,403,657
2016	8,297,923
2017	10,214,753
2018	18,462,424
2019	16,987,361
2020	21,751,085
2021	36,210,368
2022	32,059,029
2023	29,397,681
2024	29,200,000

Sources: National Center for Missing and Exploited Children. CyberTipline Reports of 2023 and 2024. See: <https://www.missingkids.org/gethelpnow/cybertipline/cybertiplinedata>

These are only the cases that get reported. The DoJ report (2023c) states:

The prevalence of virtual child sex trafficking is unknown, due in part, to the difficulties in detecting this type of conduct. (P. 86)

Europol's 2024 report explains the dangerous growth in prevalence of these crimes:

Child sexual abuse material (CSAM) keeps proliferating online, continuously victimising the children it depicts and strongly impacting the work of LEAs. With a rising volume of files to manually analyse and the related case information, LEAs find themselves needing innovative technological support to investigate online CSAM.

The Internet Watch Foundation (IWF), based in the United Kingdom, has also seen sharp increases in distribution of CSAMs. The IWF tracks detected web addresses (URLs) internationally containing CSAMs. In 2014, it detected 31,266 URLs. In 2021, it detected 252,194 URLs. In 2023, it detected 275,652 URLs. (Internet Watch Foundation, 2021, 2024).

A 2015 report titled: *The TOR Dark Net* published by the Global Commission in Internet Governance (Owen & Savage, 2015) explains the degree to which Dark Net traffic is composed of requests to abuse sites:

...the Dark Net's content is diverse, with the largest number of sites being represented in the drugs category, but only by a small margin. When each category is plotted against the percentage of HS [hidden services] directory requests it received... an entirely different picture emerges... Requests to abuse sites represented more than 80 percent of total requests observed, although they accounted for only two percent of the total HSEs available. (Owen & Savage, 2015, p. 6)

#### **D. Revenue from CSAMs**

In recent years, CSAM has become big business, including the exchange of large sums of money, bitcoin and other cryptocurrency. In August, 2025, the European Commission of the European Union addressed the monetization of child abuse on their website:

Child sexual abuse offenders have become increasingly sophisticated in their use of technology. For instance, by using social media with end-to-end encryption, the abusers share and trade images and videos with impunity. There are often closed groups on social media that require an 'entrance fee' in exchange for (new, unseen) child sexual abuse material.

Viewing child sexual abuse material (CSAM) is therefore not just a passive crime; it actively fuels the demand for more content to be produced. Each time material is consumed, it encourages perpetrators to exploit children, further promoting the cycle of abuse and victimisation. Research also shows that almost half of those that view CSAM seek contact with children to abuse them.

Technological development has also fuelled demand for child sexual abuse material by enabling the monetization of abuse. Abusers can with one click, pay to watch live streaming of child sexual abuse and access dedicated platforms on the dark web. Technology has contributed to the increase of digital crimes such as sextortion, combining "sex" and "extortion," whereby criminals threaten to expose explicit images or videos of victims, often children, unless paid.

The University of Nottingham Rights Lab Report (2023) investigated the financial transactions used in the online sexual exploitation of children, and found that:

... in the past decade, law enforcement agencies have noticed an upsurge of exploitative activities with a commercial scope. Generally, the offender pays through a money transfer agency to the trafficker who has access to exploited children in order to generate child sexual exploitation material (CSEM). This material is then transmitted from live streaming video communications platforms. These activities are classified as trafficking in persons according to the Palermo Protocol (Int. Justice Commission, 2020, p. 16) (p.1)

In 2006, the revenue estimates for CSAMs were in the billions of dollars:

Child pornography revenue estimates now surpass \$3 billion annually from the Internet alone, 34 [reference: Luders, 2007] (Mains, 2010, p. 814)

Luders, W. (2007) Child Pornography Web Sites: Techniques Used to Evade Law Enforcement, 26 FBI L. Enforcement Bulletin 7, at 17; Stacia Glenn, Child Porn Thriving on Web, San Bernadino County Sun (Cal.), Nov. 5, 2006 (reports "[c]hild pornography is now a multi-billion-dollar commercial enterprise")

Now, almost 20 years later, it is horrifying to consider the economics of this form of abuse.

## **II. Exponential Increases in Production and Distribution of Live-stream and On-Demand CSAM**

### **A. What is Live-Stream On-Demand CSAM/Live Distant Child Abuse?**

In on-demand, live-stream, CSAM, “customers,” aka “demand-side offenders,” direct the real-time abuse of the child/children by the “hands-on” offender. The demand-side customer issues explicit and detailed abuse commands, on a pay-per-view basis. This form of abuse is also known as live-distant child abuse (LDCA) and live-streaming child sexual exploitation (LCSE).

The University of Nottingham Rights Lab Report (2023) describes LDCA as follows:

Live streamed sexual exploitation of children is different from other forms of CSAM shared on the internet due to its ‘real-time’ element (Açar, 2017; Europol, 2019). This means that the abuser can request the child to be sexually abused either before or during the live streaming session, and the child is subjected to the abuse while the live stream is happening (ECPAT International, 2017). This is in contrast to other types of CSAM which are typically pre-recorded and released or shared after the abuse has already occurred (Açar, 2017). The immediacy of the live stream means that the abuser can gain gratification from the real-time reaction of the child, and the abuser can also receive instructions from other viewers who can also gain gratification from the abuse. (P. 17)

...

Recent studies have revealed a significant rise in the demand for live online child sexual exploitation over the past few years, with a notable surge occurring in the wake of the Covid-19 crisis. According to Europol, the Philippines was one of the nations to experience a particularly severe rise in live online child sexual exploitation cases during the pandemic, due to the combined effect of the lockdown on already impoverished families, whose limited sources of income were further reduced, and the absence of children from school (Europol, 2020) (p. 20)

Europol’s 2024 report, *Internet Organised Crime Threat Assessment*, similarly describes LDCA:

Live-distant child abuse (LDCA) is a persistent threat, where offenders watch child sexual abuse on demand with the support of one or more facilitators who perpetrate the

abuse on the victim(s) in exchange\* for payment. It stands out as the main form of commercial sexual exploitation of children and as a major source of unknown\*\* CSAM using capping, which entails covertly recording the victim (i.e. in a video call/live-streaming session).

Victims describe LDCA on-demand offenders as directing contact-perpetrators to perform specified acts of abuse in exchange for payment for each abusive act and that the more brutal and harmful the act, the greater the cost, up to murder of the victim.

## **B. Problems Posed by Live Distant Child Abuse for Law Enforcement**

Live-distant child abuse (LDCA) poses extreme problems for law enforcement.

The International Justice Mission Report (2020b) describes these problems as follows:

Livestreaming and creating CSEM on-demand allow the remote OSEC [online sexual exploitation of children] customer to take an active role in creating the visual display of child sexual abuse and exploitation by directing the actions of the trafficker and exploited children. Major ESPs [electronic service providers] with livestreaming functionality typically do not monitor such data streams for possible CSEM. Because the livestream does not, by nature, result in a stored image or video file – the most commonly detected indicators of ICAC offenses – detection methods in common use do not typically recognize livestreaming OSEC. This results in the majority of instances remaining unreported. The evidence that does exist is often spread across different platforms including social media apps, MTAs, and computers/mobile devices, making it difficult for ESPs, law enforcement, and others to identify when this crime occurs. (p. 16)

The DoJ Report (2023c) also addresses the difficulty in detecting LDCA:

Two primary challenges exist related to the reporting of livestreaming and virtual child sex trafficking. The first is detecting LCSE, because livestreamed content is often unmonitored by internet service providers. [243] The use of children is frequently cloaked or embedded within internet sites that offer virtual livestreamed adult sex. Thus, looking at transactional information or even the initial advertisement webpage does not reveal that children are involved. Unlike traditional CSAM investigations that involve images, many instances of LCSE and virtual child sex trafficking go undetected by internet platforms and other online providers, even after the event, because the abuse is livestreamed and there is typically no captured content. Even if providers or other users are aware and want to report the abuse to law enforcement, the lack of preserved digital evidence hinders or prevents investigations, including victim identification. (P. 87)

The University of Nottingham report (2023) further explains:

The ability to live stream and create content on demand has enabled remote customers of OSEC to take an active role in directing the actions of traffickers and children. However, most Electronic Service Providers (ESPs) with the ability to provide live streaming services do not supervise these data flows to detect CSEM. This is because live streams typically do not generate stored images or videos, which are the typical indicators of these offenses. Established detection methods for CSEM are therefore unable to detect them (IJM, 2020, p. 16). Identifying occurrences of OSEC is further complicated for ESPs, law enforcement, and other interested parties because evidence of the crime is often found across multiple platforms, including social media applications, messaging transfer agents, and computers/mobile devices (ibid)

...

Unlike with other forms of digital media, this type of streaming does not leave any trace on the electronic device, as no files are downloaded and stored onto its hard disk (ECPAT France, 2022, p. 9). As soon as the streaming is stopped, the material is gone, making it only available one time and leaving no trace unless it is deliberately recorded (ibid). (p. 17)

### **III. Perpetrators' Startling Technological Advantage in Concealing Dark Web Distribution of CSAMs, Far Exceeding the Investigative Capacities of Law Enforcement**

Advances in technology have an ever-expanding role in the nature and prevalence of child abuse.

Child abusers and traffickers can easily view and film their abuse of children, even with a smart phone. Similarly victims can be easily accessed, monitored, groomed, abused, threatened, extorted, stalked and surveilled, on their electronic devices. This extends to abuse of very young children on gaming platforms. Abusers and traffickers easily acquire the technological savvy to:

1. distribute CSAM, non-sexual torture, snuff film, etc., on the dark web, including use of Tor-browser anonymity and encryption, to circumvent detection by law enforcement,
2. use crypto-currency to exchange money for CSAMs,
3. threaten, extort, abuse children, and coerce children to harm other children, pets and themselves, sometimes unbeknownst to protective parents, by sending disappearing messages and video and by hacking into victims' electronic devices, ipads, phones, etc.

In the modern technological age, law enforcement has abundant evidence that the child sexual abuse materials (CSAMs) industry outpaces the investigative efforts of law enforcement in terms of technology used to conceal their crimes. (See: New York Times series, *Exploited*, Keller & Dance (2019); Europol (2021); Internet Watch Foundation (2023), Salter & Woodlock (2022)).

## A. How Offenders Use Advanced Technology to Evade Law Enforcement

The 2023 DoJ (2023c) report goes into great length as it describes how CSAM offenders use advanced technology to evade law enforcement.

For law enforcement, technology, of course, is a double-edged sword, which creates both challenges and opportunities as a tool to combat child exploitation. In the arena of digital forensics, the development of protocols and tools for digital analysis in child exploitation cases is complicated by the ever-changing variety of platforms used to commit offenses, the sheer volume of data to analyze, and the cost, time, and expertise involved in development.

Given a variety of technological changes on several fronts, a perfect storm is brewing that sharply curtails law enforcement's ability to detect and investigate technology-facilitated child sexual exploitation offenses. (DoJ, 2023c, p. 122)

The DoJ report (2023c) describes the following technologies that perpetrators use to conceal their crimes and evade detection, identification, arrest and prosecution (p. 126):

<b>The Dark Web (or Dark Net):</b>	The Dark Web is a layer of the internet that can only be accessed through special software, such as anonymous browser networks like Tor, which shields users' identities and locations. Most of the Dark Web's content is hosted anonymously.
<b>TOR:</b>	The Onion Router (now known by its acronym Tor) is a free software that encrypts and anonymizes a user's internet activity by sending internet traffic across numerous servers to shield the user's true location. It was created as part of a federal government research project – and is still largely funded by federal agencies – but now is an open-source software available for any user.
<b>Virtual Private Network (VPN):</b>	A virtual private network encrypts the connection between a device and the internet to protect sensitive data being transmitted over the network. It works by masking a user's IP [internet protocol] address, preventing unauthorized people from eavesdropping on a user's internet traffic. This technology is used widely in corporate settings to enable secure remote work by an organization's employees.
<b>Peer-to-Peer (P2P) File Sharing Network:</b>	A peer-to-peer file sharing network acts as a decentralized repository of content, where a community of users can upload and download digital files, such as videos, software, or images.
<b>Encryption:</b>	Encryption is a technology that protects information by converting it into unreadable code that cannot be deciphered easily by unauthorized people.
<b>Full Disk Encryption:</b>	Full disk encryption uses disk encryption software or hardware to encrypt every bit of data, including all files and programs, that goes on a disk, device, or hard drive.

<b>End-to-End Encryption:</b>	End-to-End encryption is a method of secure communication that only allows the users communicating with one another to read and view the content and prevents third parties from accessing any of the data.
-------------------------------	---

The DoJ (2023c) report explains that perpetrators of CSAMs have an increased capacity to conceal their identities and locations due to advances in anonymizing technology:

Anonymizing technology comes in many forms, but the core feature is that it is designed to conceal information about a user’s identity and physical location. Law enforcement can watch crimes occur in real time in anonymous spaces but have no ability to identify the location of the sites or find and apprehend the offenders who access them. (P. 124)

In particular, the Dark Web is designed for anonymity. The Dark Web’s name for websites is “hidden services.” The DoJ (2023c) report states:

Society has effectively created a lawless environment where a vast amount of criminal activity occurs and is tolerated under the banner of digital privacy. Although the design of the Dark Web makes it difficult to comprehensively document the staggering scope and breadth of crime occurring, some estimates indicate that 57% of the websites on the Dark Web are designed to facilitate illicit activity, with new sites being continually added.

The Dark Web has given offenders easier, more secure access to vulnerable children and allowed people who share a sexual interest in children to build global networks and communities to discuss their predilections, share CSAM, and hone techniques to avoid law enforcement detection.

...

While the Department of Justice has made significant success in taking on criminals utilizing the Dark Web, there is no question that such investigations are slow, inefficient, and resource intensive. (DoJ, 2023c, p. 125)

The 2023 Department of Justice Report (2023c) lists the following the recent technological advances that enable CSAM offenders to evade law enforcement (See DoJ 2023c, p. 125-130):

1. Virtual Private Networks (VPN). VPNs are increasingly pervasive and accessible. They mask the IP addresses of users. The VPN may not even retain the real location of its users.
2. Smart phones. Smart phones are devices that are fully encrypted and often warrant-proof. They are readily accessible to children. Multiple apps may be used, with unique data formats and data retention policies. International apps thwart law enforcement’s capacity to investigate across jurisdictions.
3. ProtonMail. Protonmail is a highly encrypted email provider that stores all its data in

Switzerland. It has engineered its service in such a way that it cannot scan the content of users' messages. This makes it near impossible for law enforcement to issue a warrant. Per the 2023 DoJ report, as previously advertised on its website:

*As ProtonMail is outside of US and EU jurisdiction, only a court order from the Cantonal Court of Geneva or the Swiss Federal Supreme Court can compel us to release the extremely limited user information we have. (DoJ, 2023c, p. 128)*

4. Encrypted cloud-based mobile and desktop messaging apps. Such apps “frustrate government’s lawful access to information by designing themselves to essentially be sovereignless - meaning they are beyond the reach of legal requests for information from any country.” (DoJ, 2023c, P. 128)

5. “Bulletproof hosting” websites. Offenders use such websites to share files and images with one another:

Bulletproof hosting sites operate in largely the same way that other web-based file sharing platforms do, but take a much more lenient, “don’t ask, don’t tell” stance concerning what kind of content can be hosted on their platform. They also ignore requests or fail to remove illicit content from their sites. (DoJ, 2023c, p. 128)

6. Multiple platforms. Offenders “identify and groom children on one platform, and then convince them to switch to a different platform that offers less protection for children.” “For law enforcement, the digital trail can go cold,” and “lead to duplication of effort” across agencies (DoJ, 2023c, p. 129).

7. Use of cryptocurrencies to buy and sell CSAMs. For a recent report on how cryptocurrencies enable offenders to trade in CSAMs, see: Greenberg (2024): Child Abusers Are Getting Better at Using Crypto to Cover Their Tracks: <https://www.wired.com/story/csam-sellers-monero-rise/>

The DoJ (2023c) report explains the highly dangerous impact of encryption, and particularly end-to-end encryption:

This impact is felt throughout the case, from identification and investigation, to charging, plea negotiations, sentencing, and restitution. Most significantly, victim identification and rescue are rendered impossible even if it is known that images or videos that could lead to that rescue reside on the device. Over the last five years, full disk encryption has become the default model of many digital devices, particularly smartphones and tablets, requiring no action by the user to obtain that warrant-proof technology. Complicating the issue is the existence of multiple types of full disk encryption, each requiring a different investigative method and/or forensic approach, and even different types of legal process. Often one case can involve multiple forms of encryption, which strains or exceeds the capacity of law enforcement’s already limited forensic resources.

...

Many technology companies have adopted, or are adopting, end-to-end encryption (E2EE), which secures online data but also has potentially dire consequences. E2EE prevents companies or any third-party, such as law enforcement agencies with appropriate warrants or court orders, from detecting or gathering information about the activity of people who use the internet to exploit children and share CSAM. (P. 123)

## **B. Meta Defies Law Enforcement Warnings Not to Implement End-to-End Encryption**

In describing the danger to children posed by end-to-end encryption, the DoJ (2023c) explains:

Nothing demonstrates the impact of the spread of E2EE more dramatically than data about the impact of Meta’s planned adoption of E2EE on its Messenger platform. Meta (formerly The Facebook Company) is the undisputed global leader when it comes to voluntary efforts to detect CSAM on its platforms. In 2019 and 2020, Meta-owned platforms, including Facebook, Instagram, and WhatsApp, accounted for approximately 94% of all CyberTips sent in by industry each year. However, The National Center for Missing & Exploited Children (NCMEC) estimates that approximately 12 million CyberTips will be lost to the implementation of E2EE on Facebook’s Messenger platform. Meta promises that it is developing alternative tools to detect CSAM even with E2EE, but thus far has provided no information to confirm the viability or accuracy of this claim. <https://about.fb.com/news/2021/10/facebook-company-is-now-meta/> (Pp. 123-124)

The DoJ (2023c) report further states:

In this regard, E2EE poses the gravest threat to children, particularly on platforms where children are allowed to use or even encouraged to use such apps alongside adults. In these unsafe online spaces, children are easy prey for predators because voluntary detection and interdiction is impossible. E2EE blinds us all, at the expense of children. (P. 124)

The DoJ describes the dire consequences of the implementation of end-to-end encryption:

The deluge of actionable CyberTips could disappear tomorrow if more and more providers implement E2EE, blinding providers to additional parts of the digital world. While the tips would decrease, the exploitation of children would undoubtedly continue – unabated and undetected. (P. 131)

On February 5, 2020, FBI Director Christopher Wray testified to the Judiciary Committee of the U.S. House of Representatives about Meta’s plans to enable E2EE encryption on its Messenger platform: “If Facebook moves forward with the plans that they have at the moment, we will be blinded. They will blind themselves and law enforcement.” (DoJ, 2023c, p. 124)

Despite the objections and warnings of 15 law enforcement agencies globally, including the FBI and Homeland Security, in December, 2023, Meta began rolling out E2EE to its billion users.

Dec 2023: Meta defies FBI opposition to encryption, brings E2EE to Facebook, Messenger  
<https://arstechnica.com/tech-policy/2023/12/meta-defies-fbi-opposition-to-encryption-brings-e2ee-to-facebook-messenger/>

Default E2EE rolling out now but will take months to reach all 1 billion users. Jon Brodtkin Dec 7, 2023 9:06 AM

Meta has started enabling end-to-end encryption (E2EE) by default for chats and calls on Messenger and Facebook despite protests from the FBI and other law enforcement agencies that oppose the widespread use of encryption technology. "Today I'm delighted to announce that we are rolling out default end-to-end encryption for personal messages and calls on Messenger and Facebook," Meta VP of Messenger Loredana Crisan wrote yesterday.

In April, a consortium of 15 law enforcement agencies from around the world, including the FBI and ICE Homeland Security Investigations, urged Meta to cancel its plan to expand the use of end-to-end encryption. The consortium complained that terrorists, sex traffickers, child abusers, and other criminals will use encrypted messages to evade law enforcement.

Meta held firm, telling Ars in April that "we don't think people want us reading their private messages" and that the plan to make end-to-end encryption the default in Facebook Messenger would be completed before the end of 2023. Meta also plans default end-to-end encryption for Instagram messages but has previously said that may not happen this year.

I believe it is reasonable to speculate that the recent implementation of end-to-end encryption accounts, at least in part, for the drop in reports to NCMEC's cybertip line in 2022 and 2024.

According to a report by the California Learning Resource Network (November 27, 2024):

According to a report by the International Telecommunication Union (ITU), 25% of internet traffic is dedicated to adult content, including pornography.  
<https://www.clnr.org/what-percentage-of-internet-traffic-is-porn/>

According to a December 2024 article in the Harvard Review (Solis, 2024) on the human trafficking crisis in the United States, the pornography industry in the United States generates approximately US\$12-14 billion in annual revenue.

Through pornography, the entertainment industry plays a significant role in normalizing sexual exploitation and fueling human trafficking. Pornography often depicts unrealistic and aggressive sexual behaviors, shaping viewers' perceptions and attitudes towards sex and relationships. A significant portion of mainstream porn includes sexual violence or aggression, desensitizing individuals to exploitation and perpetuating the demand for such content.

Currently, the pornography industry in the United States generates approximately US\$12-14 billion in annual revenue. Traffickers often use force or fraud to coerce individuals to perform in pornographic content. This content is then distributed widely on online platforms, perpetuating the profit incentive for traffickers. In the United States, pornography is one of the most common forms of trafficking reported to the National Human Trafficking Hotline. The case against Pornhub in 2020—in which 40 victims sued

for the distribution and monetization of non-consensual sexual content—highlights the severity of the issue.

Given the clear objections and warnings by 15 law enforcement agencies to Meta about the grave threat to children posed by implementation of E2EE on its platforms, it is reasonable to question whether the tech giant Meta chose to implement E2EE to increase the privacy of consumers of “adult content” (which includes pornography depicting adults) in order to, in great part, maintain and build their billion-dollar profits from this customer base, at the expense of allowing E2EE to make the distribution of online CSAM dangerously more undetectable.

Many internet search engines and large internet sites are complicit in the capacity for offenders to access child abuse materials. See:

Keller & Dance (2019). Exploited Series. The New York Times

Kristof, N. (May 10, 2025). These Internal Documents Show Why We Shouldn’t Trust Porn Companies. The New York Times.

This article explains the complicity of Pornhub in the distribution of CSAMs, as evidenced in thousands of pages of internal documents from Pornhub that were meant to be sealed, that were released due to a filing error in a Federal District Court in Alabama. Link: <https://www.nytimes.com/2025/05/10/opinion/pornhub-children-documents.html>

### **C. Internal Challenges for Law Enforcement in Investigation of CSAMs**

Law enforcement also faces many internal challenges to investigation of CSAM, including:

1. Investigation of CSAMs is very expensive.
2. The United States government gravely under-funds law enforcement investigation of CSAM (Keller & Dance, 2019). Law enforcement is under-funded and under-staffed.
3. Investigation into CSAM cases requires forms of expertise, often by multiple specialists. “The need for trained specialized computer examiners who are familiar with child exploitation offenders has never been greater.” (DoJ, 2023c, P. 137-138)
4. Forensic “Tools can quickly become outdated with updates and changes from device makers like Apple and Google.” (DoJ, 2023c, P. 132-133)
5. Law enforcement is lacking in computer forensic and digital investigations resources.
6. “Current methods of detecting livestreaming of sexual activity requires a large amount of human capital, and there remains no automated method to identify newly produced material.” (DoJ, 2023c, P. 139)

7. Determining the proper jurisdiction for a case, and coordination of investigation across jurisdictions, are laborious and complex: “jurisdiction for child sex offenders nearly always exists across various federal, state, and local law enforcement entities” (DoJ, 2023c, P. 141).

8. CSAM cases require extensive cooperation between agencies, such as local and state law enforcement agencies, the Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI), Department of Homeland Security (DHS), and NCMC and its Child Victim Identification Program (CVIP).

9. Prosecutors also require specialized training in all of these areas.

#### **D. Efforts to Counter Online Sexual Exploitation and Abuse**

The 2023 DoJ report (2023c, p. 143 -145) describes recent efforts to fight CSAM crimes:

1. The launching of *The Voluntary Principles to Counter Online Child Sexual Exploitation and Abuse* on March 5, 2020. The *Voluntary Principles* “provide a common and consistent framework to guide the digital industry in its efforts to combat the proliferation of online child exploitation.” This was a joint effort of the United States Departments of Justice and Homeland Security, and ministerial counterparts in Australia, Canada, New Zealand, and the United Kingdom, in consultation with representatives from Facebook, Google, Microsoft, Snap, Twitter, and Roblox, and experts from industry, civil society, and academia.

A copy of the principles is available here: <https://www.justice.gov/opa/press-release/file/1256061/download>

In 2020, WeProtect Global Alliance, which currently comprises 97 governments, 25 technology companies and 30 civil society organizations, committed to adopting and promoting these principles at a global level to drive collective industry action.

“In furtherance of this effort, members of the Tech Coalition published transparency reports in 2021.” See: <https://www.technologycoalition.org/annual-report>

2. The advent of PhotoDNA. The “widespread voluntary use of PhotoDNA has revealed a high volume of CSAM on even large, well-known sites like Facebook, Google, Microsoft, Twitter, and Snapchat. This data is captured in NCMC CyberTips.”

See: <https://www.microsoft.com/en-us/photodna?oneroute=true>

3. Project Arachnid. “Project Arachnid combines PhotoDNA and web-crawling technology to supplement Industry’s voluntary efforts by combing all parts of the web.

See: [https://content.c3p.ca/pdfs/C3P\\_ProjectArachnidReport\\_en.pdf](https://content.c3p.ca/pdfs/C3P_ProjectArachnidReport_en.pdf)

However, according the 2023 DoJ report, there is still a need for “a hashing standard like PhotoDNA that worked for videos,” and a need for “robust efforts by private industry and civil society to support web-crawling efforts like Project Arachnid.”

Note: The 2023 DoJ report was released before Meta adopted E2EE on its Messenger platforms.

I have no knowledge of the effects of the above three efforts to combat CSAM crime.

### **E. Failure by the Government and Technology Industry to Prioritize Safety of Children**

The offenders' technological advantages, governmental under-resourcing of law enforcement, and the failures of the technology industry to prioritize the safety of children, combine to create a very dangerous world for children.

Michael Salter, Ph.D., and Elly Hanson, Ph.D. (2021), an Australian criminologist and a British psychologist, respectively, wrote a chapter entitled, "I need you all to understand how pervasive this issue is" that "examines the phenomenon of internet users attempting to report and prevent online child sexual exploitation (CSE) and child sexual abuse material (CSAM) in the absence of adequate intervention by internet service providers, social media platforms, and government."

They summed up this issue well in 2021, before the crisis became even more dire, as follows:

While technology companies have been vocal in their commitment to child protection, the history of online CSE shows that industry has been largely unwilling to prioritize child safety over profits, a posture that has been accepted and, arguably, tacitly endorsed by governments. The authenticity of industry and government expressions of surprise at escalating reports of online CSE and CSAM is undermined by evidence that the use of the internet by pedophiles has been known at the highest levels since the early days of networked computing. In 1986, the US Attorney General noted that the trade in CSAM had shifted online: "recently a significant amount of the exchange has taken place by the use of computer networks through which users of child pornography let each other know about materials they desire or have available" (US Attorney General, 1986,p.407). Nonetheless, the approach of US legislators to internet regulation has been notoriously lax and oriented toward the growth and profitability of technology companies rather than child protection. (P. 73-731)

### **IV. Under-Representation of the Prevalence of Familial Sex Trafficking of Children**

In the past few decades, most reports and research on child sex trafficking have emphasized the exploitation of adolescents by predatory strangers, and have dangerously underestimated the prevalence of sex trafficking and CSAM production by family members and the prevalence of trafficking of pre-teens. This has contributed to a low rate of identification of this victim base.

Psychotherapists regularly bear witness to clients who report that their parents first sexually abused them at home, and then physically trafficked them to other hands-on offenders and/or filmed the sexual assault they inflicted to distribute CSAMs to other offenders, often beginning when they were very young. Many victims describe parents who were in financial straits, or who were able to buy a home, by supplementing their income through sex-trafficking their children.

A *Fact Sheet* published by the Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons, United States Department of State, on July 30, 2024, dispels many of the prevailing myths and misconceptions that under-represent the prevalence of familial child sex trafficking. The *Fact Sheet* is based on information provided by a number of kinds of experts, “particularly those with lived experience of human trafficking.” This is the same group of individuals who have always taught psychotherapists about the nature of child abuse. This kind of data is much richer than that which is generally reported to law enforcement reports, and is essential to understand the severity and scope of this problem. Some of the important findings in this *Fact Sheet* include that:

1. a large proportion of child trafficking is facilitated directly by family members and/or caregivers;
2. “the trafficker may begin grooming the victim at an early age”;
3. “In familial trafficking cases, the average age in which children are initially exploited in trafficking is four years old;” and,
4. “family members recruit children into trafficking due to generational exploitation, financial need, or the belief that they are contributing to the family.”

See: <https://www.state.gov/the-misconceptions-of-child-trafficking/>

A recent review of the literature on familial sex trafficking of minors in the United States, by Voller, Maass, Weinfurter, and Martin (2024), found that:

Recruitment by a family member was the most common recruitment strategy reported to the National Human Trafficking Hotline in cases of sex trafficking in the United States between 2020 and 2022 (Polaris, 2023a). This phenomenon, which is also known as familial sex trafficking, family-controlled sex trafficking, family-facilitated sex trafficking, or intrafamilial sex trafficking, occurs when a family member is the victim-survivor’s trafficker or sells the victim-survivor to a third party trafficker (United States Department of State, 2021).(p. 146).

It will also be recalled from above that the University of Nottingham Report (2023) found:

Research has revealed that the majority of OSEC [online sexual abuse of children] cases are usually family-oriented crimes, with the victim’s own biological parents or relatives being the perpetrators of the abuse (IJM, 2020, p. 51; Garcia & Manikan, 2014, p. 30; Terre des Hommes, 2013). In this form of abuse, mothers or other relatives take control of children and force them to do sexual activities that are recorded on camera (Dedase-Escoton, et al., 2020, p. 18). When parents are not directly involved, the abuse may be carried out by other people close to children, including family friends, neighbours, or other members of their local community (Terre des Hommes, 2013).

## A. Salter and Wong Literature Review on Familial Sex Trafficking (2024)

In 2024, Michael Salter and Tim Wong identified and reviewed 66 scholarly articles, papers, or books that referred to parental production of CSAM published since 1970. They found that, despite the substantial data, familial sex trafficking has been largely overlooked by the media, law enforcement, and even anti-trafficking organizations:

Despite the frequency, severity, and harms associated with parental CSAM production, it has been overlooked in policy and practice responses to online child sexual exploitation, which mirrors an overarching policy reluctance to specifically address family-based sexual abuse despite expanding attention to extrafamilial offenders (Salter, 2016, p. 1827)

...

the focus of child trafficking and sexual exploitation scholarship on “commercial” and profit-driven abuse has marginalized and obscured parental CSAM production as a serious policy challenge. These findings warrant a reorientation of research, policy, and practice approaches to technology-facilitated child sexual exploitation, as well as a reflection on the resistance of researchers and policymakers to acknowledging the problem of family-based sexual exploitation. (P. 1826)

Salter and Wong’s review of the literature found that:

parental CSAM production is common, more likely to involve pre-pubescent victims, more severe abuse, female as well as male perpetrators, and produces high-demand illegal content with serious long-term sequelae. (P. 1826)

...

Research with adult survivors of CSAM finds that parents and familial figures are frequently identified as CSAM producers (C3P [Canadian Centre for Child Protection], 2017; Gewirtz-Meydan, Walsh, Wolak, & Finkelhor, 2018), and research with law enforcement and welfare professionals has drawn similar conclusions (Gallagher, 2007; Sprang & Cole, 2018). The predominance of parental perpetrators is not a new phenomenon. CSAM content analysis finds that family and home environments have been the most common setting for CSAM production for the last 50 years (Salter and Whitten, 2022). With the advent of the internet, parentally produced content constitutes the most highly traded and in-demand CSAM online, with a distinct trend towards the more severe abuse of younger children (Salter and Whitten, 2022; Seto, Buckman, Dwyer, & Quayle, 2018). (p.1827)

In the last few years, I have noticed an up-tick in government reports, journal articles, etc., that are drawing attention to the prevalence of familial sex trafficking and familial CSAM production.

Current data suggests that most sex trafficking of children and CSAM production are perpetrated

by family members, usually parents, against very young children, and that the abuse is severe.

## **B. Canadian Centre for Child Protection 2016 Data on CSAM and 2017 Survivor Survey**

The Canadian Centre for Child Protection published an analysis of reports to their tipline in 2016 titled: *Child Sexual Abuse Images on the Internet: A Cybertip.ca Analysis* (C3P, 2016a) (discussed further in the next section). Within this analysis, they recorded information about the surroundings where 22,656 child abuse images and videos appeared to have been taken. Of these, 2,494 were indistinguishable. Of those with indicators of the setting, they found:

- 68.68% (13,848) of images and videos appeared to be in a home setting
  - 15.25% (3,074) of images and videos appeared to be in an outdoor setting
  - 10.81% (2,180) of images and videos appeared to be in a studio/manufactured setting
  - 5.26% (1,038) of images and videos had “other” selected as the surroundings
- (C3P, 2016a, p. 19)

The Canadian Centre for Child Protection (C3P) also conducted an online survey of victims of production of CSAM (2017a) and found a high prevalence of familial offenders:

A significant number of offenders were parents or extended family members - 50% of “single” offenders (n=26) were classified as either a parent or an extended family member (42% of “single” offenders were parents, of which 100% were male) — see Graph 15. 82% of the primary offenders involved in the “multiple offender” scenarios (n=83) were also parents or extended family members (67% were parents and were predominantly, but not exclusively, male) — see Graph 16. (C3P, 2017a, p. 17)

When C3P respondents reported they were abused by a single offenders, they identified:

- 23%: Biological father
- 23%: Acquaintance (of victim or victims’ family)
- 19%: Adoptive/step-father
- 19%: Position of trust (teacher, clergy, counselor, babysitter)
- 8%: Relative (e.g., either grandparent, uncle, aunt, cousin, sibling)
- 4%: Neighbor
- 4%: Stranger (No apparent connection to victim or victim’s family) (C3P, 2017a, p. 17)

When C3P respondents reported that they were abused by multiple offenders, they identified:

- 38%: Biological father
- 19%: Both parents (“a response was coded as “both parents” if the respondent identified the offender(s) as “parents” and it was not apparent by the response, or other information shared by the respondent in the survey which parent was most involved / responsible for the abuse.”)

15%: Relative (e.g., either grandparent, uncle, aunt, cousin, sibling)  
 7%: Biological mother.  
 6%: Family friend/acquaintance  
 5%: Position of trust (teacher, clergy, counselor, babysitter)  
 4%: Neighbor  
 2%: Adoptive/step-father  
 2%: Stranger (No apparent connection to victim or victim's family)  
 1%: Adoptive/step-mother  
 1%: Acquaintance of victim (C3P, 2017a, p. 17)

Thus, "82% of the primary offenders who abused the child along with others [i.e., in organized abuser networks] were a parent or part of the child's extended family." (C3P, 2017a, p. 17)

C3P also analyzed how offenders gained access to the victims and found:

Gaining access and time alone with the child was not difficult, given that 64% of respondents (n=99) lived with an offender [Graph 18] and that offender was typically a parent or extended family member. Nearly three quarters (74%) of the "secondary" offenders (i.e., other than the "single" or "primary" offender) gained access to the respondent (n=82) through a parent or extended family member [Graph 19]. When asked to describe how the offender was able to carry out the abuse, many respondents referred to their "single" or "primary" offender getting them alone or isolated, but equally as many simply referred to their relationship with the offender or their living arrangements (e.g. "He was my father. He always had access to me") [Graph 17]. (C3P, 2017a, p. 18)

CP3 found the following tactics of gaining access by the primary/single offender (N=100):

45%: Getting the victim alone  
 45%: No tactic mentioned (primarily parental/ familial control)  
 9%: Groomed parent/family  
 8%: Coercion (C3p, 2017a, P. 18)

Context in which the secondary offender gained access to the victim (N=82)

74%: Parent/Member of extended family arranged the abuse  
 18%: Organized network  
 7%: Unknown (C3p, 2017a, P. 18)

In addition, C3P found (2017a):

... it was determined that 51% of the respondents whose abuse was categorized as organized had mentioned an adult woman having been involved, most often, the child's own mother. (C3P, 2017a, p. 21)

Of the 38 respondents who disclosed having female offenders within their organized abuse, 71% identified their biological mothers and 11% identified a grandmother (C3P, 2017a, p. 21)

### **C. Pacheco, Buenaventura & Miles Study: Ten Male Familial Trafficking Survivors (2023)**

Pacheco, Buenaventura and Miles (2023) conducted an in-depth collaborative study with ten adult males whose abuse began as incest, and whose incest offenders then trafficked them to other hands-on offenders, including large-scale abuser networks: four within their state or province level, three to national networks, and three to international networks.

The ten survivors reported high levels of violence by non-familial offenders:

Participants reported consistently elevated levels of violence by non-familial abusers of any gender, whose demands included extreme forms of bondage, discipline, bestiality, cult-like rituals (Salter, 2012a,b; Sarson & Macdonald, 2008), dominance and submission, sadomasochism, and even homicide of other children. Seven of the 10 survivors reported witnessing the killing of another child by non-familial perpetrators during their trafficking; seven of them also reported being severely beaten by non-familial abusers to the point where they lost consciousness. (Pacheco et al, 2023, p. 14)

Pacheco et al. (2023) report that all ten respondents reported that their familial offenders victimized them with in the production of CSAMs:

All 10 survivors reported the widespread creation of CSAM by their familial abusers for eventual distribution among CSEA communities with non-familial perpetrators (Pacheco et al., p. 9)

The authors explain:

With the rise of the Internet, however, communities of child sex offenders moved their activities to online forums and the darknet, where they have proliferated ever since (NCMEC, 2021b; WeProtect Global Alliance, 2021). Members of these communities exchange CSAM to gain access to encrypted CSEA chat rooms. By creating and sharing new CSAM with members through peer-to-peer (P2P) networks, a familial or non-familial abuser can achieve a higher ranking within the online community, which gives the abuser access to CSAM depicting higher COPINE levels of abuse, such as live-streamed assault and torture filmed in a pay-for-play format (Child Rescue Coalition, 2021; ECPAT & INTERPOL, 2018; Quayle, 2008). (Pacheco et al., 2023, p. 9)

In my clinical experience, I have noticed a trend of familial offenders increasingly trafficking their children to other hands-on offenders, perhaps as it is so much easier in modern-day to locate other offenders on the internet.

Pacheco et al. also (2023) found a high incidence of female offenders, including mothers:

Unexpectedly, the presence of female perpetrators was nearly universal in this study, with 9 of the 10 participants reporting that women either trafficked or abused them sexually, and 6 participants reporting that their mothers were leading perpetrators. Pacheco, p. 16)

#### **D. Raphael's Depth Interviews of Four Victims Trafficked by their Parents**

In 2020, Jody Raphael presented her findings of in-depth interviews of four victims trafficked by their parents as children, in an article titled: *Parents as Pimps: Survivor Accounts of Trafficking of Children in the United States*. She also reviewed the research and 100 newspaper stories between 2012 and 2018 on familial sex trafficking. Raphael's findings include: (See: <https://digitalcommons.uri.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1137&context=dignity>:

1. a failure of the media, etc., in reporting on sex trafficking by parents and its prevalence;
2. many children trafficked by parents are first sold to other offenders at very young ages, including infancy;
3. these crimes include extreme violence and terrorization, including near-death torture, coercion of children to harm other victims, and threats of murder;
4. some family trafficking victims report having witnessed murder of co-victims; and
5. familial traffickers are often involved in organized crime sex trafficking networks, with multiple perpetrators and multiple victims at abuse sites.

Raphael makes a case that the prevalence of pornography in general (adult materials) in the modern world is a factor in today's increased sexual exploitation of children.

#### **E. White, Robichaux, Huang & Leo Chart Review: Familial Sex Trafficking Victims (2024)**

White, Robichaux, Huang, and Luo (2024) reviewed the charts of 39 patients identified as survivors of familial trafficking in a large hospital system, in their paper, *When families become perpetrators: A case series on familial trafficking*. They found:

“Parents were the most common perpetrator (66.7%) followed by aunt/uncle (12.8%).”

“Force was the most common means of control used and often manifested as physical or sexual abuse that preceded the exploitation.”

White et al. (2024) also found:

Regarding prevalence, the percentage of reported familial trafficking cases ranges from 3–44% (Raphael, 2019). Often, reports and studies do not identify traffickers by type (i.e., family, intimate partner, employer, etc.) and/or do not include “familial” as a type of trafficking experienced (Raphael, 2019). According to a retrospective case review from

four social service agencies in Florida, the age at which a child first experienced exploitation was connected to who the perpetrator was (Reid et al., 2015). Children exploited by family members were noted to be as young as 4 years old, whereas children exploited by non-family members were as young as 11 years old.

## **F. Impact of Technology and High Financial Incentives on Familial Child Sex Trafficking**

Advances in computer and cell phone technology, the increased privacy protections in recent years, and the financial incentive to traffic children and sell CSAMs with crypto-currency are likely contributing to a higher prevalence of CSAM distribution by family offenders.

These technological advances should alert law enforcement, child protection, anti-trafficking organizations, psychotherapists and medical personnel, etc., to the high likelihood that familial abusers, who may have committed solitary hands-on sexual abuse against their children (contact offenders) in past decades, will now also traffic their children to other offenders in the forms of:

1. direct hands-on trafficking of their children to other offenders, and
2. distributing recorded, live-stream, on-demand CSAMs as they abuse their children.

A frightening consideration: When parents cross the line into sexual abuse of their own children, what is the disincentive to making money by CSAM and trafficking them to other offenders?

Raphael (2020) provides one example of the financial incentive:

Money can be quickly obtained in the sex trade industry because of demand from buyers and the ease of attracting them through the Internet. And the money isn't insubstantial. "Come sleep with daddy's little girl," the ad on Craigslist advertised in the Casual Encounters Section. The father wanted \$1,000 for a two-hour encounter.

In support of this concern, White et al. (2024) write:

Zimmerman and colleagues (Zimmerman et al., 2008) used post-trafficking survey data from several European countries and found that over 50% of the trafficked women in the sample had experienced physical or sexual abuse (often by father or stepfather), prior to being trafficked. Troubled family life not only increases risk for trafficking by others (Honor et al., 2020), but can also lead to family members trafficking each other (Greenbaum, 2020).

Other recent scholarly works that address familial sex trafficking and CSAM production include:

Allert, J.L. (2022). Domestic Minor Familial Sex Trafficking A National Study of Prevalence, Characteristics, and Challenges across the Justice Process. Institute for Shelter Care. Full-text: <https://humantraffickingsearch.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/07/Familial-Trafficking-Study-FINAL.pdf>

Brannock, M. K., Quesenberry, D. L., Smith, M. G., & Blackwell, R. L. (2024). Familial sex trafficking in the United States: A scoping review guided by the Three Ps Framework to end human trafficking. *Child abuse & neglect*, 158, 107143. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chiabu.2024.107143> Request pdf from: [brannockm@etsu.edu](mailto:brannockm@etsu.edu) [https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S0145213424005337?dgcid=raven\\_sd\\_via\\_email](https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S0145213424005337?dgcid=raven_sd_via_email)

Edwards, E.E., Middleton, J., & Cole, J. (2022). Family-Controlled Trafficking in the United States: Victim Characteristics, System Response, and Case Outcomes. *Journal of Human Trafficking*, 10, 411 - 429. Requested pdf from: [emily.edwards@louisville.edu](mailto:emily.edwards@louisville.edu)

The International Organization for Migration (IOM), Part of the United Nations System. “Family members are involved in nearly half of child trafficking cases.” Web article: Access this link: <https://www.ctdatacollaborative.org/> [https://www.iom.int/sites/g/files/tmzbd1486/files/our\\_work/DMM/MAD/Counter-trafficking%20Data%20Brief%20081217.pdf](https://www.iom.int/sites/g/files/tmzbd1486/files/our_work/DMM/MAD/Counter-trafficking%20Data%20Brief%20081217.pdf)

Marsh, E. International Association of Chiefs of Police (IACP) (2024). No One Can Hurt You Like Family: What We Know About Familial Trafficking Identification and Response. Dispatch 17(1). Webpage: [https://cops.usdoj.gov/html/dispatch/01-2024/familial\\_trafficking.html](https://cops.usdoj.gov/html/dispatch/01-2024/familial_trafficking.html)

OUR Rescue (2024). When Trafficking is a Family Business (2024). Internet article: <https://ourrescue.org/education/education/when-trafficking-is-a-family-business>

Sprang, G., & Cole, J. (2018). Familial Sex Trafficking of Minors: Trafficking Conditions, Clinical Presentation, and System Involvement. *Journal of Family Violence*, 33, 185-195. Full text: <https://niwaplibrary.wcl.american.edu/wp-content/uploads/Familial-Sex-Trafficking-of-Minors-Sprang-Cole-2018.pdf>

## **V. Increasingly Brutal, Sadistic, and Torture-level Abuse Against Children and a Trend Toward Victimization of Younger Children, Including Infants and Toddlers**

Interpol, Europol, the U.S. Department of Justice (2023c), the National Center for Missing and Exploited Children (Seto, Buckman, Dwyer, & Quayle, 2018), The Internet Watch Foundation, and others document that sexual assault in CSAMs has become increasingly sadistic over time, “including CSAM with infants and non-verbal children and demeaning material depicting torture and severe cruelty against children” (Europol, 2020). The abuse includes mutilation and murder.

### **A. Rating Systems for Severity of CSAM Abuse**

A number of important rating scales for severity of CSAM have been developed in recent years.

#### **1. The COPINE project (Combating Paedophile information networks in Europe)**

The COPINE project (Combating Paedophile information networks in Europe) at the University of Cork developed a 10-level COPINE Scale to categorise child abuse images (Quale, 2008).

Level 1: Indicative	Non-erotic and non-sexualised pictures showing children in their underwear, swimming costumes etc. from either commercial sources or family albums. Pictures of children playing in normal settings, in which the context or organisation of pictures by the collector indicates inappropriateness.
---------------------	---

Level 2: Nudist	Pictures of naked or semi-naked children in appropriate nudist settings, and from legitimate sources.
Level 3: Erotica	Surreptitiously taken photographs of children in play areas or other safe environments showing either underwear or varying degrees of nakedness.
Level 4: Posing	Deliberately posed pictures of children fully clothed, partially clothed or naked (where the amount, context and organisation suggests sexual interest).
Level 5: Erotic Posing	Deliberately posed pictures of fully, partially clothed or naked children in sexualised or provocative poses.
Level 6: Explicit Erotic Posing	Pictures emphasising genital areas, where the child is either naked, partially clothed or fully clothed.
Level 7: Explicit Sexual Activity	Pictures that depict touching, mutual and self-masturbation, oral sex and intercourse by a child, not involving an adult.
Level 8: Assault	Pictures of children being subject to a sexual assault, involving digital touching, involving an adult.
Level 9: Gross Assault	Grossly obscene pictures of sexual assault, involving penetrative sex, masturbation or oral sex, involving an adult.
Level 10: Sadistic/Bestiality	a. Pictures showing a child being tied, bound, beaten, whipped or otherwise subject to something that implies pain. b. Pictures where an animal is involved in some form of sexual behaviour with a child.

**2. Internet Watch Foundation**

The Internet Watch Foundation (IWF, 2016) developed rating system of severity of CSAM abuse implemented in 2014, including a category to identify imagery of “rape and sexual torture”:

We assess child sexual abuse images and videos based on UK law, according to the levels in the Sentencing Council’s Sexual Offences Definitive Guidelines. Since April 2014, there have been three levels: A, B and C (p. 52).

Category A	Images involving penetrative sexual activity; images involving sexual activity with an animal or sadism. We describe this category as “rape and sexual torture”.
Category B	Images involving non-penetrative sexual activity
Category C	Other indecent images not falling within category A or B

**3. Canadian Centre for Child Protection (C3P)**

The Canadian Centre for Child Protection has developed a number of rating systems for severity of sexual abuse over the years. The following rating system: Severity of Child Sexual Abuse Scale is from: *Child Sexual Abuse Images on the Internet: A cybertip.ca Analysis* (C3P, 2016a):

Severity 1 (Sexual Posing)	Images or video of children posing nude or partially nude where their sexual organs are exposed.
Severity 2 (Extreme Sexual Posing)	Images or video of children where the primary focus is on their genitalia. Usually in a close-up, or where there is manipulation of the buttocks or legs to expose the anus or genitalia.
Severity 3 (Explicit Sexual Activity/Assaults)	Images or video of children in explicit sexual acts, ranging from self-masturbation to those sexual acts involving adults or other children
Severity 4 (Extreme Sexual Assaults)	Images or videos of children involved in extreme sexual acts that are at the worst end of the scale such as acts involving bestiality, bondage, weapons, defecation/urination, etc.

#### 4. Seto et al. (2018) working with NCMEC developed a 4-Point Sexual Activity Scale

1. Nudity or erotic posing with no sexual activity. (Level 1 on SAP Scale)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Fully clothed erotica</li> <li>• Erotica present</li> <li>• Exposed genitals or anus</li> <li>• Exposed breasts or chest</li> <li>• Other sexual explicit content (i.e. fetishes)</li> <li>• Full nudity</li> </ul>
2 Non-penetrative sexual activity between children, adults and children, or masturbation. (Level 2+3 on SAP Scale)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Licking</li> <li>• Kissing</li> <li>• Manual stimulation</li> <li>• Oral copulation</li> </ul>
3. Penetrative sexual activity between adults and children. (Level 4 on SAP Scale)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Anal or vaginal penetration</li> <li>• Ejaculation seen</li> </ul>
4. Sadism or Bestiality (Level 5 on SAP Scale)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Drugged / Sleeping</li> <li>• Bestiality</li> <li>• Bondage</li> <li>• Defecation</li> <li>• Urination</li> </ul>

#### B. Findings of ECPAT and Interpol (2018)

In 2018, ECPAT and INTERPOL released the results of an analysis of information recorded for more than one million media files (photos and videos) of child sexual exploitation and abuse material (CSAM) in the International Child Sexual Exploitation (ICSE) Database. Almost 47% of the files in the database portray child victims that have been identified by law enforcement, while the remainder depict unidentified children. Eight hundred series of videos and images stored in the database were randomly selected for more detailed visual examination.

They reported the following “alarming trends” in levels of brutality and age of victims:

A detailed examination was conducted of a random selection of 800 series of videos and images. Of these, 84 per cent contained explicit sexual activity, assault, gross assault, sadism or other ‘problematic paraphilias’ such as bestiality, humiliation or necrophilia. [also biastophilia: “a paraphilia involving sexual arousal and excitement based on surprising or attacking a stranger sexually.” APA Dictionary: <https://dictionary.apa.org/biastophilia>]

...

Where the unidentified victim’s age could be determined, 56.2 percent of cases depicted prepubescent children, 25.4 percent were pubescent children, and 4.3 percent were very young children (infants and toddlers). 14.1 percent of cases featured children in multiple age categories.

The study found a link between the age of the victim and the severity of abuse. When victims were younger, the abuse was more likely to be severe. It was also found that very young children were more likely than pubescent victims to be subjected to abuse and exploitation featuring an additional paraphilic theme (Interpol, 2018, p. 8 of the Summary Report)

Summary: Towards a Global Indicator on Unidentified Victims in Child Sexual Exploitation Material - Feb 2018  
Technical report: Towards a Global Indicator on Unidentified Victims in Child Sexual Exploitation Material- Feb 2018

The analysis by ECPAT and INTERPOL (2018) included the following findings:

- In the 72.5 percent of cases where victim gender was recorded, 64.8 percent of unidentified media files depicted female children, 31.1 percent depicted male children and in 4.1 percent both male and female victims. When boys were depicted in the abuse, it was more likely to be severe or involve paraphilic themes.

- Why is this important? It is often considered that most victims of sexual abuse and exploitation are girls. However, the significant proportion of boys depicted in unidentified images and videos in the ICSE Database invites closer attention to this group.(p. 3)

Age and severity of sexual victimisation

- Where the unidentified victim’s age could be determined, 56.2 percent of cases depicted prepubescent children, 25.4 percent were pubescent children, and 4.3 percent were very young children (infants and toddlers). 14.1 percent of cases featured children in multiple age categories.

- The study found a link between the age of the victim and the severity of abuse. When victims were younger, the abuse was more likely to be severe. It was also found that very young children were more likely than pubescent victims to be subjected to abuse and exploitation featuring an additional paraphilic theme.

● Why is this important? It is often assumed that victims of sexual abuse are older children. This may be due in part to increased media attention and public awareness surrounding the risks associated with young people's use of technology and the Internet, including the production of youth-produced material, but it may also be due to the fact that most people find it hard to imagine the extreme sexual assault of an infant. While the victimisation of any child of any age is inexcusable, over 60 percent of unidentified victims in this study were prepubescent, including very young children (infants and toddlers). This finding highlights the need to reflect and potentially prioritise this age group in policy and programming

84.2 percent of the analysed sample of images or videos in the database were classified as COPINE level six or above, which means they contained explicit erotic posing, explicit sexual activity, assault, gross assault, sadism or other problem paraphilias.

When the victim was younger, or a boy the COPINE rating was more likely to be seven or above. (p. 5)

#### Offender Gender

● It was only possible to identify the gender of the offender in under half of all analysed series. Where this was the case, the vast majority (92.7 percent) of offenders were male. Female offenders were most frequently depicted together with a male offender in the sample (in 5.5 percent of valid cases). Where the imagery showed males and females abusing a child together, it was almost always the males who recorded the sexual activity, while the female offenders were actively involved in the abuse of the child(ren). In cases where females abused a child on their own (only two percent of the analysed series), these lone female offenders appeared younger in age (some apparently in late adolescence or young adulthood) than those depicted abusing a child together with a male. (p. 6)

#### Number of victims

● Of the eligible series, 71.6 percent depicted a single victim; 15.7 percent involved two victims; 4.4 percent featured three victims; 2.3 percent featured four victims; and 6 percent featured five or more victims.

● Why is this important? Understanding the situation of unidentified children requires insight into the context of their victimisation. For example, the high proportion of single victims may be the result of the secretive nature of child sexual abuse, where silence is enforced by an offender through grooming, manipulation and threats to a child victim. Cases involving multiple victims may indicate intra-familial (e.g. sibling) or peer abuse, or a more opportunistic offending profile (e.g. child abuse by travelling sex offenders). (p. 8) ...

Our findings also suggest images depicting younger children and/or more egregious content are more likely to involve familial offenders. This information could be useful to law enforcement during victim identification efforts and investigations, perhaps keeping in mind that while looking for very young victims, the offender is relatively likely a family member. Another finding relevant for law enforcement is not all images are traded with equal frequency. Those with the most egregious content and those with a familial relationship between victim and perpetrator were more likely to be actively traded (p. 44)

### **C. Findings of the United States Department of Justice**

The United States Department of Justice 2023 Report on Child Sexual Abuse (2023c) similarly describes “the rape of infants and toddlers, bondage, humiliation through sexual assault”:

As technology has evolved, there has been a dramatic increase in the number of newly produced images and videos depicting the sexual abuse of children, as well as a pervasive spread of images and videos of abuse produced prior to the advent of the internet. The degree of violence and sadistic content depicted in CSAM has increased as well. CSAM depicting the rape of infants and toddlers, bondage, humiliation through sexual assault, including self-mutilation, youth-on youth abuse, and child-on-child abuse, as well as bestiality, are not uncommon. (United States Department of Justice 2023c, P. 5)

The 2023 United States Department of Justice Report (2023c) also discusses sadistic physical abuse of very young children and babies, also referred to as “hurtcore”:

Recently, one of these top three hidden services exclusively hosted imagery called “hurt core” – the sadistic physical abuse of children. Another was dedicated to the sexual abuse of children aged five and under. This preference for the youngest children has an added “benefit” for child sex offenders. Pre-verbal children—infants and toddlers—cannot disclose when they are sexually assaulted, thus further protecting the offenders from exposure and identification. (P. 6)

A Report to Congress in 2016 by United States Department of Justice made reference to newborns, “children a young a days old”:

Children as young as days old to 17 years, both male and female, across all ethnic and socio-economic backgrounds, are potential targets of individuals who engage in child pornography activities. Based on information representing more than 10,000 identified children depicted in child pornography submitted to NCMEC by law enforcement, 40% of all child pornography victims are between infancy and “tween” years. Child advocate personnel across the United States report that the ages of victims depicted in child pornography have significantly decreased in the past few years. (p. 72)

[https://www.justice.gov/d9/pages/attachments/2016/04/19/2016\\_natl\\_strategy\\_rpt\\_-\\_online\\_version\\_updated\\_final\\_08\\_16\\_2016.pdf](https://www.justice.gov/d9/pages/attachments/2016/04/19/2016_natl_strategy_rpt_-_online_version_updated_final_08_16_2016.pdf)

Based in what I hear from victims, I believe that CSAM content has likely become as bad as it

can get, although the prevalence is still building exponentially. It is produced by family offenders, in peer-to-peer (P2P) networks, as well as in large-scale clandestine facilities.

#### **D. Data from the National Center for Missing and Exploited Children**

Seto, Buckman, Dwyer, and Quayle (2018) analyzed child exploitation images from two datasets of the National Center for Missing and Exploited Children (NCMEC):

(1) a historical dataset that encompassed all actively traded cases involving identified victims from July 1, 2002, to June 30, 2014 (518 cases involving 933 victims); from July 1, 2002, to June 30, 2014 (518 cases involving 933 victims);

(2) a modern dataset encompassing all cases involving identified victims from July 1, 2011, to June 30, 2014 (1,965 cases involving one offender and one victim, and 633 cases involving multiple offenders and/or victims; only a small minority of these cases were actively traded)". (Seto et al, 2018, p. 3)

Report highlights:

1. The most notable historical finding was a trend toward more egregious sexual content over time, with more cases involving explicit sexual conduct in later years. In contrast, there were no obvious trends in terms of child victim age or gender.

2. In cases involving a single victim and single offender, actively traded cases were associated with having prepubescent victims. Actively traded cases were also associated with more egregious content in terms of sexual activity, and more likely to involve familial offenders, particularly nuclear family members.

3. While most cases involved male offenders who were unrelated to the child, cases involving female offenders, younger children, or more egregious content were more likely to involve familial offenders. (p. 4)

Cases involving the most egregious content (level 4) were much more likely to involve a familial relationship between offender and victim.

#### **E. Findings from the Canadian Centre for Child Protection Tipline Report**

The Canadian Centre for Child Protection published an analysis of reports to their tipline in 2016 titled: *Child Sexual Abuse Images on the Internet: A Cybertip.ca Analysis* (C3P, 2016a):

This report provides an overview of the information received through reports to the tipline over the last 8 years, with a particular focus on child sexual abuse images. The report was based on the review of close to 152,000 reports and examined 43,762 unique

images and videos classified by Cybertip.ca as child pornography [CSAM]. (C3P, 2016b)

The *Key Findings* summary (C3P, 2016b) of this analysis cites the following disturbing findings:

- ▶ 78.29% [34,133 children] of the images and videos assessed depicted very young, prepubescent children under 12 years old [This is broken down further in the full report (C3P 2016a): (49.64% (21,649 children) of the whole sample were under 8 years old; 28.66% (12,493 children) were between 8 and 11 years old (p. 14)]
- ▶ 63.40% of those children under 12 years old appeared to be under 8 years of age
- ▶ 6.65% of those children under 8 years old appeared to be babies or toddlers\*
- ▶ 80.42% of the children were girls
- ▶ 77.05% of the children's faces were visible in the images and videos
- ▶ 50.00% of the images and videos involved explicit sexual activity/assaults and extreme sexual assaults
- ▶ 53.84% of the abuse acts against children under 12 years old involved explicit sexual activity/assaults and extreme sexual assaults
- ▶ 59.72% of the abuse acts against babies and toddlers involved explicit sexual activity/assaults and extreme sexual assaults
- ▶ 68.68% of the images and videos appeared to be in a home setting, of which 69.91% captured explicit sexual activity/assaults and extreme sexual assaults
- ▶ 83.35% of the adults visible in the images and videos were males
- ▶ 97.25% of the content involved explicit sexual activity/assaults and extreme sexual assaults when adult males were visible with the children in the images and videos

\* The full report (2016a) states:

Cybertip.ca only started recording babies/toddlers within SMR1 [youngest sexual maturation rate, estimated as roughly equivalent to zero to 8 years of age] as of 2009. Of the 41,028 total children assessed since 2009, 3.26% appeared to be babies or toddlers. Of the 20,147 children assessed since 2009 as having an SMR of 1, 6.65% (1,339) appeared to be babies or toddlers.] (C3P 2016a, p. 14)

This report (C3P, 2016b) analyzed the severity abuse in 43,760 images and videos and found:

31.80% (13,917) of images and videos involved sexual posing (Severity 1)  
18.20% (7,963) of images and videos involved extreme sexual posing (Severity 2)  
47.77% (20,906) of images and videos involved explicit sexual activity/assaults (Severity 3)  
2.23% (974) of images and videos involved extreme sexual assaults (Severity 4)\*

\* I believe that the producers of the most sadistic CSAM have the highest security, physically, i.e., concealing their physical facilities, and technologically, i.e., the smallest digital footprint, and that the percentage of extreme sexual assaults is higher than indicated above and growing exponentially.

The Canadian Centre for Child Protection further analyzed, since 2013, the severity of the abuse in the CSAM content in relation to the child’s sexual maturation rate, and found that:

As the age of the children decreases, the sexual abuse and sexual exploitation acts become more intrusive. When babies and toddlers were seen in the images and videos, 59.72% of the abuse acts involved explicit sexual activity/assaults and extreme sexual assaults against the child. (C3P, 2016b)

The following is the data on severity of abuse and Sexual Maturation Rate (C3P, 2016a, p. 17):

	Sexual Posing and Extreme Sexual Posing	Explicit Sexual Activity/Assaults and Extreme Sexual Assaults
Toddler	40.28% (373)	59.72% (553)
4-8 Years Old	44.18% (7,490)	55.82% (9,463)
8-11 Years Old	50.35% (4,695)	49.65% (4,629)
12-17 Years Old	56.06% (3,460)	43.94% (2,712)

The analysis further found:

The inclusion of a boy child in an image or video increased the likelihood that the content depicted explicit sexual activity/assaults or extreme sexual assaults (C3P, 2016a, p. 18)

It is important to recognize that boy children are victimized in the production of child sexual abuse and torture materials (CSAMs), i.e., that such victimization is not limited to girl children.

Along these lines, the offenders are not only male. The analysis found that 83.35% (11,165) of the adults in the images/videos were male and 16.65% (2,230) were female (CP3, 2016a, p. 20).

In 2016, the Canadian Centre for Child Protection conducted an online survey of CSAM victims. They published their findings in 2017 (2017a, 2017b). The researchers analyzed survivors’ open-text responses to in-depth survey questions. The findings regarding victims’ ages and the level of brutality of the abuse were similarly disturbing to the cybertip.ca analysis. They found that:

Most victims were abused from a young age, by a family member and for some, continuing into adulthood.

- For 56% of the survivors, the abuse began between age 0-4, and 53% of those respondents indicated that the abuse continued into adulthood. [9% of these indicated the abuse was ongoing at the time of the survey (p. 14)]
- 58% of survivors reported having been abused by more than one person – some by

multiple family members.

- 50% of the survivors abused by one person indicated that the abuser was a parent or extended family member, while 82% of the survivors who were abused by multiple offenders indicated that the primary abuser was a parent or extended family member.
- 36% of survivors indicated that the sexual abuse continued into adulthood (18+)  
(CP3, 2017a, p. 8)

The C3P analysis (2017a) also analyzed respondent descriptions of abusers' tactics and threats:

As with many victims of child sexual abuse, survivors (n=96) reported that threats were not uncommon and that offender(s) used a wide variety of tactics to control the victim and to keep them from disclosing the abuse.

The analysis revealed the following forms of threats for noncompliance with the offender(s):

- 67%: Threat of physical harm to victim (including death)
- 24%: Threat of physical harm to a family member of victim
- 22%: Threat of other harm to victim (non-physical)
- 19%: Threat of physical harm to people or animals in victim's life (not specified or not family)
- 14%: Threats to tell people about the images and/or show the images to others  
(see Graphs 20 and 21. (C3P, 2017a, p. 19)

The C3P (2017a) report details the nature of much of the coercion, as follows:

Other threats/consequences included making the victim watch the abuse of other children or saying other children would be abused if the victim did not cooperate (10%); make people believe it's victim's fault (9%), loved ones would withdraw affection (7%), confinement (7%); offenders (if family) would withdraw affection (5%); and withhold food, drink, sleep (4%).

Some responses, or parts of a response, did not easily fall into the categories noted above. These responses were coded as "other" (22%). Examples of threats that were coded as "other" include threats of suicide (by the offender), that the offender would get in trouble, that other offenders may become involved who would be meaner/more abusive to the victim and that the victim would have to recruit others who would follow the instructions.

Examples of consequences coded as "other harm (non-physical)" and not reflected in the graph, included consequences such as the offender insulting, humiliating or emotionally abusing the victim in some way, isolation of the victim, the offender refusing to get the victim medical attention, and the offender not allowing the victim to wear clothing. (C3P, 2017a, p. 19)

In cases of organized sexual abuse, the threats or consequences for non-compliance were similar:

- 77%: Threat of physical harm to victim
- 28%: Threat of physical harm to family member of victim
- 25%: Threat of physical harm to people or animals in victim's life (not specified or not family)
- 23%: Threat of other harm to victim (non-physical)
- 14%: Threats to tell people about the images and/or show the images to others (C3P, 2017a, p. 19)

The C3P report details the nature of much of the coercion, as follows:

Other threats/consequences included making people believe it was the victim's fault (13%); making the victim watch the abuse of other children or saying other children would be abused if the victim did not cooperate (13%); confinement (11%); withholding food, drink, or sleep (6%); loved ones would withdraw affection (2%); and offenders (if family) would withdraw affection (2%). (C3P, 2017a, p. 19)

The C3P report explains:

28% of the respondents who were threatened with physical harm (n=64) said their abuser either threatened to torture them, or did torture them. For those who reported being subjected to torture as a means of compliance, examples included electric shock, being dunked/held under water, and choking.

It is important to recognize that the threats of harm described above were communicated to and interpreted by children. Through that lens, one can readily appreciate why a child would have felt they had to comply, and consequently why it might be incredibly difficult for a child in such a position to come forward for help. (C3p, 2017a, p. 18)

The C3P report analyzed the specific acts that the offenders instructed the victims to do (N=71):

- 44%: Posing/performing
- 38%: Smiling/enjoyment
- 38%: Wearing costumes
- 32%: Silence
- 15%: Use of props

Responses not included in the graph above include making specific sounds (10%), scripting (10%), comply (e.g., told to follow instructions from other abusers/"clients") (10%), show pain/discomfort (8%) and "other" (10%). Examples of instructions/requirements coded as "other" include: eat a certain thing, read stories involving child sexual abuse, engage in rituals, hold up signs, not look at the offender(s)

and engage in violence against other children.

Note: There were 29 respondents who indicated that yes, they were instructed/required to do specific things during the hands-on abuse, but these respondents did not provide any additional detail about the instruction and/or requirement and so they are not reflected in the above graph. Also, there were nine respondents who indicated there were no specific things they were instructed/required to do. Five of the nine stated that at times instructions were not necessary as restraints were used (e.g., being tied up, held down, etc.). Some mentioned being forced to perform sex acts against other children.

C3P's (2017a) analysis of the responses of victims of organized abuse found:

Some of the more common perpetrator strategies to inhibit or prevent disclosure include drugging children (to reduce and interfere with recall), threatening death or harm, reinforcing a relation of dependence with the perpetrator, and/or forcing children into sexual contact with other children (to engender a sense of guilt and complicity). Other factors which play a role in inhibiting disclosure and/or preventing survivors from seeking help include dissociation disorders and amnesia – both of which survivors may feel undermine their credibility in the eyes of those in a position to help.

Unfortunately, because of the horrifying and seemingly incredible nature of organized sexual abuse experiences, disbelief and skepticism remain common responses from those confronted with such accounts.<sup>vii</sup> In fact, the literature indicates that survivors have said that the often hard to believe nature of the accounts is both intentionally cultivated and relied upon by the perpetrators to induce dissociative identity disorder and/or prevent disclosure among survivors. [<sup>viii</sup>]

31% of the survivors of organized sexual abuse who found the courage to disclose did so as children, for two of these children the abuse had already ended at the time they disclosed. Unfortunately, however, 68% of those who disclosed as children (where the abuse was ongoing) were either not believed or were actively ignored in their disclosure, thereby allowing their abuse to continue — see Graph 42. When considered within the larger survey, all but three of the respondents who indicated that they told as children and the abuse continued after telling were a part of the organized child sexual abuse category. As addressed earlier, in addition to parents or other familial authority figures perpetrating the abuse, many of the organized abuse survivors indicated that they were abused by those who gained their authority by virtue of their profession, such as doctors, religious leaders, counsellors, school staff, or police — see Graph 29. (C3P, 2017a, p. 27)

C3P (2017a) analyzed the impact of the abuse on victims of organized abuse. They found:

One theme that was readily apparent in the instances of organized sexual abuse reported by respondents was the prevalence of dissociative identity disorder (DID) – “a complex,

chronic mental illness characterised by the presence of multiple, alternating self-states, personalities or identities”x or associated dissociative disorders. DID is an extremely serious condition – one that may be intentionally induced by perpetrators in order to prevent disclosure among survivors – and estimates suggest that if undiagnosed or untreated, those afflicted have suicide rates which are several thousand times higher than average. [xiii] 68% of the survey respondents in the category of organized sexual abuse, described receiving a diagnosis of DID or made reference to dissociative disorders or experiencing dissociation (n=74). This is not surprising considering that DID “develops as a response to chronic and overwhelming trauma exposure in childhood, including organized abuse.”xi (C3P, 2017a, p32)

## **F. Internet Watch Foundation Data**

The Internet Watch Foundation (IWF) 2016 Annual Report includes describes the trends in the age of victims in seized CSAMs as follows:

53% of children were assessed as aged 10 or under. This is consistent with the trend identified in 2015 which indicated a decrease in younger children being depicted in child sexual abuse imagery assessed by our analysts. In 2016 we saw a further overall drop in the percentage of children we assessed as being aged 10 or younger. In 2013 and 2014, this figure was fairly consistent at around 80%. In 2015, the figure was 69%. We’ve also seen an increase in reports of children we’ve assessed as 11 to 15.

We think there are two reasons why we’ve seen more images of 11 to 15 year olds, than children aged 10 and under.

1. We increasingly see what’s termed “self-produced”\* content created using webcams and then shared online. This can have serious repercussions for young people and we take this trend very seriously. We’ve looked into this before, and will be launching a new report focusing on online child sexual abuse imagery captured from webcams later in 2017.

2. By analysing our data further, we know that the public are more likely to report images of children aged 10 and younger, and whose abuse is of a more severe level. However, our actively searched-for images total a larger number than public reports. With more analysts and the ability to actively search for content (since 2014), if we encounter a forum with thousands of images of child sexual abuse, we will not only work to remove that forum, but also now capture the URLs of every image on there (which might be pulled from another site) and follow up to remove each and every image hosted on other sites as well. This technique appears to mean we more commonly encounter more images of 11 to 15 year olds. (p. 9-10)

\* Note: I am concerned that a significant proportion of CSAM content that is categorized as

“self-produced” may be CSAM of children being coerced to perform sexually by adult offenders.

The Internet Watch Foundation (IWF) 2016 Annual Report includes examples extreme levels of brutality in CSAMs, and that, in some cases, it is inflicted on babies:

An anonymous report was made through the Indian Portal to IWF. It was for content hosted in a cyberlocker. It showed baby girls and baby boys of a range of ethnicities. Worst of all, some of the most severe abuse was happening to them; rape and sexual torture. (p. 45)

Not many people realise this, but as well as viewing child sexual abuse material, our analysts have to see things which we don't deal with, such as images of animals being tortured, or even beheadings. If an image circulates the internet, it could be reported. It's imperative we recruit the right people, and look after them. (p. 49)

There are always images that are harder to view than others. I have difficulties whenever I see images of babies, of new-born babies, being tortured or raped. It gets me thinking - how could anybody do this to a baby, to something that small, that fragile? (p. 51)

The regular use of the internet by young children in the modern era also has a role in the exponential growth of online abuse. The IWF 2022 Annual Report states:

“In 2022, we saw a 60% increase in the number of images [CSAMs] including children aged 7-10 years old. As ever-younger children become more tech-aware and active online, they become more vulnerable to grooming and abuse by strangers – even in their own bedrooms.”

This IWF 2022 report also states:

“As in previous years, we saw more sexual abuse images of children aged 11- 13 than of any other age group. Older children can be curious about the online world and keen to explore. Unfortunately, adult abusers – sometimes pretending to be children themselves – exploit this by manipulating children into performing sexual acts on camera, via a smartphone, tablet or laptop. In 2022, we saw a 14% decrease in imagery of this age group.”

## **G. The International Justice Mission Report (2020)**

The International Justice Mission Report, *Falling Short: Demand-Side Sentencing for Online Sexual Exploitation of Children: Composite Case Review, Analysis, and Recommendations for the United Kingdom* (2020c) describes extreme sexual assault of babies and toddlers:

The global CSEM problem is a pandemic at a breaking point.<sup>46</sup> In 2018, technology

companies reported a record 45 million online photos and videos of child abuse, with 69 million reported in 2019. [47] The National Center of Missing and Exploited Children reported processing over 150 million images and videos through its Child Recognition and Identification System. [48] And the sheer volume is not the only worrying aspect: According to a report from the Canadian Centre for Child Protection, “59.72% of the abuse acts against babies and toddlers involved explicit sexual activity/assaults and extreme sexual assaults.” 49 (p. 17) (Canadian Centre for Child Protection, 2016a).

## **H. Case Example: Criminal Convictions of “Hurtcore” Sex Offender Peter Scully**

Peter Scully was convicted and given a life sentence in the Philippines in 2018 for raping and filming numerous children, including a baby in a series of “hurtcore” films entitled: *Daisy’s Destruction*. His case is within the typical range of CSAM crime:

Australian businessman, Peter Scully, was sentenced in the Philippines on June 13, 2018 to life in prison for one count of human trafficking and five counts of rape by sexual assault of underage girls. He faces up to 60 further charges for torture, murder and abuse against children. (ABC.Net Australia, 2018)

Sculley is alleged to have built up a lucrative international pedophile ring that offered pay-per-view live-stream video on the dark web of child rape, torture, and murder. Two teenage girls were allegedly found naked and chained in an apartment Sculley rented (The Australian, March 13, 2018). One series of films, *Daisy’s Destruction*, he sold to clients for up to \$10,000. Among the victims in *Daisy’s Destruction* were:

a 5-year-old girl hung upside down while Scully and two accomplices raped and tortured her, two cousins, aged 9 and 12, forced to perform sex acts on each other, chained in dog collars and, after an escape attempt, made to dig what they were told would be their own graves.

Liza (aged 12), Cindy (11) and Daisy (18 months), tortured, brutally raped, and made to appear to be murdered. Investigators found Liza and Daisy alive— Daisy’s treatment had been so vicious, she has lasting physical injuries. Cindy had later been strangled to death by Scully.

In January, 2015, during the manhunt of Scully, but prior to his arrest on February 20, 2015, key evidence against Scully, including computer logs and videos, was destroyed in a fire in the evidence room at the Cagayan de Oro City Hall in the Philippines. (Mindanao Gold Star Daily: <http://mindanaogoldstardaily.com/evidence-vs-peter-scully-gone-due-to-january-fire/>)

Many suspect foul play, pay-offs, etc., in the evidence-destroying fire and in Scully being granted means of communication. This is a reasonable suspicion given the economics of such crimes.

Scully's former partner and co-accused, Liezyl Margallo, was arrested on January 25, 2017. Between their two arrests, they are alleged to have maintained contact, possibly continuing to coordinate their child trafficking operation, despite bans on prisoners having telephones, computers or other electronic devices. (The Sydney Morning Herald, January 31, 2017:

<https://www.smh.com.au/world/alleged-child-abuser-peter-scully-may-still-be-masterminding-porn-network-20170131-gu25sw.html>)

(Cebu Daily News, January 26, 2017: <http://cebudailynews.inquirer.net/120658/savage-girl-falls>)

Note: I cannot find very much information on Margallo. I believe it is possible that was originally a child victim of Scully and that Scully coerced and entrapped her into perpetrating against other victims and colluding with him.

A New York Post article (November 10, 2022) *Pedophile serving life gets another 129 years for filming his depraved child rapes*; describes Scully's extreme sadistic abuse of a baby:

A notorious pedophile already serving life in prison in the Philippines has been sentenced to another 129 years — for filming himself raping impoverished kids, including a baby and a girl found buried under his home.

Link: <https://nypost.com/2022/11/10/pedophile-peter-gerard-scully-serving-life-gets-another-129-years/>

...

His videos, which he reportedly sold to creeps in Germany, Brazil and the US, showed Scully and his girlfriend inflicting “extreme kinds of abuses,” Barola-Uy told AFP.

“They were very graphic, they were very brutal,” she said.

Anti-human-trafficking agent Eric Nuqui had earlier said the vids showed “some sort of systematic torture of children until death.”

The Scully case is discussed more here: <https://endritualabuse.org/child-rape-torture-materials-dark-web/>

Update:

Tumbado, J.G. (March 22, 2025). Supreme Court affirms life sentence for Peter Scully in landmark human trafficking ruling.

Link: [https://frontpageph.com/supreme-court-affirms-life-sentence-for-peter-scully-in-landmark-human-trafficking-ruling/#google\\_vignette](https://frontpageph.com/supreme-court-affirms-life-sentence-for-peter-scully-in-landmark-human-trafficking-ruling/#google_vignette)

Supreme Court of the Philippines (2025). SC Upholds Life Sentence of Peter Scully for Qualified Trafficking

Link: <https://sc.judiciary.gov.ph/sc-upholds-life-sentence-of-peter-scully-for-qualified-trafficking/>

Full text of ruling: [https://sc.judiciary.gov.ph/wp-content/uploads/2025/03/SECOND-DIVISION-G.R.NO.\\_270174\\_DECISION.pdf](https://sc.judiciary.gov.ph/wp-content/uploads/2025/03/SECOND-DIVISION-G.R.NO._270174_DECISION.pdf)

## **I. Case Example: Ian Watkins**

BBC (December 18, 2013). Lostprophets' Ian Watkins sentenced to 35 years over child sex offences. Link:

<https://www.bbc.com/news/uk-wales-25412675>

Ian Watkins, age 36, singer for the rock group, Lostprophets, was sentenced to 35 years for a string of child sex offences including the attempted rape of a baby.

Watkins pleaded guilty at the UK's Cardiff Crown Court in Novemebr 2013 to 13 child sex offences. His two co-defendants, two mothers known as Woman A and Woman B, also pleaded guilty to child abuse charges, and who were jailed for 14 and 17 years .

Watkins admitted conspiring to rape a child, three counts of sexual assault involving children, seven involving taking, making or possessing indecent images of children and one of possessing an extreme pornographic image involving a sex act on an animal.

Watkins' defending barrister said that Watkins had no memory of the crime involving Woman A and her son, where he admitted to the attempted rape of a baby.

The BBC article states: "Meanwhile, South Wales Police are investigating whether Watkins also committed offences in Germany and America and the IPCC has confirmed it was investigating three police forces over the case."

"Detective Chief Inspector Peter Doyle, senior investigating officer, said the sentences reflected the gravity of the crimes and the investigation uncovered "the most disturbing child abuse evidence" he had seen in his 28 years as an officer."

The article cites Detective Chief Inspector Doyle: "Earlier he said the investigation was large scale because the amount of data involved - 27 terabytes - was "four or five times" the size of the databases held by South Wales Police. And he said how he was sure there were other child victims."

## **J. Testimony to Congress by Flint Waters, Lead Agent for the Wyoming Internet Crimes Against Children Task Force, 2008**

In 2008, Flint Waters was Lead Agent for the Wyoming Internet Crimes Against Children Task Force within the Wyoming Internet Crimes Against Children (or "ICAC") task force, which developed child exploitation investigation software and hosts the undercover infrastructure that is used by law enforcement agencies throughout the United States and the world.

In April, 2008, Waters, testified about his work as a front-line investigator to the United States Senate Committee on the Judiciary Subcommittee on Crime and Drugs. His presentation was titled: "Challenges and Solutions for Protecting our Children from Violence and Exploitation in the 21st Century." His testimony described a staggering magnitude of production and distribution of child sexual abuse materials (CSAMs) by offenders right here in United States, and a level of brutality, including violent assault of infants and toddlers, all aspects of CSAMs that were not adequately represented in most reports on human trafficking at the time, as follows.

Our system, known as "Operation Fairplay," is housed by the State of Wyoming and used throughout the world. It is a comprehensive computer infrastructure that gives law enforcement the tools they need to leverage the latest technologies to identify and track

those who prey on children, just as the offenders use technology to identify and track the children that would be their prey.

The Wyoming system has enabled law enforcement to begin to bring into focus a picture of the staggering magnitude of child pornography trafficking today.

...

With the rise of the Internet, child pornography trafficking has exploded, both commercially and non-commercially.

...

One of the most frequently seen movies being distributed now is of a toddler on a changing table. The video zooms in as the child's diaper is removed and an unknown male penetrates her. We are seeing the rape of more and more extremely young children like this. Criminals are even using live web casts, where online participants direct what is done to the child. We trace this activity into our own states and rescue children in our own communities.

We are also seeing modifications of these movies and images. Offenders are compiling the material in online instruction manuals, training each other how to rape children in ways that make it more difficult to detect, in ways that are harder to prove during medical examinations.

...

As you have seen the new technologies we have developed give us the unprecedented ability to locate and stop hundreds of thousands of suspects, before another child is targeted. Unfortunately, facing the scope of this problem can prove daunting.

I would like to be clear, I am NOT saying law enforcement isn't doing enough with what they have. I am saying they could do so much more if they only had the resources.

...

Each of those children must wonder if anyone cares.

Imagine if a serial rapist was on the loose in the U.S. attacking innocent citizens and then uploading videos of those rapes onto the Internet. That's exactly what we see flooding the Internet now. But the sexual assault victims are children. Many are infants and toddlers.

Some cry and scream for help. Others have stopped crying.

## **K. Torture Level Abuse of Prostituted Women**

In all forms of human trafficking, torture-level abuse is more common than most people

consider. In 2024 study of 45 women who had been prostituted for at least a year, Farley and Kennedy including the following findings:

The report revealed that prostitution is a form of torture, and prostituted people suffer psychological and physical consequences similar to what happens to victims of state-sponsored torture – i.e., the kind of torture that prisoners of war are subjected to. Each of the women surveyed had been subjected to one of the six kinds of torture outlined in the report.

...

Thirty-five percent of our interviewees were prostituted as children. Of these 9% (4) were aged 9–13 and 27% (12) were aged 14–17.

...

Eighty-seven percent (40/45) of our interviewees suffered childhood sexual abuse. Their average number of perpetrators of childhood sexual abuse was 4 (median 2, range 1-20). Thirty-three percent (13/40) were younger than age 5 at their first experience of sexual assault, 35% (14/40) were aged 5–10, and 32% (13/40) were aged 10–17.

As in other contexts, women in prostitution described dissociation as a means of surviving the abuse they were experiencing (Ross et al., 2003; Schwartz et al., 2007). The women’s average dissociation score exceeded the cutoff score for a probable dissociative disorder. Greater exposure to torture victimization increased dissociation (McDonnell et al., 2013; Schauer & Elbert, 2015).

...

All but one of our interviewees experienced captivity in prostitution, which likely increased their dissociative symptoms. Captivity has been associated with high levels of both dissociative and PTSD symptoms in other torture research (Choi et al., 2009; Zerach et al., 2014). (p. 7)

## **VI. CSAM Offenders Regularly Coerce Children to Harm Other Children**

In my clinical work, and in reports by national and international agencies that investigate CSAM, there is increased evidence of CSAM producers coercing children to victimize other children.

CSAM offenders coerce victims to harm each other for many reasons, including:

My understanding of the reasons that CSAM offenders coerce victims to harm other victims is:

- 1) Offenders conceal evidence of their own participation in the sexual abuse that they film. They remain off-camera to avoid being identifiable by law enforcement;

- 2) to enhance their sadistic pleasure by harming two victims simultaneously – 1. the victim who is coerced, often through torture and threats, and 2. the recipient of that abuse;
- 3) to cause victims to believe themselves to be guilty parties to extort them further, control them long-term, and to guard against their disclosure of their abuse, and;
- 4) to inflict such severe moral injury that victims will dissociate memories of this abuse to newly-formed dissociated identities to further inhibit their seeking help and disclosure.

The Nottingham Report (2023) address victims being coerced to perpetrate against other victims:

IJM’s casework data in the Philippines has revealed that out of the more than 250 cases they have worked on, the abuse endured by children at the hands of these offenders typically goes beyond simply displaying erotic behaviour (IJM, 2020, p. 12). Sexual exploitation commonly involves forcible sexual penetration, which is classified as rape in the Philippines and many other jurisdictions. Additionally, minors are oftentimes forced to participate in sexual activities with other children, sexually abused by an adult, and even subjected to other inhumane acts, such as bestiality. Furthermore, the data indicates that over half of the victims are 12 years-old or younger, with over 100 of them being 6 years-old or younger when they were rescued (ibid). (p. 11)  
(See International Justice Mission Report 2020c., pp. 12-17)

Salter & Woodlock (2022) discuss the devastating effect of coerced perpetration on the victim:

Survey respondents described the recording of their abuse with deep shame and fear that any individual, including a police officer, might view those images. These images captured not only sexual abuse but also forced perpetration and other acts intended to engender feelings of complicity and guilt. One survivor explained:

“If the perpetrators push you into the role of the perpetrator (that is, require you to abuse others yourself), then you’re even more likely to be silent, because you ultimately feel more of a perpetrator than a victim. If they furthermore have that on film, then you go totally mute. (Female, mid 30s, Belgium)”

The 2018 Interpol Technical report discusses the difficulty in determining whether CSAM imagery was self-generated by youth or coerced by an adult offender:

The range of sexual activities depicted in ‘youth-produced’ series was substantial and ranged from more innocuous, nude or semi-nude ‘selfies’, through to ‘self-generated’ depictions of extreme sexual activity involving bestiality and sadomasochistic themes. Some apparent sexual extortion was evident in newer series, and in videos where children were visibly and aggressively coerced and instructed to perform solo or group sexual activities on camera. In many cases however, when relying on visual cues alone, it was

near-impossible to determine with any level of reliability whether the imagery was in fact self-generated, coerced or otherwise solicited, or whether an adult or minor has coerced or otherwise solicited the depicted victim(s) into the production of the CSAM/CSEM. Noteworthy in these series was the visible context of production; while many images were produced in domestic settings, as would be expected, others appeared to have been produced in school settings, and featured uniformed students.

...

In many cases, the depictions of the victim 'self-generating' CSAM/CSEM appeared to be offender-generated, where the offender captured the stream of their online interaction with the victim, and the victim's 'self-generation' of CSAM/CSEM, via webcam and retained it in video or still format (e.g. in the form of screenshots). In the absence of further contextual data, it is unclear what the underlying motivations for this behaviour might be. However, in a small number of cases (where this offender-victim interaction around 'self-generation' was recorded by the offender on video), it was apparent that these offender recordings were used for exploitative ends – to further blackmail and extort the depicted victim. (pp. 44-45)

As discussed above, the abuse depicted in Peter Scully's film series, *Daisy's Destruction*, includes CSAM of victims forced to perpetrate each other:

a 5-year-old girl hung upside down while Scully and two accomplices raped and tortured her, two cousins, aged 9 and 12, forced to perform sex acts on each other, chained in dog collars and, after an escape attempt, made to dig what they were told would be their own graves. (The Australian, March 13, 2018)

The Canadian Centre for Child Protection analysis of reports to their tipline in 2016 (*Child Sexual Abuse Images on the Internet: A Cybertip.ca Analysis*) found that in 77.05% of the CSAM content analyzed, the child's face was visible vs. blocked, blurred, or covered (CP3, 2016a, p. 18)

It is also important to note that:

Of the 12,600 individuals recorded as engaged in sex acts in the images and videos:  
53.62% (6,756) involved adults committing a sexual assault  
26.14% (3,294) involved the child alone engaged in a sex act(s)  
19.83% (2,398) involved more than one child engaged in a sex act(s)  
0.41% (52) involved animals and a child(ren) engaged in a sex act(s) (CP3, 2016a, p. 20)

The Canadian Centre for Child Protection analysis of survivor responses found:

53% of respondents (n=99) reported that the existence of imagery impacted their decision to tell — see Graph 38. Of these respondents, a significant proportion stated that the

imagery added feelings of further shame (on top of that engendered by the sexual abuse) and others said they feared what might happen to them if the imagery was uncovered, or felt the imagery incriminated them in some way (n=52) — see Graph 39. (C3P, 2017a, p. 26)

Specifically, 19% of the respondents:

Felt images somehow incriminated victim/made them look responsible (C3P, 2017a, p. 26).

C3P, 2017a, p. 41, in discussing the barriers survivors of organized abuse experiences in reporting their abuse to the police:

Among the ‘other’ responses, survivors described such things as limited recollection of the abuse or feeling unable to articulate their experiences, not feeling stable enough, that the incident took place too long ago, or they were unsure of the value of the report. In this category, survivors also mentioned a fear of being seen as the offender (referring to having been made to participate in the abuse or abuse others). According to the literature, this is a common strategy employed by perpetrators of organized abuse to inhibit disclosure and is an essential part of the indoctrination process.<sup>xii</sup> Although in context such fear is certainly justified, it is crucial to remember that “what may appear, to an external observer, to be an adult’s ‘decision’ to participate in sexual activity (however unusual or sadistic) or to engage in some other risky behavior is in fact better understood as a coerced response underpinned by a history of abuse, fear and manipulation.” [xiii] While the concept of ‘survivor’s guilt’ may go a long way toward explaining a survivor’s inability to either disclose or bring it to the attention of police, certainly in these cases, survivors “often harbor a genuine fear that, should they report their abuse to others, then they will also face criminal prosecution alongside those that abused them.” [xiv] (p. 41)

Section VIII on ritualistic abuse further documents coercing victims to harm and kill each other.

## **VII. Increased Evidence of Organized Criminal Child Abuse/Trafficking Networks**

Networks of perpetrators that coordinate their efforts to abuse multiple children are designated by numerous terms. Early terms were “child sex rings” and “pedophile networks.” Recent terms include: “organized abuse,” “organized abuser networks,” “abuser networks,” “group-based offending,” “organized child sexual abuse,” “organized criminal groups,” “organized crimes against children,” and “group-based networks.”

The United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) (2024) “Global Report on Trafficking in Persons 2024” claims that most human traffickers operate in organized crime groups. This citation references all human trafficking, not only child sex trafficking:

Most traffickers operate within organized groups. Based on the analysis of 942 court case summaries, 74 per cent of the 3,121 traffickers involved in these cases operated as groups and networks loosely connected in a business-type criminal relation or as structured criminal organizations rooted in the territories. Non-organized criminals account for about 26 percent of traffickers convicted. Compared to non-organized traffickers, organized crime groups traffic more victims. (UNODC, 2024, p. 16)

However, important cases and recent data, discussed below, indicate a large role of organized abuser networks in the production and distribution of CSAM and in hands-on trafficking of children to other offenders.

### **A. The Hydrant Programme Report: *Group-Based Offending Publication***

In November, 2024, the Hydrant Programme published a report: *Group-Based Offending Publication*. Hydrant is a national policing programme in the United Kingdom. Hydrant develops policy and strategy on behalf of the UK's National Police Chiefs' Council (NPCC). This report can be accessed here: <https://www.hydrantprogramme.co.uk/publications/hydrant-publications>.

The Hydrant Programme report provides the following definition of group-based offending:

The Independent Inquiry into Child Sexual Abuse (IICSA) defined group based offending as a network of two or more individuals (whether identified or not) who are known to (or associated with) one another and are known to be involved in or to facilitate the sexual exploitation of children and young people.

Being involved in the sexual exploitation of children and young people includes introducing them to other individuals for the purpose of exploitation, trafficking a child for the purpose of sexual exploitation, taking payment for sexual activities with a child or young person or allowing their property to be used for sexual activities with a child or young person. (Hydrant Programme, 2024, P. 5)

Citation from the Hydrant Group-Based Offending Publication:

“The Complex Organised Child Abuse Dataset (COCAD) contributes to our understanding of the scale, nature and threat of reported child sexual abuse and exploitation.”

“The COCAD data collection began in January 2023, and it is drawn from a wider data collection covering all aspects of child sexual abuse called the Child Protection and Abuse Investigation (CPAI) dataset.” (Hydrant Programme, 2024, p. 3)

“The Child Sexual Exploitation (CSE) Taskforce was established by then Prime Minister Rishi Sunak in March 2023 to enhance the policing response to group-based child sexual

exploitation and abuse, ...” (Hydrant Programme, 2024, p. 4)

“Whilst it is recognised that the proportion of police recorded group-based offences analysed as part of the COCAD is a small proportion of overall reported crimes, the threat posed by these CSAE crimes is serious due to the nature of offending. Familial. Child Sexual Exploitation. Institutional, Ritualistic. Other. Unknown” (Hydrant Programme, 2024, p. 5)

“In 2023 no crimes were identified in the COCAD under the category of ritualistic. However, we know from third sector organisations that this form of abuse exists within their data. Research into this type of offending is ongoing between the Hydrant Programme, police forces and stakeholders to enhance our understanding of this area.” (Hydrant Programme, 2024, P. 13)

[The Hydrant Programme released such data in 2025 (Hanson) as discussed below]

The Hydrant Group-Based Offending Publication provides data gathered on group-based offending by four kinds of groups: 1) Child Sexual Exploitation, 2) Familial, 3) Institutional, and 4) Ritualistic, as well as “Other” and “Unknown.”

For the purposes of the COCAD criteria, the following definitions were applied:

Investigation	Means any crime which has been considered against the National Crime Recording Standards and formally recorded onto a force crime system.
Group Based/ Network	Is defined as two or more individuals (whether identified or not) who are known to (or associated with) one another and are known to be involved in or to facilitate the sexual exploitation of children and young people. Being involved in the sexual exploitation of children and young people includes introducing them to other individuals for the purpose of exploitation, trafficking a child for the purpose of sexual exploitation, taking payment for sexual activities with a child or young person or allowing their property to be used for sexual activities with a child or young person.
Child	Means someone who has not yet reached their 18th birthday.
Suspect	Is anyone named as a suspect on a crime record, including those who are now deceased, and those who are, or have become a facilitator.
Familial environment	Is defined as sexual abuse perpetrated or facilitated in or out of the home, against a child under the age of 18, by a family member, or someone otherwise linked to the family context or environment, whether or not they are a family member. Within this definition, perpetrators may be close to the victim (for example, father, uncle, stepfather, sibling) or less familiar (family friend, neighbour, babysitter). Less commonly, perpetrators can also be female, such as mother, aunt, cousin or stepmother, which is often overlooked.

Child Sexual Exploitation (CSE)	<p>Is a form of child sexual abuse. It occurs where an individual or group takes advantage of an imbalance of power to coerce, manipulate or deceive a child or young person under the age of 18 into sexual activity:</p> <p>(a) in exchange for something the victim needs or wants, and/or</p> <p>(b) for the financial advantage or increased status of the perpetrator or facilitator.</p> <p>The victim may have been sexually exploited even if the sexual activity appears consensual. Child sexual exploitation does not always involve physical contact; it can also occur through the use of technology.</p>
Institutional or organisational	<p>Includes, schools, councils, hospitals, prisons, churches (and other religious institutions), Cubs, Scouts, Brownies, Guides, Sea Cadets, children’s homes, community centres, leisure centres, youth clubs.</p>
Ritualistic abuse	<p>Is the organised sexual, physical and psychological abuse of children (and often adults) by a group of individuals who use rituals as a form of prolonged and repeated torture (often alongside other forms) with the aim of controlling, silencing and terrorising their victims. As part of this control, perpetrators train children into a supernatural belief system, which they may or may not believe themselves. Ritualistic abuse typically involves family members (for example, parents and their associates abusing their children) and starts when children are young.</p>
CSAE committed by children	<p>A child who has not yet reached their 18th birthday who commits an offence upon another child who likewise has not yet reached their 18th birthday.</p> <p>To note - In 2023 CSAE committed by children wasn’t broken out into a standalone category, the crime would be identified as either familial, CSE, institutional, ritualistic, other or unknown and then additionally recorded to say if it had been committed by one child against another child. It’s important to note that the % includes where CSAE committed by children features across all criteria – the process of identifying CSAE committed by children was not introduced until quarter 2 of the year so all figures quoted are based on Apr-Dec 2023.</p>
Other	<p>Where the offending doesn’t fit a particular category.</p>
Unknown	<p>Where it has been identified as group-based, but the information is not sufficient enough for us to assess the criteria</p>

## **B. Canadian Centre For Child Protection Research on Organized Abuse**

In 2016, the Canadian Centre for Child Protection (C3P) conducted an online survey of victims of production of child sexual abuse materials (CSAM) (2017a and 2017b). The researchers analyzed their open-text responses to the survey. Of the 150 people who responded to the survey, 74 respondents (49%) were identified as victims of organised abuse. Per the researchers:

While the survey was not designed to uncover information about organized child sexual abuse specifically, the theme [of organised abuse] naturally emerged from the responses received. Responses revealed that the survivors' experiences of organized child sexual abuse were strikingly similar and very disturbing. (2017b, p. 74)

The C3P survey report defined “organized sexual abuse” as follows:

“abuse that involves a child or multiple children being subjected to sexual abuse by multiple offenders working together to commit the abuse.” (C3P, 2017a, p. 9)

The C3P survey found that:

8% of the respondents who described organized abuse indicated that they were abused for “16 years or more and still ongoing at the time survey was completed” (p. 15)

The C3P report (2017a) explains the role of the internet in facilitating sex offenders working together and the prevalence of organized abuse:

The Internet has provided an opportunity for offenders to connect and work together in an organized fashion to commit more and more extreme sex acts against children. The depraved and pervasive nature of the sexual abuse reported by many of the respondents was shocking. For example, 58% of survivors were abused by more than one offender, and 49% of survivors appeared to have been victims of ‘organized sexual abuse’. (p. 9)

C3P’s (2017) analysis of the survey data revealed that:

... survivors of organized sexual abuse (n= 74) typically experienced the abuse beginning at an earlier age which lasted longer in duration when compared to those whose abuse was not organized. 82% of respondents in the organized sexual abuse category were in the 0-4 age group when their abuse began ... Furthermore, a quarter of organized sexual abuse survivors endured victimization lasting between 6 to 10 years (n=72), followed closely by a duration of abuse spanning 16 to 20 years (22% of the respondents). Our shock at this finding was only equaled by the revelation of the complete abuse duration spectrum: at one end, the minimum duration of abuse suffered was between two and five years (9%), while at the other end, 21% had endured abuse lasting for a minimum of 21 years [to more than 40 years ]— see Graph 12. (See C3P, 2017, page 15 quote and chart)

C3P (2017a) analyzed the accounts of survivors who described organized abuse to identify the genders and relationship to their abusers (C3P, 2017a, p. 22). They found:

A surprising number of respondents, particularly in the organized sexual abuse category, reported the involvement of females — see Graphs 14 and 28 — and the scope of their involvement ranged from tacit acceptance to active participation. (C3P, 2017a, p. 16)

82% of the primary offenders involved in the “multiple offender” scenarios (n=83) were also parents or extended family members (67% were parents and were predominantly, but not exclusively, male) — see Graph 16. (C3P, 2017a, p. 17)

Both the father and the mother were perpetrators in 27% of these cases. In 100% of these instances the abuse began before the survivors were five years old and the duration of the abuse was shockingly protracted, with the majority of respondents having reported abuse lasting over 16 years (80%, n=20). (C3P, 2017a, p. 22)

When examining offenders and their behaviour specifically in the instances of organized sexual abuse, 31% of those survivors described persons in authoritative occupations involved as perpetrators of their abuse, including members of law enforcement and the military, school personnel, doctors and therapists, as well as clergy— see Graph 29.

[Graph 29: 35% mentioned a doctor; 30% school administrators or teacher(s); 26% police or law enforcement; 26% clergy, and 13% a therapist or psychiatrist (C3P, 2017a, p. 22).]

When one considers that these perpetrators represent the societal institutions intended to protect and nurture citizens’ mental, physical, and spiritual safety and well-being, it is clear that survivor’s distrust in the people and the institutions they represent is not misplaced. (C3P, 2017a, p. 22)

In 53% of the cases categorized as familial organized sexual abuse, the data revealed that the most common group of perpetrators were a father and mother together with other family members (e.g., step-father, foster father, grandfather, grandmother, uncle, aunt, etc.). Similarly, in the cases categorized as network organized sexual abuse with familial involvement, the most common family member involved in the abuse was a father (in 56% of the cases). (C3P, 2017a, p. 22)

82% of the primary offenders involved in the “multiple offender” scenarios (n=83) were also parents or extended family members (67% were parents and were predominantly, but not exclusively, male) — see Graph 16. (C3P, 2017a, p. 17)

The Canadian Centre for Child Protection (C3P) also looked at the psychological outcomes of organized abuse. They found that:

One theme that was readily apparent in the instances of organized sexual abuse reported by respondents was the prevalence of dissociative identity disorder (DID) – “a complex, chronic mental illness characterised by the presence of multiple, alternating self-states, personalities or identities”<sup>x</sup> or associated dissociative disorders. DID is an extremely serious condition – one that may be intentionally induced by perpetrators in order to prevent disclosure among survivors – and estimates suggest that if undiagnosed or untreated, those afflicted have suicide rates which are several thousand times higher than average. [xiii] 68% of the survey respondents [n = 50] in the category of organized sexual abuse, described receiving a diagnosis of DID or made reference to dissociative disorders or experiencing dissociation (n=74). This is not surprising considering that DID “develops as a response to chronic and overwhelming trauma exposure in childhood, including organized abuse.” (C3P, 2017a, p. 32)

### **C. Victim Reports of Consumers Seeking Brutal CSAM of Young Children**

Victims report, and research corroborates (e.g., the United States Department of Justice, 2023c, p. 125; the European Commission of the European Union 2025), that large-scale producers of CSAMs require consumers/customers to provide original video of abuse that they have personally produced to be allowed onto their websites, ostensibly to attempt to exclude law enforcement. The consumers usually do not realize that the producers now have leverage for extortion, which can include access to the consumers’ children. Like other organized crime, to become involved is to be permanently entrapped.

A colleague who assisted law enforcement in CSAM investigations from 2010 and 2015 explained:

What I saw most often was that the CSAM itself was the currency - people were not buying/selling it in terms of actual money or crypto currency. Within web-based pedophile communities, producing “new content” was the price of entry into more exclusive online trading circles. In some cases, offenders were not allowed to trade/view content until they produced/shared new material. All of this obviously perpetuates the victimization of kids over and over. Sadly, the value is high for “new” or “unseen” CSAM because the material is so often re-circulated from prior years (or even decades).

Victims report that large-scale producers charge customer/consumers based on the severity of the abuse and the degree of active participation. They explain that there is a relatively lower charge to view recorded CSAM and CSAM that is relatively less brutal. In contrast, thousands of dollars are charged to participate in on-demand direction of torture-level abuse, including electronic money transfers paid for each act that they direct to be perpetrated within a viewing session. The highest premium is charged for snuff films and to participate in abuse of victims on-site.

Two cases of organized child sex trafficking in recent history are the Franklin and Jeffrey Epstein cases. Both cases share major law enforcement and judicial aberrations that exonerated multiple

perpetrators. The Franklin case includes a rash of mysterious deaths. Epstein's death in prison is shrouded in mystery, as is the death in a Paris prison of his alleged procurer, Jean-Luc Brunel.

#### **D. The Franklin Child Sex Trafficking Network**

The Franklin case involves allegations against Lawrence E. King (not the talk show host, Larry King) who was the general manager of the Franklin Federal Credit Union in Omaha Nebraska. In 1989, a Nebraska senate subcommittee convened to investigate allegations of King's looting of the credit union and also his connection to a nationwide child sex trafficking network. King was accused of trafficking children from foster homes, Boys Town, and other milieus to elite pedophilia "parties." Despite multiple children coming forward, judicial, law enforcement, and media malfeasance ultimately resulted in the network being declared a "hoax." This case is investigated in detail by Nick Bryant, in his book, *The Franklin Scandal: A Story of Powerbrokers, Child Abuse, & Betrayal* (2012). Bryant writes:

The Franklin Scandal is the story of a nationwide pedophile ring that pandered children to a cabal of the rich and powerful. The ring's pimps were a pair of political powerbrokers who had access to the highest levels of our government. Nebraska legislators attempted to expose the network in 1989 and 1990, but the legislators' efforts were followed by a rash of mysterious deaths and the overpowering responses of federal and local law enforcement, including the FBI and Justice Department, which effected an immaculate cover-up of the trafficking network.

#### **E. The Epstein/Maxwell Child Sex Trafficking Network**

There is a solid basis to conclude that the Jeffrey Epstein child abuse network has the most substantial evidence of an organized criminal child abuse operation in documented history. Both Jeffrey Epstein and procurer Ghislaine Maxwell have been convicted of sexual abuse offenses in this case. Many additional alleged procurers of child victims who were assaulted, and the alleged perpetrators who assaulted these children, have not yet been charged or brought to justice.

Nick Bryant has intensively investigated the Jeffrey Epstein and Ghislaine Maxwell case, as he did the Franklin case. He also published Epstein's "Black Book" on the Internet, in which many of these individuals are identified.

Nick Bryant presented on the Epstein child abuse network at the 2025 International Human Trafficking and Social Justice conference:

Title: The Legal Aberrations Involved in the Epstein Child Trafficking Network

Therefore, I will not discuss this case in depth my presentation, but I include some highlights in this handout.

Bryant summarizes the crimes of the Epstein child abuse network and the miscarriages of justice for the victims as follows:

Jeffrey Epstein trafficked underage girls for approximately 25 years. In 2005, the Palm Beach Police Department (PBPB) conducted a one-year investigation into Jeffrey Epstein's sexual abuse of minors, and garnered the statements of five underage victims. Although the Palm Beach Police Department had the on-record statements of five minors, and the supporting statements from 12 additional individuals, its investigators were aware of a reported 17 additional underage victims of Epstein. When the PBPB was in the process of indicting Epstein on five counts of unlawful sexual activity with minors, the case was wrested from it and given to a state grand jury that declared Epstein hadn't molested a single minor.

After the grand jury's decision, Michael Reiter, who was the chief of the PBPB, became very vociferous about the decision of the state grand jury, and he demanded that the U.S. attorney for the Southern District of Florida, Alexander Acosta, investigate the Epstein case. At that point, federal authorities were aware of at least 34 underage Epstein victims. However, Acosta was reportedly told that Epstein was an "intelligence" asset and to stand down. Acosta has never retracted the fact that he was told that Epstein belonged to intelligence. After federal authorities relinquished prosecuting Epstein, the state sentenced Epstein to 18 months in a county jail in 2008, and he served 13 months. He was allowed to leave the jail during the day, and he continued to traffic women and children until 2019.

In the Jeffrey Epstein case, the numerous procurers and perpetrators who were integral to Epstein and Ghislaine Maxwell's crimes against children over the course of 25 years have not been indicted. Moreover, the charges against Maxwell, which included only one count of child trafficking, were woefully inadequate and a further miscarriage of justice against the Epstein and Maxwell victims.

More recently, a report released by the Florida Department of Law Enforcement (FDLE) on May 10, 2021 superimposed an additional miscarriage of justice on the myriad of injustices that have already been inflicted on the victims of Epstein, et al. The FDLE report concluded that a Florida grand jury that didn't indict Epstein on a single count of child abuse was not guilty of malfeasance.

Failures of government agencies that are in place to protect victims of child trafficking have aided and abetted Epstein's trafficking network, making them complicit in these crimes. The media has also abrogated its responsibilities in this case.

Per Bryant's investigation, the Epstein/Maxwell child trafficking network abused victims as young as 10 years old.

At the same time that Epstein was indicted for unlawful sexual activity with a minor, the Department of Justice gave all of his co-conspirators and perpetrator-clientele given blanket immunity. It ordered a non-prosecution agreement, in violation of the 2004 Crime Victims' Rights Act (CVRA), which mandates that victims of crimes have to be informed about the adjudication of their perpetrators' cases, and they have the option of confronting them in court.

On July 8, 2019, the New York Times reported that federal authorities seized from Epstein's safe "hundreds—possibly thousands—of sexually suggestive photographs of girls who appear underage, as well as hand-labeled compact discs with titles like 'Girl pics nude,' and, with the names redacted, 'Young [Name] + [Name].'" Judging by the titles on the discs, Epstein was a purveyor of child rape materials. The government has not even acknowledged that these victims exist.

Nick Bryant formed a 501C3 non-profit, called *Epstein Justice*, an organization that is lobbying the U.S. Congress to appoint an independent congressional commission to investigate Epstein's entire sex trafficking network: <https://epsteinjustice.com>. I am on the Board of directors.

The following article delves more deeply into the Epstein case: Bryant, N. (2021, November 30). The Jeffrey Epstein Cover Up: Pedophilia, Lies, and Ghislaine Maxwell. Scheer Post. <https://scheerpost.com/2021/11/30/the-jeffrey-epstein-cover-up-pedophilia-lies-and-videotape>

Nick Bryant provides substantial evidence of corruption in the handling of the Epstein case in the following articles:

The basics: <https://epsteinjustice.com/the-epstein-scandal-explained/>

For a deeper dive:

<https://scheerpost.com/2021/11/30/the-jeffrey-epstein-cover-up-pedophilia-lies-and-videotape/>

The importance of holding the "customers" legally accountable in order to fight human trafficking is discussed in: van der Watt, M. (2024). Primary Prevention of Sex Trafficking: Time to Move the Needle on Demand Reduction. *Journal of Human Trafficking*, 10, 368 - 373.

### **Epstein Victim Virginia Giuffre**

Virginia Giuffre was a victim of the Epstein child sex trafficking ring who named Ghislaine Maxwell, Alan Dershowitz, Prince Andrew, and Jean Luc Brunel as among her sexual perpetrators when she was a minor.

On April 26, 2025, died, allegedly by suicide.

On May 8, 2025, Nick Bryant published an article: A Requiem for Virginia Giuffre: <https://nickbryantnyc.com/blog/f/a-requiem-for-virginia-giuffre>. Nick Bryant was in long-term communication with Giuffre, as co-activists.

Bryant’s article describes much of Virginia’s life, a tragic story much like that of many victims of child sexual abuse and child sex trafficking.

Bryant writes:

Virginia’s early years were fraught with abuse, despair, and dysfunction. She was molested by a family “friend” when she was seven years old. And then she had to endure a succession of foster homes. She ultimately landed on the streets when she was 14 years old, where all forms of dehumanizing abuse are inescapable. As she fought for survival on the streets, she was ensnared in the web of child sex trafficker Ron Eppinger.

Virginia was eventually ensnared in the child abuse network of Epstein and Maxwell.

I will highlight just a few of the most alarming parts of Virginia’s story.

Virginia disclosed that Epstein and Maxwell had bought a child in Thailand, and they wanted Virginia to deliver the child to them. She also wrote that: “They wanted me to have a baby for them—a baby that I would have to sign over to their custody.”

An excerpt from one of Virginia’s affidavits describes Epstein’s malignant lifestyle with underage girls:

“Epstein, Brunel, and Maxwell loved orgies with kids — that is, having sexual interactions with many young teenagers at the same time. ... Sometimes as many as ten underage girls would participate in a single orgy with them. I personally observed dozens of these orgies. The orgies happened on Epstein’s island in the U.S. Virgin Islands, in New Mexico, Palm Beach, and many other places. Most of the girls did not speak English. ... Brunel ran some kind of modeling agency and appeared to have an arrangement with the U.S. Government where he could get passports or other travel documents for young girls. He would then bring these young girls (girls ranging in age from 12 to 24) to the United States for sexual purposes and farm them out to his friends, including Epstein.”

Bryant’s article describes in some depth Virginia’s lengthy legal battles with Dershowitz. These battles ended in November, 2022, when Virginia issued a statement rescinding her accusations against him: “I now recognize I may have made a mistake in identifying Mr. Dershowitz.”

It is frightening to consider the nature of what may have caused Virginia to recant her accusations against Dershowitz after she fought him so hard for so long, in her powerful work as an activist.

Bryant’s article also references the following information about Dershowitz arguing for legalization of viewing child sexual abuse materials, quoting this article: Khalek, Rania (January 27, 2015). Israel defender Alan Dershowitz has long history of attacking sex abuse victims. *The*

*Electronic Intifada*. Link:

<https://electronicintifada.net/blogs/rania-khalek/israel-defender-alan-dershowitz-has-long-history-attacking-sex-abuse-victims> :

In 2002 — a time when, according to Jeffrey Epstein’s housekeeper, Dershowitz frequently stayed at Epstein’s Palm Beach mansion where the rape of children was taking place daily and in his presence — Dershowitz took up the cause of child pornography viewers. In his column for the magazine *Penthouse*, Dershowitz invoked the language of individual rights to argue that watching “kiddie porn” doesn’t make one a bad person and therefore should not be a punishable offense.

Any legislation that allows the demand side of production of child abuse materials, that is, filmed child sexual abuse, to grow unchecked, would exponentially increase the prevalence of child sexual abuse, when the growth of CSAM production is already exponential!

Bryant’s article also describes one of the final nails in Virginia’s coffin: The family court took Virginia’s kids from her after her ex-husband battered her and gave him temporary custody.

Bryant believes that this ongoing danger and the miscarriages of justice drove Virginia to suicide.

### **VIII. Greater Evidence of Child Abuse and Trafficking in Ritualistic Abuse Networks**

There is undeniable forensic proof of the existence and extreme depravity of the CSAM industry and other child sex trafficking, including their magnitude, brutality, the abuse of very young children, the reaping of great financial profits, significant success in concealing their operations, and CSAM production by familial and other community-level offenders and by organized crime networks. There can be no question that people commit these heinous crimes. Law enforcement routinely captures and seizes CSAMs and many child sex traffickers are successfully prosecuted.

The central distinguishing difference between abuse perpetrated within child sex trafficking, including CSAM production, and abuse perpetrated within ritualistic abuse, is that the latter includes worship, or pseudo-worship, of malevolent entities and ceremonial/ritualistic elements. Both sets of abusers thrive on cruelty, sexual sadism, power-lust, greed, and even murder.

Yet, while child sex trafficking, including CSAM production, is now a high-profile public safety concern, significant controversy has surrounded the subject of the existence of ritual abuse since the early 1990s. The reasons for reduced attention to the problem of ritualistic abuse include:

1. Psychological factors: Ritualistic abuse victims have a greatly reduced capacity to disclose their abuse to psychotherapists or to report this abuse to the authorities because their ritual abusers have systematically compartmentalized memories of this abuse into dissociated identities who are separated by amnesiac barriers from “fronting,” “normative-life” identities, that is, they are skillful in achieving psychological control, “mind control,” of their victims and their identities.

2. Physical concealment of ritualistic crimes and crime sites: Concealment methods can include confining abuse to private property, disposal of bodies in abuser-run crematoriums, and high-tech security measures. (Such measures are also used by large-scale CSAM production networks.)

3. Disinformation campaigns: Propaganda to discredit the reality of ritual abuse and abusive mind control, described next.

### **A. Disinformation Propaganda Campaigns to Discredit the Realities of Ritualistic Abuse and Abusive Mind Control**

Central to the establishment of significant public controversy about the reality of ritualistic abuse are a number of long-term, large-scale, propaganda campaigns to discredit its existence.

The False Memory Syndrome Foundation (FMSF) spearheaded these campaigns. Founded in 1992 and continuing through the early 2000s, the FMSF engaged in a widespread propaganda campaign to:

1. discredit the diagnosis of Dissociative Identity Disorder (DID),
2. discredit the idea that memories of child abuse can be dissociated (traumatic amnesia) and later recovered (recovered memories),
3. deny the existence of ritual abuse and to frame reports of such abuse as “bizarre” and as originating in Christianity-driven “moral panic” and “Satanic panic,”
4. frame the prosecution of sexual abuse and ritual abuse cases in preschools in the 1980s and 1990s as a witch-hunt narrative\*,
5. deny the existence of psychologically sophisticated abusive mind control,
6. cause people with DID and ritual abuse histories to doubt their own minds, and
7. discredit trauma therapists who treated victims as being over-zealous, pressing clients to recall and report abuse, and being financially motivated to assess for abuse.

\* These cases were researched and documented as having significant basis in Ross Cheit's *The Witch-hunt Narrative: Politics, Psychology, and the Sexual Abuse of Children* (2014).

The FMSF heavily influenced the news media in what was coined, *the memory wars*, as well as the television and film industry, denounced therapists (including myself several times) in their newsletters, and encouraged clients in trauma therapy to make licensing board complaints against their therapists and to file lawsuits against them for allegedly implanting false memories.

A series of embarrassing events (see: *Exposing Misinformation Concerning Child Sexual Abuse and Adult Survivors*, by Whitfield, Silberg, & Fink, 2002) eventually caused the FMSF to lower its profile and to eventually disband in 2019.

Whitfield, C. L., Silberg, J., & Fink, P. J. (2000). Exposing Misinformation Concerning Child Sexual Abuse and Adult Survivors. *Journal of child sexual abuse*, 9(3-4), 1–8. [https://doi.org/10.1300/J070v09n01\\_01](https://doi.org/10.1300/J070v09n01_01)

Nonetheless, campaigns to discredit the existence of ritualistic abuse and abusive mind control continue on the internet, in the popular press, and in some academic publications. Notably, for about 15 years, *The Satanic Temple*, and its subsidiary, *The Grey Faction* (<https://greyfaction.org/>) have waged an intense internet propaganda campaign to attempt to discredit the realities of dissociative disorders, ritualistic abuse, and n=mind control. This propaganda takes the form of:

1. Articles that attack the validity of: a) traumatic amnesia, b) recovered memories, c) Dissociative Identity Disorder, and d) many forms of therapy for complex trauma,
2. Online smear campaigns against therapists in the dissociative disorders field, e.g., Grey Faction’s list of “conspiracy therapists”: <https://greyfaction.org/resources/proponents/who/>,
3. Licensing board complaints against therapists treating ritual abuse survivors (the Satanic Temple made an unsuccessful effort to have my license revoked), and,
4. Efforts to stop conference presentations on ritual abuse and abusive mind control and to prevent the provision of continuing education credit for presentations on these topics.

These disinformation campaigns ignore or ridicule, the substantial evidence of the existence of ritual abuse, to be discussed in the rest of this section.

## **B. Empirical and Forensic Evidence of Ritualistic Abuse**

Any investigation into the data on ritualistic abuse soon reveals substantial empirical and forensic evidence of its existence, bringing into question the motives behind these propaganda campaigns.

In 2014, James Randal Noblitt, Ph.D., psychologist, and Pamela Noblitt, leaders in the study of ritualistic abuse, reviewed the “Empirical and Forensic Evidence of Cult and Ritualistic Abuse,” in a chapter of this title in their book, *Cult and Ritual Abuse: Narratives, Evidence, and Healing Approaches*. This chapter is available in full on my website: <https://endritualabuse.org/empirical-and-forensic-evidence-of-ritual-abuse/>

### **Research on Adult Populations**

#### **The Extreme Abuse Survey**

In 2007, a large international study of extreme abuse was conducted: *The Extreme Abuse Survey*

research series (Becker, Karriker, Overkamp, & Rutz, 2008; Becker, Karriker, Rutz, & Overkamp, 2013). This study was comprised of three online surveys:

1. The Extreme Abuse Survey (EAS): Adults who identified themselves as survivors of extreme abuse
2. The Professional Extreme Abuse Survey (P-EAS): Helping professionals who reported to have worked with at least one extreme abuse survivor
3. The Child-Extreme Abuse Survey (C-EAS): Children victimized by extreme abuse as reported by their caregivers

The results are posted here (downloaded January 2025):

<https://www.extreme-abuse-survey.org/survey.php?en=b>

And <http://endritualabuse.org/findings-from-the-2007-extreme-abuse-survey-eas-series/>

On the EAS, there were 1471 respondents from 31 different countries. Of these, 52% indicated that they had been victimized by both ritual abuse and mind control, 19% identified themselves as ritual abuse survivors, and 7% as mind control survivors. Forms of abuse indicated included:

Form of abuse	Percent
Sexual abuse by multiple perpetrators	79
Being caged	53
Starvation	48
Forced cannibalism	44
Bestiality	52
Being buried alive	45
Electroshock	50
Sensory deprivation	61
Sleep deprivation	69
Incest	70
Child pornography	52
Child prostitution	46

On the P-EAS, 451 professionals from 20 different countries responded;

86% reported at least one survivor of Satanic ritual abuse on their caseload.

The reasons they indicated for believing their clients included the following:

- significant memories of RA/MC fit logically into other aspects of the individual’s life history forming a coherent narrative (89%),
- the types of dissociated identities observed were reflective of RA/MC (86%),
- the content of creative productions (such as art, sandtray stories, music, poetry) was consistent with RA/MC (79%),
- certain physical and medical sequelae could be explained as having been a result of RA/MC (75%),
- some reports of RA/MC were based on continuous memories rather than dissociated memories (65%),
- significant memories were corroborated by the testimony of other individuals (47%), and
- the individuals presented material objects consistent with reports of RA/MC (31%).

Further, 18% of the helping professionals reported that they were RA/MC survivors themselves and all of them endorsed the statement, “The individual’s memories were consistent with my own personal memories of RA/MC” (Becker et al., 2013).

**Schröder, Nick, Richter-Appelt, & Briken Study of Organized and Ritual Child Sexual Abuse (2020)**

In 2020, a German research team (Schröder, Nick, Richter-Appelt, & Briken) conducted a survey to analyze the acts of violence and purposes that comprise “organized and ritual child sexual abuse” (ORA). Participants included:

- a) 165 individuals who identified themselves as victims of (ORA), and,
- b) 174 health care professionals who supported ORA victims. (P. 353)

Acts of violence included (p. 356):

Acts of Violence	Percent
Near-death abuse/torture	96
Isolation with sensory deprivation *	92.5
Commercial sexual exploitation *	90.7
Production of pornographic material * (CSAM)	89.7
Induction of dissociative personality states	80.4
Punishment for exit attempts	78.2
Extortion through recordings of forced violence against others	77.8

\* These reported forms of abuse were included in the findings of the *Extreme Abuse Survey*.

Victims and health care professionals described their abusers applying two forms of ideologies:

- 1) “pseudo-ideological strategies with the purpose to serve the aims of the perpetrators”, that is for practical objectives, e.g., “the justification of violence and exploitation and the maintenance of control over the victims,” e.g. power, control, group commitment, and,
- 2) true ideological beliefs, such as promises of salvation. (Schröder et al, 2020, p. 359)

Victims reporting abuse in Satanic cults reported ideological framings to include:

- “Worshipping Satan as the Deity, with the afterworld as a reward or punishment”;
- “The belief to gain power and energy through satanic rituals”; and
- “‘The Family’ is working on a better world. This is made possible by energies generated in its members and transferred to Lucifer.”

Health care professionals reported that clients described abuser ideologies to include:

- “Worshipping the Dark Force: The bright world is to be despised, the dark world is the only true world”;
- “Idealization of Satan, death and pain”, and
- “Violence (experienced and exerted) makes you strong and immortal” (p. 356).

“Another important result is, that ideologies showed a significant positive correlation to family members being involved in the perpetrator group” (P. 356).

Other reported ideologies included:

racist-fascist,  
nationalistic,  
military,  
Aryan,  
Ku-Klux-Klan,  
Freemasonry,  
Jehovah’s witness,  
Kaballah,  
Celtic,  
Teutonic,  
Shamanic, and  
Wiccan ideologies. (p. 356).

Of the 165 self-identified victims, they found that 75.2% managed to exit the ORA structures successfully. However, 25% had not exited the ORA structures successfully at the time of the survey, highlighting “the extent to which they are unable to escape their perpetrators” (p. 358).

Due to reports of forms of abuse applied by child traffickers and CSAM producers and the use of ideologies for both practical purposes and as true belief systems, the researchers suggest that:

It might rather be helpful to regard “ritual abuse” as a subtype of “organized abuse”, in which ideologies can be manifested either as true belief systems or as perpetrator strategies, in which violence is used to a greater extent, and which perpetrators more likely originate from the victim’s families. Defining ideological strategies as a subtype of organized abuse might prevent further polarization of the topic “ritual abuse” and thereby abate skepticism in society. (Schröder et al., p. 360)

This speaks to my point that given the overwhelming and incontrovertible evidence of child trafficking and CSAMs, we must recognize the reality of ritualistic abuse because it is largely inclusive of the same forms of horrific abuse, with the addition of ideological elements.

As a psychotherapist, many, if not most, ritual abused clients report being filmed in coerced sexual acts (CSAM) and being sex-trafficked for profit. In addition, victims report that many of their perpetrators involve themselves and their victims in multiple kinds of abuser networks.

### **Research on Child Populations**

Other research substantiates ritual abuse in child populations.

On the C-EAS, 264 caregivers from 19 different countries responded to at least one question.

Item	N	Yes
09. Caregiver reports child dissociates when talking or questioned about RA/MC abuse	108	84%
02. Caregiver reports that the child was used in pornography	84	52%
03. Caregiver reports that the child was used in human trafficking	83	40%
06. Child has Dissociative Identity Disorder as a possible aftereffect of RA/MC	83	74%
08. Caregiver reports child endured RA/MC in a daycare center	75	31%
31. Child verbal disclosure: Physical abuse/torture by multiple perpetrators	91	81%
38. Child verbal disclosure: Threatened with death if he/she ever told about the abuse	89	80%

Some studies look at ritual abuse in preschool settings. Others look at ritually abusive networks in the community. The following are findings on ritual abuse in preschool settings, quoted from Noblitt and Noblitt (2014):

1. Susan Kelley (1992b) compared three groups of children in day care: 35 allegedly ritualistically abused children, 32 children reportedly sexually abused, not ritualistically,

and 67 children without any claims of sexual abuse. She collected data from the abused children's parents and compared the results of children with non-ritualistic sexual abuse with ritualistic sexual abuse. She found that ritualistically abused children were more likely to report more incidents, types, and severity of abuse relative to the non-ritual sexual abuse victims. She also found that ritualistic abuse was more often associated with multiple victim, multiple perpetrator encounters. On the Child Behavior Checklist, there were more reported behavior problems and tendency toward internalizing symptoms among both groups of abused children in comparison with non-abused children, but the ritualistically abused children scored worse.

2. Jill Waterman, Robert Kelley, Mary Kay Olivieri, and Jane McCord (1993) did a six-year longitudinal study of 82 children who had made allegations of ritualistic sexual abuse (RSA) in the Manhattan Beach, California, area in comparison with 37 non-abused (NA) children and 15 non-ritualistically sexually abused (SA) children. They found that both the RSA and SA group reported intrusive and highly intrusive sexual abuse. Additionally, the RSA group, but not the SA group, reported "terrorizing acts that included killing of animals, death threats to the children or their families, sadistic acts and physical abuse, and ritualistic acts that included Satanic activities" (p. 64). Recantations occurred in 25% of the RSA and 23% of the SA children... even though the perpetrator in the SA group had given a detailed confession. However, 88% of the RSA group that recanted later redisclosed abuse. Children alleging RSA had more severe symptoms than SA children: significantly more PTSD, depression, and aggressive behaviors, and less improvement over time in comparison with the SA group. PTSD criteria were met for 80% of their sample of ritualistically sexually abused children as compared with 35.7% of the non-ritualistically sexually abused children.

3. A case involving 172 children who made disclosures in day care in southwest Michigan was investigated (Bybee & Mowbray, 1993; Faller, 1994). Kathleen Faller gathered data from her clinical interviews with 18 of the children, and Bybee and Mowbray reviewed the cases of 106 children... Bybee and Mowbray identified 62 (58%) children who disclosed that they had been victimized and 53 (50%) children who reportedly observed others being abused, with 92% of the children who were observed being abused also disclosing that they had been abused.... [C]hildren reported experiencing and observing acts of fondling, penetration, oral sex, sex with children, penetration of an adult, threats of harm, being hit or hurt, being given medicine or bad food, bestiality, and ritual acts. ... Faller found "sadistic acts (100%), threats of harm and death to children and their family members (100%), use of drugs (56%), confinement (44.4%) and animal killings or injury (22%)" (p. 22)... and... significantly "higher percentages of ritually abused children were reported to have sexual acting out problems, sleep problems, emotional problems, behavior problems and phobias" (p. 22).

4. Pamela Hudson (1991) assessed 24 children in a case of alleged ritual abuse at a Fort Bragg day care center in California. She reported that 11 children alleged being molested

by other children and 11 reported being molested by strangers, day care workers, or a parent. Hudson identified 16 forms of abuse: (1) being locked in a cage or “jail”; (2) being told that their parents, pets, or younger siblings would be killed if they told anyone of the abuse; (3) being buried in the ground in coffins which they called “boxes”; (4) being held underwater; (5) being threatened with guns and knives; (6) being injected with needles, bled, drugged; (7) being photographed during the abuse; (8) being tied upside down over a “star,” hung from a pole or hook, burned with candles; (9) perpetrators wearing black robes, masks; (10) having participated in a mock marriage; (11) being defecated and urinated upon; (12) having observed animals killed; (13) having observed torture or molestation of other children; (14) having seen children and babies killed (reported by four children); (15) having blood poured on their heads; and (16) being taken to churches, other day care settings, people’s homes, and graveyards for the ritual abuse.

To control for the possible contagion effects that might have occurred in her Fort Bragg case, Hudson conducted a telephone interview of 10 other families in different locations in the United States where ritual abuse had been reported. All but two were day care cases. She collected data from these interviews, which she combined with her Fort Bragg data. Thus, she had a total of 11 cases. The following abuses and corroboration were reported:

- 1) confinement in cage ( $n = 10$ );
- 2) threats ( $n = 11$ );
- 3) live burial in caskets, coffins, boxes ( $n = 6$ );
- 4) water torture ( $n = 7$ );
- 5) threats with guns or knives ( $n = 10$ );
- 6) drug injections ( $n = 10$ );
- 7) filming and still photography ( $n = 11$ );
- 8) bondage, locked in closets, hung by feet or wrists, spread-eagled over pentagrams;
- 9) tied onto upside-down crosses ( $n = 7$ );
- 10) abusers wearing masks and robes, carrying candles ( $n = 11$ );
- 11) mock marriages ( $n = 6$ );
- 12) defecation, urination, forcible ingestion of human wastes ( $n = 10$ );
- 13) witnessing animals tortured and killed ( $n = 10$ );
- 14) fake operations ( $n = 6$ );
- 15) children’s descriptions of the torture and sexual assault of themselves or others ( $n = 10$ );
- 16) evidential medical examinations: findings commensurate with sexual assault ( $n = 11$ );
- 17) babies, small children killed, carved up, and parts eaten ( $n = 9$ );
- 18) transportation elsewhere for abuse; various methods of transport ( $n = 10$ ); and
- 19) sexual assault and terrorizing in churches, graveyards, other day care centers ( $n = 10$ ).

The following findings from Noblitt and Noblitt (2014) are on “community-based ritual abuse” of children. Kathleen Faller defined this as “those whose membership is contemporary and often

made up of persons of various ages—children, adolescents, and adults in a particular community” (p. 24).

1. Snow and Sorenson (1990) wrote about 39 children who were abused in five neighbor-based cults in Utah. In four of the five cults, there were incidents of intrafamilial incest, perpetration by adolescents, and features of an adult sex ring. No adolescent perpetration was found in the fifth group. Also reported was forced sexual behavior, threats of violence, and multiple perpetrators and victims. At least two-thirds of the children described, multiple locations of abuse, pornography, ingestion or other use of excrement, the espousal of satanic beliefs, magical spells and use of occult paraphernalia, animal mutilation or killing, and the use of drugs. The abusers were generally viewed as respected members of the community, and many were religious leaders. Two of the accused adult perpetrators were convicted, and two adolescents pled guilty.

2. Jonker and Jonker-Bakker (1991, 1997) reported a case of the ritual abuse of children in the Netherlands. The authors described the allegations and their observations regarding this case in Oude Pekela, a small town of 8,000 inhabitants in northeastern Netherlands near the German border. Jonker and Jonker-Bakker initially surveyed the families of 90 involved children six to eight weeks after the initial disclosures. They gathered additional data from the families of 87 of these children at 2 ½ and 7-year intervals after the first outcries had been made. They compared their later findings with clinical information that antedated the abuse and with initial survey results. They found that 20% of the children made spontaneous disclosures. The list of reported abuses included the following elements: sexual abuse, warnings to be silent, taking photographs, making videotapes, tying up children, keeping children in extreme darkness, being scratched, kicked, beaten, drugged, animals being present, animals being tortured and killed, babies being involved, babies being killed, adults being killed, chanting, forced eating of excrement or semen, and supernatural powers being claimed ... In this case, two arrests were made but there were no convictions. However, Jonker and Jonker-Bakker noted that the chief of the police investigation team believed that 50% of the 64 children investigated by the police “were certainly involved.” (p. 545). A statement by the district attorney on January 21, 1988, is cited:

A total number of 98 children, 3 to 11 years old were interviewed. The statements of 62 children were used in the further investigation. Finally 48 statements of children remained, speaking of clear sexual abuse, where they had either submitted to or been forced to perform on themselves or others. Many of the children told about strong lights, lamps on poles, and seeing each other on TV. The justice ministry concluded that it was nearly sure that photographs were taken of the children. Against 18 children violence was used. The child abuse took place over a period of several months. The justice Ministry thinks that four people, two men and two women, were involved in the sexual abuse. (quoted by Myers, 1994, and cited by Jonker & Jonker-Bakker, 1997, p. 541)

3. Kathleen Faller (1994) cited a study of intergenerational ritual abuse of children by Susan Kelley (1992a). This paper, *Ritualistic Abuse: Recognition, Impact, and Current Controversy*, was presented by Kelley at the San Diego Conference on Responding to Child Maltreatment in January 1992. Kelley investigated reports of 26 children from 14 families. The accused abusers were parents, grandparents, great-grandparents, uncles, aunts, cousins, and siblings. Similar to other reports, a significant number of abusers were female (45%). “Sixty-one percent of children were abused by two generations of older relatives, and 57% of cases involved extrafamilial as well as intrafamilial offenders” (Faller, 1994, p. 25). Reported abuses included “terrorizing threats and acts (89%), including having spiders or other insects placed on them, death threats (77%), making pornography (81%), threats with supernatural powers (89%), satanic reference (92%), animal killings (54%), being made to ingest drugs (92%), songs and chants (69%), and being made to ingest or touch excrement (85%)” (p. 25). Scores on the CBCL were in the clinical range for 73% of the children on total problems, 81% on internalizing, and 50% on externalizing scales.

### **C. Cases with Criminal Convictions with Elements of Ritualistic Practices**

On July 3, 2025, a comprehensive report on ritual abuse, including discussion of many forensic findings, was published to the internet by the Hydrant Programme in the United Kingdom:

Organised ritual abuse and its wider context: Degradation, deception and disavowal: A research review and analysis by Dr Elly Hanson

Link: <https://www.hydrantprogramme.co.uk/assets/NPCC-Organised-ritual-abuse-and-its-wider-context-Degradation-deception-and-disavowal-July-2025-v2.pdf>

This report was commissioned by the National Police Chiefs’ Council in the United Kingdom and was published jointly by *The National Association for People Abused as Children (NAPAC)*: <https://napac.org.uk> and *The Hydrant Programme*: <https://www.hydrantprogramme.co.uk>.

This report is a critical document in demonstrating the reality of ritual abuse and the false narratives and “discourse of disbelief” that have kept this abuse from being widely understood.

This report references 14 cases in the United Kingdom (UK) with convictions of child sexual abuse that include ritualistic practices:

“In the UK, there have been at least 14 cases in which people have been convicted of sexually abusing children and their use of ritualistic practices in this process was widely acknowledged, either within the criminal or family courts. [6] Nine of these involved more than one perpetrator.” (Hanson, 2025, p. 6)

However, Hanson explains that these cases reflect only the tip of the “iceberg” of these crimes:

Across all forms of crime, convictions reflect ‘the tip of the iceberg’ – for every crime ending in conviction, there are many more that do not (termed ‘the dark figure’). And for

crimes of sexual abuse, the proportions of undetected and unconvicted offending are even greater – reflective of the crime leaving little evidence beyond the victim’s testimony, and victims often being too fearful, ashamed, intimidated, hopeless, or full of self-blame to report to police or child protection services (Morrison, Bruce & Wilson, 2018; Patterson, Greeson & Campbell, 2009; Scurich & John, 2019; Somer & Szwarcberg, 2001). When we consider abuse involving multiple offenders acting in concert to terrorise children, this picture gets even bleaker – the barriers to reporting growing in number and size, so that very few victims report. And the few that do are often met with responses that are inadequate at best, and harmful at worst (all this unpacked below). In addition, prosecutors may be uninterested in ritualistic elements of the abuse, and so omit them from the criminal case, given their focus on the core crimes of rape and sexual assault, and the risk that the ritual aspects prove an unhelpful distraction, inviting fascinated horror and kneejerk disbelief (Scott, 2001).

In short, the cases discussed in this section are indicative of a much wider picture of organised and/or ritualistic child abuse, and they are unlikely to be fully representative of it (for example, those cases that get to court are likely to involve less effective control of victims than those that do not). (Hanson, 2025, p. 9)

Some of the offenders in these UK cases with criminal convictions appear to be self-styled abusers claiming to be “a black witch,” “Lucifer,” “a high priest,” etc., who used such identities and ritualistic symbols to abuse and terrorize children. Other cases involved multiple extended familial offenders who may have passed down their abusive practices inter-generationally. They may have been “true believers” in ideologies involving worship of destructive deities. Practices described include, devil worship, summoning the devil, spirit possession, black magic ceremonies, “a satanic wedding ceremony,” pentagrams, inverted crosses, altar knives, black magic altars and shrines,” evil spells, abusers dressed in capes, hooded robes, and devil masks.

Tim Tate (1991), in his comprehensive book, *Children for the Devil: Ritual abuse and Satanic Crime*, provides additional detail on many of the cases cited by Hanson, and other cases as well.

These fourteen cases are as follows, followed by additional significant cases:

#### UK. Case 1: **Malcolm and Susan Smith, and Albert and Carolee Hickman**

Hanson (2025) writes of this case:

“In 1982, couple Malcolm and Susan Smith together with Susan’s sister and husband, Albert and Carole Hickman, were convicted for crimes relating to the sexual abuse of four children ranging in age from one to 15 years old. Malcolm Smith convinced the children he was ‘Lucifer’, and this was said to be ‘largely a subterfuge by which children and young girls were ensnared’ (The Guardian, 1982). He carved an inverted cross on one child’s abdomen, inserted a lit candle into her anus and vagina, and branded her genitals with a hot altar knife. In 2015, Albert and Carolee Hickman were convicted for further

ritualistic sexual abuse after a woman came forward after she recovered memories of this abuse during counselling for bereavement in 2011. The court heard how Carole Hickman convinced the girl she was part of a powerful witches' coven and held her down whilst her husband raped her. She used threats of black magic and cut the victim with a knife. The girl had reported the abuse to the police when it happened, but her claims were dismissed by officers who judged a married woman to be incapable of such horrors.” (Hanson, 2025, p. 6)

From: The Guardian (1982). Man who played Lucifer gets 14 years.

Link: <https://www.newspapers.com/article/the-guardian-satanic-abuse/25482811/>

Full Guardian 1982 article:

Man who played Lucifer gets fourteen years

A MAN who saw himself as the Devil incarnate and his two former Salvation Army “handmaidens” ensnared children and young girls into their black magic ring for sex, a court was told yesterday.

Mr. Desmond Fennell, QC, prosecuting, at Northampton Crown Court, said that one 15-year-old girl was so totally mesmerised by "Lucifer" that she did whatever she was told.

Mr. Justice Drake told the court that even people with liberal ideas would be revolted, disgusted and horrified by what the court heard. He gaoled [jailed] the "devil", Malcolm Smith, 28, for 14 years.

His two handmaidens, Salvation Army members Susan Smith, 23, and her sister Carole Hickman, 32, were sent to prison for two and five years respectively. Smith's brother-in-law, Albert Hickman, 34, was sentenced to 10 years. Mr Fennell told the court that Malcolm Smith cast himself in the role of Lucifer with powers of evil, and together he and his wife, Susan, sister-in-law Carole Hickman practised black magic and devil worship.

But this was largely a subterfuge, by which children and young girls were ensnared into the whole evil business.

It was the Crown's case that the children were procured by the two sisters, said Mr Fennell.

Malcolm Smith, of Sutton Hill, Telford, Shropshire, pleaded guilty to unlawful sexual intercourse, rape, indecent assault and a serious sexual offence. Susan Smith admitted aiding and abetting unlawful sexual intercourse and indecent assault.

Carole Hickman pleaded guilty to aiding and abetting rape by Smith, indecent assault and aiding and abetting her husband to commit a serious sexual offence.

Albert Hickman pleaded guilty to indecent assault, indecency with a child and another serious sexual offence.

Mr Fennell told the court that some time, during 1979, Mrs Hickman began to get involved in the study of black magic and devil worship.

She apparently deluded herself into believing that she had powers of a black witch, and began to collect the various trappings involved in devil worship and kept them in a red suitcase.

According to Mrs Hickman, she had already taken part in a ceremony giving over her life to Lucifer and denouncing God.

Shortly afterwards, in that capacity, she conducted a satanic wedding ceremony for her sister and brother-in-law.

Mr Smith saw himself as Lucifer, which gave him command over all those involved. Mrs Smith and Mrs Hickman became his handmaidens, said Mr. Fennell.

"Being Lucifer, he could, in effect, have his pleasure with any of the women concerned and he did that by the simple device of saying that he was conferring on them his satanic powers and then proceeding to have his pleasure by way of sexual intercourse with them."

From: Mullin, G. (2015). Black magic couple who sucked 11-year-old's blood before husband repeatedly raped her are jailed for total of 34 years. The Daily Mail, January 22.  
Link: <https://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-2922055/Black-magic-couple-sucked-11-year-old-s-blood-husband-repeatedly-raped-jailed-total-34-years.html>

Full article:

Black magic couple who sucked 11-year-old's blood before husband repeatedly raped her are jailed for total of 34 years

- Carolee Hickman, 64, forced girl to have sex with her husband Albert, 65
- Court heard she pinned down girl's arms as he took part in 'terrible rape'
- Mrs Hickman used 'bejewelled knife' to cut girl's thumb and suck blood
- She also threatened to kill her mother, who was suffering from cancer
- Victim, now in her 50s, repressed memories until 2011 during counselling
- Mrs Hickman given 17 years for indecent assault, aiding and abetting rape
- Her husband sentenced to 17 years in prison for raping girl in the 1970s

Carolee Hickman (left) and her husband Albert (right) have been jailed for a total of 34 years

A couple who used 'black magic' to convince an 11-year-old girl to take part in sex sessions where they sucked her blood have been jailed for 34 years.

Carolee Hickman, 64, from St Athan, South Wales, told the schoolgirl that she was part of a powerful witches' coven before forcing her to have sex with her husband Albert, 65.

The victim had repressed memories of the abuse, which took place between 1972 and 1975, until they came back during counselling for bereavement and depression in 2011.

She told Cardiff Crown Court last month that Mrs Hickman had a special 'bejewelled knife', which she used to cut the young girl's thumb before sucking her blood.

The court heard the couple invited the teenage girl into their house where they discussed black magic and did tarot card readings with her.

Mrs Hickman would threaten to kill her mother, who was suffering from cancer at the time, with a curse.

The Hickman's then assaulted the girl every week for almost a year, and together planned to rape the young victim.

Mrs Hickman pinned her arms above her head and took 'delight in the terrible, terrible rape' carried out by her husband.

The victim, who cannot be identified, said the horror of what happened to her while at school had been buried for 40 years - before her memories resurfaced.

Now in her 50s, she said in an impact statement: '42-years-ago a little girl met two evil people who took advantage of her.

'My life has been destroyed at their hands.'

The woman said she went to the Hickman's, who now live in Shrewsbury, Shropshire, house aged 11 while skipping school with friends.

The couple allegedly gave the girl and her friends 'pagan crosses' to wear before plying them with cigarettes and alcohol.

She told a trial: 'Carolee said she was a witch and would come and get me and would make my mother ill - she even said she could kill my mother if she wanted to.

'She had a knife with a jewelled handle kept in a wooden box with carvings on the top. She cut my hand and sucked the blood out of it.

'There were tarot cards she used to tell our fortunes and she even had a black cape.'

The girl tried to report the Hickmans to police following the sex attack at their home near Cardiff but officers dismissed her claims, taking the view that a married woman would not have been capable of doing what Mrs Hickman had.

Passing sentence at Merthyr Tydfil Crown Court today, Judge Daniel William said: 'You were a couple united by a deep seated and overwhelming abuse of children.

'You groomed her and gained her trust, you told her you had supernatural powers and that she was the "chosen one" and you put the fear of god into her.

'It was a specific targeting of a vulnerable victim and threats were made which petrified her.'

Hickman, who used to work as an engineer for the RAF, was given a 17-year sentence and his wife was found guilty of indecent assault and aiding and abetting rape and given a matching 17 years.

The court heard that Mr Hickman had raped a young girl in 1982 after leaving the RAF and joining the Fire Service and had been jailed for 10 years for the crime.

The jury was also told Mrs Hickman was jailed for five years in 1982 after admitting holding down a child while she was raped as part of 'devil worship' which required a virgin girl.

Judge Williams said of the victim: 'Your claims were dismissed without proper investigation.

'Had you been taken seriously it may have prevented the abuse which the Hickmans carried out in the 1980s.'

The judge also said the woman had shown tremendous courage in coming forward and giving evidence in the Hickmans' trial.

## UK. Case 2: **Shaun Wilding**

See: The Birmingham Evening Mail (November 17, 1986). Man used witchcraft to lure boys. The Birmingham Evening Mail, November 27<sup>th</sup>.

Full article:

Man Used Witchcraft to Lure Boys. the Birmingham Evening Mail

A child molester used black magic and witchcraft for sex when he tricked boys to believe he was the devil who could speak with voices of the dead, a court heard.

At Stafford Crowne Court today Shaun Wilding (21) was jailed for three and a half years for what Mr Justice French called a "deliberate and skilful seduction and corruption."

Wilding, of Whitburn Close, Pendeford, Wolverhampton, pleaded guilty to five serious sex offences with boys aged between 14 and 16.

Mr Malcolm Morse, prosecuting, said that at Wolverhampton Crowne Court in August last year Wilding was placed on probation for three years for offences of indecency with boys.

Mr Morse said today that Wilding performed conjuring tricks to impress the boys when he committed offences after he was placed on probation.

"He said he was a medium and that he could bring spirits he describes as angels to inhabit his body," said Mr Morse.

He pretended to be possessed by a girl spirit when he wanted sex with boys.

Wilding set up a black magic shrine and "he dressed in a cape summoning the devil to keep them amenable to what he wanted to do."

Some boys complained to the police and one later died from viral pneumonia.

Tim Tate (1991), in his comprehensive book that details many of the criminal cases of ritual abuse: *Children for the devil: Ritual abuse and Satanic crime*, adds the following:

When the surviving children summoned up enough courage to go to the police, detectives told them the rituals were no more than 'hocus pocus'. Wilding disagreed: he was quite prepared to admit charges of gross indecency with the boys, but angry that his chosen religion should be dismissed so lightly. (Tate, 1991, p. 115)

## UK. Case 3: **Brian Williams**

See: Evison, S. (1987). Kids who became slaves of sex satan. *The People*, July 26<sup>th</sup>.

Full article:

Kids who became slaves of sex satan

Devil-worshipping Brian Williams forced teenagers into his evil web of lust by threatening to kill them with black magic spells.

As Williams began an 11-year jail sentence last week for a string of sex offences against under-16s, two of them told of their sickening ordeal at the hands of the man who called his trembling victims "Satan's slaves".

The two – who cannot be named – revealed how Williams, 47, a father of four:

- Plied youngsters – some only 13 – with drugs and booze before beginning his bizarre black magic rituals.
- Forced them to perform sordid sex acts, including lesbian and homosexual lovemaking, while he watched.
- Told girls who caught VD from him that they had been made "unclean" by the devil.

Such was the East London's monster's power that both girls continue to believe that he can cast an evil spell on them from his prison cell.

Petrified

The girls – now 16 – claim that Williams corrupted more than 15 youngsters, many still too petrified to admit their entrapment.

One girl revealed: "He was very fat and usually stank. I was terrified of him. He said if I didn't do what he wanted he would cast a spell to kill my baby brother.

"He said he was the devil in disguise and started out by making us take part in black magic ceremonies.

"We had to cut ourselves with razors and draw pentagrams with blood. He used to give us cannabis and vodka first.

"He asked me to take my clothes off and touch another girl while he watched. He told us what to do to turn each other on.

"If you cried or refused to go along with what he wanted, he would slap you or say he could make one of his disciples kill you.

The other girl said: "The first time he forced me into sex, I was 12-year-old. He told me he was the devil in disguise and that my body belonged to him.

The girls added: "It sounds very stupid now but we were all trapped in his clutches. He was more

frightening than Jack the Ripper.”

#### UK. Case 4: **Hazel Paul and others**

Tim Tate (1991), in his book: *Children for the devil: Ritual abuse and Satanic crime*, describes the Hazel Paul case as follows:

At the Old Bailey on 22 July 1988 Hazel Paul, twenty-eight years old and with three children of her own, was found guilty of falsely imprisoning a fifteen-year-old girl and causing or inflicting on her grievous bodily harm. Paul also hypnotised the girl and then encouraged a male friend to sexually assault her. The jury heard a fifteen-year-old boy describe how Paul had ordered him to cut and carve the girl during rituals which also involved placing lighted candles on or around the victim's vagina. Paul and three other defendants were given prison sentences of between five years and three months. Although the prosecution drew attention to the overtly satanic rituals, these were described as mere dabbling with the occult. (Tate, p. 116)

#### UK. Case 5: **The ‘T’ family**

See: Donnelly, T. & Stewart, I. (1989). Boy’s nightmares that led to trial. Evening Post, January 19th. This is a lengthy article, so I will include only portions:

A TOP Notts policeman said today the child abuse case was “the largest single investigation of its kind mounted in this country.”

Det. Chief Supt Bob Wood, head of the county CID, added: “It tested to the limit the investigative procedures and skills of police officers.”

And he added: “I cannot praise too highly the spirit of cooperation between police officers and social services in what has been a very difficult and complex case involving widespread sexual abuse of the most repugnant and degrading nature.

It began with a little boy’s nightmares.

Night after night, he would wake up, screaming and sobbing, to be held in the arms of his loving foster parents.

And then the awful truth began to emerge. These were not dreams – these were memories.

The boy was only three and was remembering the degradation and sexual abuse at the hands of the only people he had to trust.

They were adults and members of his own family. They even included his grandfather. [and two of his sons and a daughter, parents of the children].

Even experienced policemen and social workers were not prepared for catalogue of evil they were about to unfold.

Sexual abuse of little boys and girls was commonplace.

And with one exception, all the adults belonged to the same extended family.

...

Eight members of the family – and a family friend – appeared before the court and admitted abusing 12 children.

...

One child spoke of “witch parties” but Mr Joyce and the Crown would not be bringing in any element of Satanism.

“There is evidence of certain costumes being destroyed,” he said.

...

“At parties, said Mr Joyce, none of the children offended against was over the age of eight.

...

And today the evil grandfather was beginning a ten-year sentence.

...

One foster-parent said: The children are becoming anorexic and suicidal. It is awful.

Also: Daily Post, July 4th. Daily Post (1998). Boy, 15, ‘feared satan sex accused’. Daily Post, July 20th. [I am unable to locate this article on the internet]

## UK. Case 6: **Reginald Harris**

See: Rees, G. (1990). ‘Devil disciple’ jailed after sex with teenagers. Western Daily Press, August 9th.

Full article:

‘Devil disciple’ jailed after sex with teenagers

Self-styled Satanist Reginald Harris made sex slaves of two young schoolgirls after snaring them in his fantasy world of evil sorcery, a court heard yesterday.

The retired lorry driver, aged 65, seduced them into his bed by posing as a disciple of the Devil, with demonic powers.

He christened himself the High Priest Raymondo and told the spellbound sisters, age 13 and 15, he could destroy people with his black magic arts.

Tricks.

Respectable white-haired Harris claimed to run a coven from his council flat in Bromyard, Herefordshire, worshipping the spirit Santanus.

He rigged his home with bizarre tricks to demonstrate his dark powers.

But yesterday his world of sick wizardry melted into grim reality as Judge Roy Ward jailed him for two-and-a-half years at Worcester Crown Court after he admitted charges of unlawful sex and arson.

Harris, of Meadow Court, Bromyard, corrupted the girls into his bed after duping them with his bogus magic, the court heard.

He made plates and pictures rattle on the walls of his home by tugging on a hidden wire, and made candles explode into flame with match heads.

Harris taped his sex sessions with the girls and meticulously logged his kinky encounters in a diary, and Mr Malcolm Morse, prosecuting.

But the court heard Harris's sick spell was broken as the girl developed relationships with other men.

He penned an entry in his diary saying he had already killed two people, adding: "I might have to kill her. It is my job."

The court heard in September last year he went to the girls' home and started a fire as she slept in her bed. She managed to escape with her sister as Harris fled.

He was arrested after they revealed his secret double life to police.

Tim Tate (1991), in his book: *Children for the devil: Ritual abuse and Satanic crime*, describes the Hazel Paul case as follows:

[Reginald] Harris, a sixty-five-year-old pensioner, was jailed for two and a half years after admitting just two specimen charges of unlawful sexual intercourse with a fifteen-year-old girl and her younger sister. By admitting the sample offences Harris avoided a full public airing of the motive behind the abuse: satanism. The few details of Harris's rituals revealed in open court were dismissed by Judge Roy Ward when he pronounced sentence. 'You took the trust and affection of these girls to seduce and corrupt them. You aggravated the matter by seeking to obtain dominance of their minds by the pretence of witchcraft or black magic to continue gratifying your desires.' [11] But Judge Ward's assumption that Harris's satanism was mere play-acting was based on very little evidence. By pleading guilty Harris had avoided a full investigation into the extent and implications of his rituals. Nonetheless, the limited information obtained by detectives suggests genuine satanic ritual abuse rather than the pseudo-ritualistic category defined by the American academic David Finkelhor in Chapter 1. Harris told his victims that they were being abused in a group devoted not to a generic or loosely identified devil, but to the particular satanic pseudonym - Santanus. This alone should have indicated a certain seriousness in his rituals. Additionally, Harris forced the elder girl to go through a formal

and ceremonial 'marriage' contract within the group. This, too, is indicative of genuine ritual practice rather than play-acting intended to frighten children into submission. The final clue was Harris's attempt to terrorise the elder girl back into the group by setting fire to her home: while 'ordinary', non-satanic abusers may threaten their victims with violence or even death, it is rare for them to carry out premeditated arson. Such behaviour is indicative of a deeper underlying motive. (p. 117 - 118)

#### UK. Case 7: **A Case in Liverpool**

See: Daily Post (1992). Satanist uncle's terror rape of girl, 10.

Full article:

Satanist uncle's terror rape of girl, 10

A Satanist who subjected a young girl to two years of sexual terror, making her pregnant when she was only 12, was jailed for 12 years yesterday.

The man had pleaded not guilty to three specimen rape charge.

At Liverpool Crown Court, Judge Denis Clark told the Wirral man, the girl's great-uncle: "Your fascination with the occult, or devil worship, played a part in impelling you toward this quite evil behavior.

"You desecrated a 10-year-old virgin. Society abhors sexual abuse of children and the sentence must reflect that abhorrence and disgust."

The court heard how the man had raped the girl two or three times a week in a bedroom above his locked "black magic room" in which he kept books about the Devil.

He had threatened to rape the girl's young sister if she told anyone.

When the baby had been born, she had been so afraid of her great-uncle that she had lied to the police, telling them that the birth was the result of having been raped by a boy in the park.

Judge Clark told the man: "The sentence is meant to be a deterrent and dire warning to others who might be tempted as you were and bring some reassurance to children, particularly those who are especially vulnerable."

David Aubrey, prosecuting, had told the jury that the girl, now 16, had moved into her great-uncle's home when she was 10 and that within a fortnight he had begun raping her two or three times a week.

Even when questioned by social and welfare workers following the birth of her son, she had still been so afraid of her great-uncle that she had pretended nothing was wrong.

In fact, he had been raping her regularly for two years.

## UK. Case 8: **Michael Horgan**

See: McMullan, P. & Revell Walton, A. (1999). High priest of evil set free to prey on children. News of The World. [I am unable to locate this article on the internet]

Hanson writes:

“In 1998, the daughter and stepson of a convicted sex offender, Michael Horgan, came forward to speak out in detail about the abuse that he had subjected them to, in protest at him being released after having served only half of his ten-year sentence (McMullan & Revell Walton, 1999). (Hanson, 2025, p. 6)

He had been prosecuted alongside five others in 1992 for the organised, ritualistic abuse of several children, the youngest being two, yet media attention appears to have been scant at that time. Philomena, his daughter, shared with the News of the World how he and other men had taken her and her stepbrother to a local moor regularly where they were sexually abused together with other children, with ceremonies, crosses, chains, whips, and a snake used in the process. She also described her father building a ‘black magic altar’ in their attic, tying the children’s hands and hanging them from hooks before they were then sexually assaulted by him and others. Her stepbrother, Michael, also shared how his stepfather had ‘tied me and my mate together and made us do things to each other while his friends watched’ and that when he was older, his stepfather ‘and his mates would take me to the park and sell me to men’.” (Hanson, 2025, p. 7)

## UK. Case 9: **A case in Ealing**

See: The Birmingham Post (1993). Sex monsters sent to jail: Mother was one of four involved in incestuous orgies. The Birmingham Post, June 30<sup>th</sup>.

Full article:

Sex monsters sent to jail: Mother was one of four involved in incestuous orgies.

A monster who raped and assaulted seven boys and girls in his family, was jailed for life at the Old Bailey yesterday.

His 31-year-old brother-in-law was sentenced to 12 years for the incestuous orgies, and the children’s grandfather (67) to four years.

The mother in the extended family which committed “inter-generational sexual abuse” was jailed for 18 months for indecent assault and cruelty.

Judge Brian Capstick told all four: “This is about as dreadful a case as I have even encountered.”

He said they inflicted temporary physical harm and long-term mental damage on the children.

Jailing the 41-year-old for life, the judge described him as “a monster. You raped, assaulted, and bugged very young children.”

He told the other son-in-law: “You took part in what your own counsel described as a series of orgies and actually raped a girl aged between four and five on a number of occasions.”

The four, all members of an extended family related either by blood or marriage with each other and the victims, were variously convicted of rape, indecent assault, child cruelty and other sexual offences.

The specimen charges covered repeated abuse from 1978 to 1989. The four all denied guilt.

The jury had heard one girl was so neglected she was known as Cinderella.

She was forced to do household chores, was barely fed, inadequately clothed and her mother made her walk the streets in her nightdress for cigarette ends.

Cinderella was sexually abused by her step-father, the 31-year-old, and her grandfather.

The girl, who was dirty, smelly, had unkempt hair and rotting teeth, was transformed when she went to live with her real father, Mrs Linda Stern QC, prosecuting, had told the court.

Cinderella’s mother (29), often drunk, was present when other children were abused and forced to watch obscene videos, and she joined in when her niece was indecently assaulted.

Mrs. Stern said the 41-year-old used to urinate on the children’s beds so she had an excuse to beat them.

He and the other son-in-law and grandfather took it in turns to have sex with the girls.

The grandfather, who has already served a 12-month jail sentence for indecently assaulting another grandchild, was convicted of rape and indecent assault.

The 41-year-old, with a long list of previous convictions, was convicted of rape, child cruelty, indecent assault and other offences on boys and girls. The 31-year-old was convicted of rape, indecency, and child cruelty.

The mother was found guilty of cruelty to her daughter and indecently assaulting her niece.

The men were acquitted of sexually abusing one of the girls in what she described as “a devil church” in Northolt west London.

Miss Helena Kennedy, QC, for the 31-year-old, had told the court that the men had entered into a family of inter-generational sexual abuse.”

He was a follower and not a leader and the whole extended family existed in emotional and physical poverty, she told the court.

## UK. Case 10: A case in Swansea

Hanson (2025) writes:

In 1992, an extensive investigation was launched in Wales [Pembrokeshire, west Wales] following a ten-year-old boy's disclosures to his foster carers of sexual abuse of himself and other children by his father and other adults. Other children corroborated his allegations, leading to a trial of 12 individuals, of whom six were convicted. The jury heard that children aged from two years old upwards were sexually abused in isolated barns and sheds in Pembrokeshire and subjected to a terrifying mix of violence, threat and ritualistic practices, including a boy having a shot gun fired at him and being thrown out of a boat into the sea; children being tied up and knives put to their throats; and goats and chickens being slaughtered and their blood poured on gravestones prior to rapes.”  
(Hanson, p. 7)

Child Sex Gang is Jailed for 45 Years, The Independent, Thursday 30 June 1994  
From: <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/child-sex-gang-is-jailed-for-45-years-1426007.html>:

Full article:

Child Sex Gang is Jailed for 45 Years, The Independent, Thursday 30 June 1994

FIVE members of a paedophile gang were jailed for a total of 45 years yesterday for conspiring to sexually abuse young children.

During the nine-month trial at Swansea Crown Court, the jury was told that the abuse started within families but went on to involve group sex sessions with other paedophiles.

The network sexually assaulted boys and girls in Pembrokeshire barns and on beaches.

Some of the 10 children who gave evidence by videoed interviews and closed circuit television link described how knives and a shotgun were produced to frighten them into silence.

The ringleader of the network, who can only be named by his initials, DD, was given 15 years, the heaviest sentence.

One 10-year-old boy had told how his father and another man abused him in a boat and dropped him into the sea a mile offshore. The adults then circled around him while he was told he would be left in the water next time if he ever spoke about what happened.

Sentencing the group, Mr Justice Kay said the victims were 'a particularly damaged set of children' who will suffer for the rest of their lives from their ordeals.

None of the paedophile ring can be identified in order to protect children involved in the case.

A dozen children are still in council care; their future will be decided by the civil courts.

The judge told the five men: 'There was no evidence of people dressed in long wigs and capes,

abusing children. I am satisfied there was no ritual abuse, but that simply carried out for your own perverted gratification.'

DD, 41, was convicted of four counts of conspiracy and two further counts of gross indecency involving a three-year-old girl.

JE, 33, who was also convicted on four conspiracy charges, was jailed for 11 years. His brother, ME, 34, who was convicted on two conspiracy charges, was jailed for seven years.

PJ, 35, who was convicted of two conspiracy charges and was also jailed for seven years. The youngest paedophile, WC, 24, was jailed for five years on four counts of conspiracy. The judge said there was 'sad evidence' that he had graduated from being a victim of abuse, having been introduced to the paedophile ring as a teenager.

A sixth man, SS, 37, who was cleared of taking part in the paedophile conspiracy, was jailed for eight years for committing serious sexual assaults on his two sons.

Also see: The Guardian, June 13th. The Guardian (1994). Five convicted in paedophile ring case. [I am unable to locate a copy of this article on the internet]

See: The Guardian, November 9th. The Guardian (1994). Five convicted in paedophile ring case. [I am unable to locate this article on the internet]

See: <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/five-men-face-jail-terms-for-child-sex-abuse-paedophiles-convicted-after-pounds-10m-trial-1422261.html>

## UK. Case 11: **David and Bette Stalford**

Nutall, D. (2004) East Anglian Daily Times, September 10th.  
<https://www.eadt.co.uk/news/21316413.couple-jailed-appalling-sex-abuse/>

### Full article:

Couple jailed over 'appalling' sex abuse.

A MIDDLE-AGED couple were starting jail sentences totalling 12 years last night after committing "appalling" ritual sex abuse on young girls.

David and Bette Stalford, of Oak Hill, Hollesley, were found guilty of a string of offences against three children following a trial at Ipswich Crown Court in July.

The offences were committed more than 20 years ago when the couple lived at Great Whelnetham and involved "quasi-Satanic ritual" sex abuse.

Appearing at the same court yesterday, David Stalford, 56, was jailed for nine years for three counts of indecency, two of indecent assault and six joint charges with his wife of indecency with a child.

Bette Stalford, 55, was jailed for three years.

Judge Peter Thompson described the offences as "appalling" but added Bette Stalford had played a lesser role.

He called David Stalford "an evil man" and said the long-term effect of the abuse on the young girls, now adult, was to affect their attitude towards sex and cause them to suffer nightmares.

After the sentencing, a spokeswoman for the Crown Prosecution Service said the case had involved sex abuse claims that dated back further than most other cases of its kind.

Suffolk's Chief Prosecutor Chris Yule added: "With historical abuse cases such as this, where a substantial period of time has elapsed since the offence, the job of the prosecution is made increasingly difficult.

"I would like to thank the victims in this case for finding the strength not only to report this crime but also to give evidence in court. It is only through the strength of victims and witnesses that prosecutions can proceed.

"I hope that this result will help reassure people that wherever possible CPS Suffolk is dedicated to protecting the rights of vulnerable people and prosecuting those who commit crime."

During the trial, the court heard that the couple had engaged in what Simon Spence, prosecuting, called "quasi-Satanic ritual".

These particular allegations, the court heard, were made by two of the three female complainants in the case and involved the girls being made to strip naked and take part in rituals involving sexual touching and oral sex.

This happened over a period of months, around 20 years ago, and involved the wearing of robes over naked bodies, the robes then being removed for the sexual activity.

Allegations of sexual abuse of the third complainant went back as far as 1974, the court heard.

Sentencing of the couple had been postponed from July for a psychiatric report and pre-sentence report on Bette Stalford.

Yesterday, her barrister Steven Dyble, said the psychiatric report had not found she suffered from mental illness.

He asked that the "inevitable" jail sentence should not be longer than four years, as "an act of mercy".

David Stalford was represented in court yesterday by barrister Samantha Leigh.

She pointed out that the mitigation speech for David Stalford had been made at the end of the trial by the barrister representing him, Martyn Levett. She therefore had nothing to add.

Judge Thompson banned the couple from ever working with children and placed them on the Sex Offenders' Register for the rest of their lives.

## **UK. Case 12: Colin Batley, Elaine Batley, Jacqueline Marling and Shelly Millar in Kidwelly**

See: The Daily Telegraph (2011). Cult leader threatened sex slaves with death. The Daily Telegraph, March 12th.

Link: <https://www.belfasttelegraph.co.uk/news/jail-for-evil-sex-cult-leader/28596855.html>

Update: <https://www.bbc.com/news/articles/cx2ewlkee2vo>

A news piece on *Wales Online* (2011) on the Batley case, titled, “Satanic sex cult face years in jail after being found guilty of catalogue of sexual offences” (Misstear & Turner, 2011) states:

Batley was the self-styled high priest of the group, which operated from a series of homes in a quiet cul-de-sac in the seaside Carmarthenshire town.

He and three female cult members, who wore Eye of Horus tattoos on their arms to signify membership, insisted throughout the five-week trial that no cult had ever existed.

But the trial jury dismissed that version of events yesterday when they found him guilty of more than two dozen acts of sexual perversion linked to his activities in the cult.

...

Cult members would dress in hooded robes during occult rituals which usually took place before group sex.

A number of houses in the same cul-de-sac were used for the regular cult sex sessions.

Batley would read from the occult bible, *The Book of The Law*, written more than a century ago by arch-Satanist Aleister Crowley.

He would also order cult members to have sex together and ensure that other members were present to film it. The recorded material mentioned during the trial is believed to have been destroyed before his arrest.

Link: <https://www.walesonline.co.uk/news/wales-news/satanic-sex-cult-face-years-1845296>

Also see this victim account: *The Devil on the Doorstep: My Escape From a Satanic Sex Cult* (2014) Annabelle Forest, Simon & Schuster, UK

### UK. Case 13: **Peter Petrauske and Jack Kemp**

From: *The Yorkshire Post* (December 15, 2012). Men jailed for sickening child abuse  
<https://www.yorkshirepost.co.uk/news/men-jailed-for-sickening-child-abuse-1875966>

Full article:

Men jailed for sickening child abuse

Two men accused of being part of a paedophile ring involving murdered “witch” Peter Solheim have been given lengthy jail sentences for their part in “ritualistic, sickening” sex abuse of young girls.

Jack Kemp, 69, and Peter Petrauske, 72, spent years tormenting their female victims, one said to be as young as three. Both men had denied any involvement in the abuse, claiming they were victims of a witch hunt or conspiracy.

But a jury at Truro Crown Court dismissed their protestations, convicting them of a string of offences dating back to the 1970s, as well as finding Kemp guilty of several more recent sexual

assaults unconnected to Petrauske.

Jailing Kemp and Petrauske, Judge Graham Cottle said: “The offences range from the extremely serious to the truly horrifying.

“You are two of the surviving members of a paedophile ring, together with others whose names have repeated frequently in this trial who were members of a ring that operated in Falmouth, Cornwall, in the 1970s and 1980s.

“I’m satisfied that you have both had a life-long sexual interest in young, female children.

“[The trial] has featured ritualistic, sickening abuse of young, young children. The scars left on [two victims, who cannot be named for legal reasons] are so obvious it would seem extremely unlikely that either of them have any real prospect of recovery.

“Finally, the truth about your lies and your undoubted propensities has caught up with you.”

Petrauske was convicted of rape, aiding and abetting an attempted rape, and indecent assault.

Judge Cottle sentenced him to 18 years in prison.

Kemp was guilty of 10 sexual offences including indecent assault and indecency with a child, and was handed a 14-year prison term.

Both men were given a discount because of their age, the judge telling Petrauske he was likely to die in prison.

Petrauske was said to be the “high priest” of a witches’ coven in St Ives, Cornwall, and ordered the girls to carry out his sick fantasies. The court heard Kemp videoed the abuse, but also took part in assaults, along with friends Solheim and Stan Pirie – a notorious paedophile who died in jail following his conviction for sex abuse in the mid-2000s.

Their victims gave harrowing evidence from behind a screen during the three-week trial. They said they were then abused by their tormentors, before being given money and sweets to buy their silence.

The abuse was only investigated further by police last year when Kemp was arrested in connection with another incident, causing rumours to spread around his home town of Falmouth and prompting the victims of the historic offences to contact detectives.

When Petrauske was arrested last year, detectives discovered daggers, sheets, candles and a mask, the court heard. He immediately mentioned the names Kemp and – in a dramatic twist in the case – Solheim.

The latter was a 56-year-old parish councillor whose body was found five miles off the Lizard Peninsula, Cornwall, by fishermen on June 18, 2004. He had been drugged and mutilated.

His partner, Margaret James, was jailed for 20 years in July 2006 for plotting the brutal killing after becoming jealous when Solheim had an affair, although police are still searching for those who helped her.

But counsel for the defendants told the jury that Petrauske and Kemp played no part in the abuse.

Sean Brunton, defending Petruske, compared his client with the victim of “a witch-hunt”.

“Don’t fall into the trap of thinking: ‘Who does he [Petruske] think he is? He’s obviously a weirdo,’” Mr Brunton said.

“While those who don’t follow the crowd are criticised, it’s not yet illegal to be a weirdo.”

Jo Martin, for Kemp, said the case against him was one of “no smoke without fire”, after the jury had been told of his previous convictions for sexual offences several decades ago.

Kemp and Petruske showed little emotion as Judge Cottle handed down the jail terms and told the pair: “You carried out appalling, indescribable offences against defenceless children.”

See: The Independent (2012). Men jailed over ‘ritualistic, sickening’ child sex abuse. The Independent, December 15th.

See: The Independent (2012). Pair jailed over witches’ coven ‘ritualistic’ sex abuse. The Independent, December 14th.

<https://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/politics/pair-jailed-over-witches-coven-ritualistic-sex-abuse-8417739.html>

## UK. Case 14: **Seven individuals in Glasgow (2023)**

Hanson writes:

“In 2023, eight individuals in Glasgow were found guilty of crimes of child sexual abuse and/or other forms of child maltreatment, and in early 2025 seven of them were given life sentences for this abuse. [9] Five of these individuals were found guilty of attempting to murder a young girl who they had pushed into a microwave and trapped in other places. The court also heard that she had been raped whilst still being young enough to wear nappies, forced to eat dog food, locked in a cupboard with a box full of spiders, hung by her clothes with a nail, and chased by people wearing devil masks.

Four children in total had been subjected to sexual abuse, gang rapes and violence by the group. Two individuals were also found guilty of child neglect. In sentencing remarks, the judge commented on the ‘agonising articulacy’ of one of the victims in her impact statement, commenting that ‘in stark contrast to what was inflicted on her and its impact, an impression of innate humanity shines through her words’.” (Hanson, 2025, p. 8)

See: Scott, K. (2023). Seven convicted of rape and sexual assault as part of child abuse ring. STV News, November 14th.

<https://news.stv.tv/west-central/seven-convicted-of-rape-and-sexual-assault-as-part-of-child-abuse-ring-in-glasgow>

BBC (2024). Child abuse ring warned of potential life sentence. 4th January.  
<https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-scotland-glasgow-west-67883859>

BBC (2025). Glasgow child sex abuse gang given life sentences. 27th January.

<https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/articles/c2dxj570n21o>

A BBC article, September 12, 2023, titled “Abuse trial told 'witches pointed wands' at child,” describes that the ritualistic abuse elements in this child sex ring case included allegations of “witches” pointing wands at a preschool girl, a “coven” that killed dogs in front of them and got them to stab the dogs themselves, “a large group of witches and wizards in a room who put a spell on the girl every day to make her a different animal,” and “causing them to participate in seances to communicate with spirits and demons.” (See: <https://www.bbc.com/news/uk-scotland-glasgow-west-66783808>)

October 13, 2023: The charges of witchcraft were dropped.

See: <https://www.bbc.com/news/uk-scotland-glasgow-west-67105240>

Note: The ritualistic elements are dropped from the charges in many criminal sex abuse cases, as is exemplified above. Few, if no, jurisdictions have statutes specific to ritualistic crimes, and the prosecution of such cases is often made much more complex if these elements are introduced.

#### UK. Case 15: **Convictions of 10 adults in Broxtowe, Nottingham** (1989)

Hanson writes:

In 1986, three months after entering care, a three-year-old boy in Broxtowe, Nottingham, started disclosing to his foster carers sexual abuse and degradation at the hands of his family members. This was the first of a set of extensive allegations made by him, his siblings and cousins over time to their foster carers. [48] These children described ‘how they were passed around adults, abused and tortured, sometimes daily; and how they were forced to watch the same things happening to siblings and cousins. They were starved, physically injured and humiliated’ (Dawson, 1990). Many aspects of their accounts corroborated one another (including those of accounts of children in different foster placements who only had supervised contact).

...

These criminal proceedings resulted in 10 adults (including the grandfather) being convicted for gross cruelty and sexual abuse relating to 12 children. (Hanson, 2025, p. 43)

(the media eventually depicted this case as a case of Satanic panic”)

Hanson writes:

In addition, there have been convictions for sexual abuse similar in nature to organised ritualistic abuse, involving multiple family members sadistically sexually abusing and/or torturing their children, as well as forcing them to have sex with others, over the course of their childhoods.

UK. Case 16 (not specific to ritual abuse): **Marie Black, Michael Rogers, Jason Adams, Carol Stadler**

The Guardian (Sept 28, 2015). Norwich woman who used children as sex 'toys' jailed for life

<https://www.theguardian.com/uk-news/2015/sep/28/norwich-paedophile-ring-marie-black-jailed-life>

Full article:

Marie Black, at centre of paedophile ring that raffled children at sex parties, found guilty of 23 offences including rape

A woman at the centre of an “utterly depraved” sex abuse ring which used children as sexual playthings has been jailed for life.

Marie Black, 34, from Norwich, was convicted of 23 offences including rape, conspiracy to rape and inciting a child to engage in sexual activity, after a trial earlier this year. The charges related to five young children, two boys and three girls, over a 10-year period. It included “raffling” the children and transporting them to sex parties for abuse by others.

Sentencing her at Norwich crown court, Judge Nicholas Coleman told Black she would be jailed for life and would not be eligible for parole for at least 12 years.

Black sobbed uncontrollably as he described her as the “constant factor” in the crimes. “The case is the most harrowing it has been my misfortune to try. I and the jurors had to listen to the truly gruesome detail of what took place,” he said. “Your conduct towards these children can only be described as utterly depraved – the children were subjected to sexual abuse of the worst kind. They were simply passed around like toys.”

Michael Rogers, 46, from Romford, Essex, was found guilty of 14 counts including cruelty, rape and inciting a child to engage in sexual activity.

Jason Adams, 44, from Norwich, was convicted of 13 similar counts.

Rogers and Adams were both sentenced to 24 years. The men were made subject to sexual harm prevention orders. Seven others stood trial but were cleared of all alleged sex offences.

The trial heard that Black was instrumental in abuse against the children in and around Norwich and London.

The trio are said to have hidden behind a “vener of respectability” as they invited other adults to parties where the children were abused and played card games to decide who would abuse which child.

Coleman said: “The offences included adults conspiring to rape children at so-called sex parties. You used them for you own, and for others’, sexual gratification. It amounts to child sexual abuse of the most serious kind.”

Co-defendant Carol Stadler, 59, from Norwich, was found guilty of assault causing actual bodily harm. Michael Rogers was found guilty of 14 counts including cruelty and rape.

Co-defendant Carol Stadler, 59, from Norwich, was found guilty of assault causing actual bodily harm. Michael Rogers was found guilty of 14 counts including cruelty and rape. Photograph: Norfolk police/PA

There was evidence the children were taken to other parts of the country where they were “raffled” for abuse by others, he said.

Sarah Elliott QC, mitigating for Black, said her client had been the victim of very serious domestic violence at the hands of Adams. “He was, and is, a very manipulative man,” she said. Elliott told the court that evidence was found on Rogers’ telephone suggesting he was a paedophile who exploited Black.

Elliott added that Black did not have the “intelligence or the wit” to be part of a “clever Machiavellian scheme” to cover up the abuse

“She was clearly a vulnerable, corrupted woman,” Elliott said. “The impetus for abusing the children comes from Adams and Rogers. “She was vilified throughout the trial and was blamed by everybody to exculpate themselves.”

However, barristers representing Adams and Rogers rejected the notion that they had manipulated her. Isabella Forshall QC, for Adams, said he had no previous convictions for sexual offences.

“Although Marie Black seeks to transfer the full load of blame onto Mr Adams, one of the counts reflects her as the only participant, so we don’t accept it is entirely his fault. She is the common denominator between all the offences,” she said.

Ann Cotcher QC said Rogers was a “naive” man who had sought to help Black.

“He still maintains his denial of any wrongdoing,” she said. “Whatever he did do, he was not the instigator of sexual and physical abuse. Marie Black had abused the children before he was ever on the scene.”

Co-defendant Carol Stadler, 59, from Norwich, was found guilty of assault causing actual bodily harm but cleared of nine other charges, including serious sexual assaults.

Six others – Anthony Stadler, 63, Nicola Collins, 36, Andrew Collins, 52, Judith Fuller, 31, Denise Barnes, 43, and Kathleen Adams, 85, all from Norwich – stood trial but were cleared of all counts.

## UK. Case 17 (not specific to ritual abuse): **Eight people convicted**

Hanson writes:

“In 1998, eight people based in Devon were convicted for a total of 100 years for sexual abuse offences spanning 35 years. This abuse was intergenerational, involving grandparents who had taught their children to abuse their own, and sadistic, involving razor blades, pick-axe handles, pitch forks and knitting needles (the latter used in abortions) (Lakeman, 1998; Lindy Brown, interview). These abusers not only raped the children (aged 3-15 years old), but also invited friends and neighbours to do so. A sleeping eight-year old girl was taken into woods to be tied up and gang raped 20 times. Children were tied to chairs in order to be raped

and tortured. Abuse within the family had originally been reported 30 years prior but had not been taken seriously; this time round it came to the authorities' attention through the concerted complaints of 14 members of the extended family.

The court case centred on the testimony of two female victims, approximately 15 and 19 years old. Lindy Brown, whom I interviewed about the case, was the manager of the NSPCC's young witness support project at the time and supported the eldest over the course of trial, sitting in it throughout. She described a process in which the victims withstood aggressive cross-examination by numerous barristers representing different defendants, but which was held together by a judge who was able to face the horror of what the victims described. Over 25 years on, the trial had left her fundamentally changed as a person, having taken her into depths of depravity she had never before witnessed: 'I'd been 10-11 years post qualified and most of the work I'd done with the NSPCC had been child sexual abuse... and I'd never heard anything like it... what was discussed was so horrific that I have never been able to talk about it... it's the only work that I've done where that's been the case. I would be worried that if [others] had that information, they'd feel like I felt. It was beyond anything that I'd ever heard or imagined, or that I've subsequently heard.' (Hanson, 2025, p.7)

[continued] One of the many difficult things was processing the fact that the men who married the daughters of the perpetrators became perpetrators themselves within this organised abuse – the implications of this were existential: 'Married men in Kent who became part of that abuse – on an intellectual level I can understand how that happens, but you know that's terrifying... how they got in touch, how they knew they were those kind of people, or is it that in the right kind of circumstances anybody's capable?'

She described the abuse involving children being coerced into sexual acts with one another, and the impact of it being such that the three older sisters of the two victims in court had committed suicide, and the youngest of the two later went onto.

This case underscored to her the importance of being able to hold in mind 'worst case scenarios' in child protection work, something she felt was missing from much of current practice. Relatedly, she observed how even though more recently there had been allegations of abuse relating to this family, there was no attempt within social services to join up the dots and draw on insights from the past, instead there was a blinkered approach justified as 'dealing with things on a case-by-case basis'." (Hanson, 2025, p. 8)

Also see: Lakeman, G. (1998). 35 years of evil: Grandparents turned own kids into sex abusers. *The Mirror*, Aug 1st. [I was not able to locate this article on the internet]

## Canada. Case 18. **Large-scale Convictions in Canada**

Hanson writes:

“Looking beyond the UK, Project Jericho in Prescott, Canada is worthy of mention as it highlights both the scale to which networks of abusers can reach, and what determined, thoughtful and holistic practice can achieve in tackling them. In August 1989, a group of three siblings in foster care disclosed sexual abuse by family members involving ‘monster games’ in the basement in which adults dressed up in sheets and masks and raped them, cut them with knives, forced them to drink blood and mud, and locked them in a dungeon (Gummer, n.d.; Miller, 1995). A joint social work and police team was set up to investigate, with ring-fenced funding, involvement of a specialist prosecutor, and support from the local mayor. Medical evidence and that gathered from the home corroborated the children’s reports, and the team gradually unearthed an intergenerational network of abusers stretching across four families. These abusers also included distant relatives and friends, and in addition, several ‘lone paedophiles’ targeted the same children (Gummer, no date; Miller, 1995). Centrally held resources were made available to the investigation as it grew, and a specialist therapeutic team was set up to support the children (Gummer, n.d.; Miller, 1995). (Hanson, 2025, p. 8)

[continued] When media descended on the town, interested in the ‘scandal’ and the allegations involving prominent individuals, the mayor helped focus attention instead on the investigative efforts, and instilled a narrative of community pride: rather than the town of Prescott becoming synonymous with horror, it was the town that had ‘confronted a catastrophe’ and successfully rescued children from abuse (Campbell, 2023). By October 1994, there were 162 victims identified (1 in 4 of the town’s children) and 119 suspected perpetrators. Sixty-five were charged, and 91% of these convicted (Gummer, n.d.). (Hanson, 2025, p. 9)

Also see: Gummer, P (undated, 2017). The Prescott case: key dates and events; Leeds, Grenville & Lanark District Health Unit. Available at:

<https://web.archive.org/web/20170203191702/http://www.healthunit.org/carekids/jericho/story.htm>

Also see: Miller, J. (1995) Walls come down on child abuse: Social workers, police work together to seal convictions. The Ottawa Citizen, March 25th. [I was not able to locate this article on the internet]

## USA. Case 19: **Louis Lamonica and Trey Bernard, Ponchatoula, Louisiana (2008)**

Pastor Louis Lamonica of Hosanna Church in Ponchatoula, was found guilty on multiple counts of aggravated rape of his sons and was given four concurrent life sentences. The convictions were held up on appeal in 2010.

See: VLEX: <https://case-law.vlex.com/vid/state-of-v-lamonica-891352078>

Allegations in this case included children being forced into sexual acts with adults, other children, and animals, Satanic rituals, animal sacrifice, bestiality, dedicating a baby in a black dress to Satan, a pentagram on the floor, incorporation of urine and feces, talk of the devil and demons, wearing of masks, hoods and gowns, etc. (Cult Education Institute)  
See: <https://culteducation.com/group/977-hosanna-church.html>

Season One of the HBO series, *True Detective* (2014), was loosely based on this case.  
involved  
See: <https://screenrant.com/true-detective-season-1-true-story-hosanna-church/>

Israel. Case 20. **Investigations into Multi-Perpetrator Case in Satz, Jerusalem, Bnei Brak, Haifa, and Safed, Israel (2025)** (no convictions to date)

In 2025, survivor testimony was presented in the Israeli Knesset alleging organized ritual abuse in Jerusalem, Bnei Brak, Haifa, and Safed, Israel. The forms of abuse described by survivors is consistent with the forms of abuse indicated in the above-described research.

Some highlights:

Karmel, A. (25 August 2025). Horrifying testimonies seek to lift shroud of silence around ritual sex abuse claims. *The Times of Israel*  
[https://www.timesofisrael.com/horrifying-testimonies-seek-to-lift-shroud-of-silence-around-ritual-sex-abuse-claims/?utm\\_source=The+Daily+Edition&utm\\_campaign=daily-edition-2025-08-25&utm\\_medium=email](https://www.timesofisrael.com/horrifying-testimonies-seek-to-lift-shroud-of-silence-around-ritual-sex-abuse-claims/?utm_source=The+Daily+Edition&utm_campaign=daily-edition-2025-08-25&utm_medium=email)

Survivors tell Knesset lawmakers of organized assaults on children by those claiming mantle of religion, alleging longstanding phenomenon made worse by official indifference

Reported abuse includes: Blood-drinking, binding, being filmed on cameras and phones.

“This isn’t just a series of individual cases of sexual assault,” they said. “It needs to be treated like organized crime. Like with the mafia or any other criminal network, you have to connect the dots.”

The sheer number of alleged victims describing similar incidents, despite not knowing each other and being from different parts of the country, should have merited a coordinated investigation, but neither police nor prosecutors approached the cases with seriousness, Aloni said.

Bruer, E. (June 3, 2025). Survivors testify: MKs participated in sadistic sexual 'rituals' involving minors. The Jerusalem Post - Israel News  
<https://www.jpost.com/israel-news/article-856407>

Reported abuse included: torture, gang rape by men and sometimes by women, starvation, electroshock, drinking menstrual blood, slaughter of cats and dogs, being forced to harm other children, and “The abuse was filmed, and drugs were used. There were ritual practices and symbolism.”

Reported abusers included family members, ‘Doctors, educators, police officers, and past and present members of the Knesset were involved in these abuses,’ survivor says.”

Yael Ariel, one of the abuse survivors, shared: “I experienced ritual abuse over many years until my late teens and was forced to harm other children. I chose to speak out and make my voice heard. I received threats after revealing my story. From age five to age 20, I was harmed in these ceremonies.”

Survivor Yael Shitrit testified:

“Their trafficking of me happened all over the country. They moved me from ceremony to ceremony. Naked men stood in a circle. My therapist, her husband, and her son harmed me, and there were dozens of other girls and boys who harmed me.”

Barkan, N. (April 23, 2025). 'Bottom of darkness': Children raped in ritual ceremonies expose the horrors. Israeli Hayom.

<https://www.israelhayom.com/2025/04/23/bottom-of-darkness-children-raped-in-ritual-ceremonies-expose-the-horrors/>

Multiple women recount organized abuse including ritual ceremonies conducted by people they knew, even close family members [often reported to transport their children to the rituals

Reported abuse included: rape, burning, near-death abuse, drowning, genital torture, disguises, masks, pentagrams,, burial, drugs, reenactments of biblical stories. Abuse took place in schools, synagogues, apartments, building basements, cemeteries, and the forest.

To humiliate children and instill feelings of guilt and shame, perpetrators show them pictures of themselves naked or give them food while telling them they ate "carrion," organize mock "wedding" ceremonies between children, force them to eat feces, and stage their burials.

#### **D. Ritual Abusers Traffic Victims to Other Hands-on Offenders and in CSAM Production**

Since before 1990, survivors who reported ritualistic abuse to their therapists also described their abuser networks: 1) trafficking them to other hands-on offenders and 2) filming their sexual assaults to produce and sell child sexual abuse materials (CSAM) to others. Now, the data on this

form of trafficking is catching up with survivor reports.

Dr. Hanson devotes a section of her 2025 report to reviewing the research and survivor accounts on sex trafficking within ritual abuse. She explains that there has been recent progress in studying the role of CSAM and other child sex trafficking within organized and ritualistic abuse:

Historically, research into CSAM has often neglected the organised and intrafamilial dimensions to much of its production (Itzin, 1997; Salter & Wong, 2023), and similarly efforts to tackle children being bought and sold for rape (also known as child sex trafficking) have not always paid due regard to how much of this is driven by family members and paedophilic abuse groups (Itzin, 2001; Pacheco et al., 2023; Raphael, 2020). As noted above, this commercial sexual exploitation (pimping and the rapes that follow) is often reported by ritual abuse survivors as another horrific part of their maltreatment.

Hanson discusses the findings of Schröder, Nick et al. (2020), as discussed above:

In their survey study of 165 self-reported survivors of organised abuse (88% of whose included ritual), [16] Schröder, Nick et al. (2020) found that 91% reported commercial sexual exploitation, and 90% reported that their abuse involved CSAM production. And in their parallel survey of healthcare professionals who support survivors of organised/ritual abuse, even higher proportions reported that their clients' abuse included these elements (96% and 94% respectively).

She also reviews the Canadian Centre for Child Protection findings (2017a) on organized abuse:

Of the 150 international survivors of CSAM they surveyed, 74 (49%) reported organised abuse. This group experienced sexual abuse that on average started younger and lasted longer than the other respondents – 82% reported that their abuse started when they were aged four or younger, and 51% reported it lasting 16 or more years, followed by 22% reporting it lasting 11- 15 years. In 82% of these cases, the primary abuser was reported to be a family member, most typically the victim's father (38%) followed by both parents (19%). Nearly a third (31%) of this group reported abuse by a person in a position of authority (of these, 35% mentioned a doctor or more; 30% teacher(s); 26% police; and 26% clergy), and 51% respondents mentioned at least one adult woman as an offender.

Hanson then shares a number of survivor accounts of child sex trafficking within extreme abuse:

Survivors describe how these elements of their abuse involving filming and/or being sold to others often involve humiliation, shame, cruelty and sadism, and the profound degradation of being so objectified and commodified (for example, C3P, 2017; Pacheco et al., 2023; Raphael, 2020; Salter & Woodlock, submitted).

For example, she cites the description of CSAM abuse by “Anny” in the Raphael (2020) study:

I was woozy. I had no energy left. When the buyer was penetrating me, another man was photographing me. When I saw the camera, I will filled with shame, horrendous shame. Using the camera was part of the torture. They sure were experts in creating bad feelings.

Pacheco et al. (2023) provide this description by survivor “Kabili” of being trafficked to a sadist:

I called one of the ‘clients’ my dad brought ‘the strangler’. This person took a lot of enjoyment out of strangling me while he would molest me with his hands. The thrill was to see me trying to resist.

One of the CSAM victims interviewed by Pacheco et al. specifically referenced ritual abuse:

William experienced incest by his father and mother. He was then trafficked for CSEA within “ritual” events ... Rituals included: a cult-like atmosphere and practices, costumes worn by perpetrators and theatrical scenery/stage settings. Violence, sadism, masochism, and instances of murder occurred during rituals. William was tortured, caged, and violently sexually abused numerous times. CSAM was created, distributed and exchanged by his father and the other cult members.

Hanson concludes this section as follows:

It is of note that what survivors of CSAM (recorded child sexual abuse) tell us about this abuse fits with both content analysis of this material and research that asks CSAM offenders about their interests. Significant proportions report interest in sadistic child abuse (including that involving bestiality) and abuse involving very young children (Gannon et al., 2023; Insoll, Ovaska & Vaaranen-Valkonen, 2022; Woodhams et al., 2021), and this content is widely available online for them to view (Salter & Whitten, 2022). (Hanson, 2025, p. 17)

## **E. Evidence of Human Trafficking and CSAM Raise Credibility of Ritualistic Abuse**

I am not aware of any misinformation or disinformation campaigns to discredit the existence of child trafficking, including CSAM production, given that these forms of abuse are irrefutable.

Given that child trafficking, including production of CSAMs, and ritualistic abuse are so similar in their extreme nature and are often integrated with each other, I have hope that the powerful evidence of child trafficking abuser networks will raise awareness about the reality of ritualistic abuse and the credibility assigned to victim reports of this abuse.

## **F. Cases with Intersections Between Ritual Abuse and 1) Human Trafficking and 2) CSAM Production and Distribution**

## 1. 2025 Arrests of Four Men in Australia for Internet Distribution of Satanic Content

In December, 2025, police in Sydney Australia charged four men for internet distribution of CSAMs that “depicted child abuse and the torture of children, involving symbols and rituals linked to Satanism and the occult.” This case demonstrates the above-described similarities and cross-over between distribution of sadistic CDSAMs and ritualistic abuse.

Superintendent Jayne Doherty, commander of the sex crimes squad, said:

“Police will allege in court that this international group were engaging in conversations and the sharing of material which depicted child abuse and the torture of children involving symbols and rituals linked to Satanism and the occult.”

See: Australia charges four men over ‘satanic’ child sex abuse material

<https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2025/12/1/australia-charges-four-men-over-satanic-child-sex-abuse-material#:~:text=News%7C%20Sexual%20Assault,address%20in%20Sydney%20last%20week.>

Below are three additional news pieces reporting on this case:

[https://www.police.nsw.gov.au/news/news?sq\\_content\\_src=%2BdXJsPWh0dHBzJTNBJTJGJTJGZWJpenByZC5wb2xpY2UubnN3Lmdvdi5hdSUyRm1lZGhhJTJGMTIyMTg0Lmh0bWwmYWxsPTE%3D](https://www.police.nsw.gov.au/news/news?sq_content_src=%2BdXJsPWh0dHBzJTNBJTJGJTJGZWJpenByZC5wb2xpY2UubnN3Lmdvdi5hdSUyRm1lZGhhJTJGMTIyMTg0Lmh0bWwmYWxsPTE%3D)

[https://www.abc.net.au/news/2025-12-01/sydney-arrests-satanic-child-abuse-network/106085480?utm\\_source=abc\\_news\\_app&utm\\_medium=content\\_shared&utm\\_campaign=abc\\_news\\_app&utm\\_content=other](https://www.abc.net.au/news/2025-12-01/sydney-arrests-satanic-child-abuse-network/106085480?utm_source=abc_news_app&utm_medium=content_shared&utm_campaign=abc_news_app&utm_content=other)

<https://www.9news.com.au/national/sydney-police-crime-satanic-child-abuse-material-ring/b8ab95c4-a1d7-44ec-ae20-753a3e619517>

<https://uk.news.yahoo.com/australia-police-bust-sydney-satanic-041500554.htm>

## 2. Satanism, Neo-Fascism, Neo-Nazi Terrorism, Order of Nine Angles, the “764” International Child Abuse and Sexual Extortion Network, and CSAMs

An article From WIRED: *He Was an FBI Informant—and Inspired a Generation of Violent Extremists*, Aug 1, 2024, by Ali Winston and Jake Hanrahan, exposes connections between:  
Link: <https://www.wired.com/story/the-dangerous-exploits-of-an-extremist-fbi-informant/>

1. Occult groups, such as the “Tempel ov Blood” (ToB) and Order of the Nine Angles (O9A),  
2. Neo-Nazi terrorist groups, such as the Atomwaffen Division (AWD), or National Socialist Resistance Front, founded by Brandon Russell in 2015:

<https://extremism.gwu.edu/atomwaffen-division-awd>

3. Child extortion networks, such as “764” (aka “com”), that extort children to engage in sexual abuse, self-harm, and violent crime, including murder, and,  
4. Participation in crimes involving child sexual abuse materials.

This article discusses FBI informant, Joshua Caleb Sutter, his affiliation with a number of occult and abuse networks, and efforts of the U.S. Department of Justice to investigate these organized crime networks, including successful prosecutions. For example:

Sutter testified in late 2017 that his interest in occultism and key role in ToB led him to meet John Cameron Denton, a senior figure in the Atomwaffen Division who went by “Rape” in the neo-Nazi terrorist group; in one court document filed after his arrest in 2020, US prosecutors said two coconspirators claimed Denton possessed CSAM.

In the past few years, Sutter actively promoted the child abuse and extortion network 764 and some of its affiliated groups. 764, as WIRED reported in March along with The Washington Post, Der Spiegel, and Recorder, is the target of an international law enforcement investigation, with more than a dozen members arrested in the United States, Europe, and Brazil. Sutter did not respond to WIRED’s requests for comment.

Participants in 764 and its affiliated splinter groups like CLVT, 7997, H3ll, and Harm Nation extort minors into sexually exploiting or harming themselves. They organize on online platforms such as Telegram and Discord, and find minors via Instagram, Roblox, Minecraft, and other popular games and social media apps where children congregate online. One particularly disturbing practice is urging victims to carve the usernames of their exploiter into their flesh, known within the network as a “cutsign.” Participants in this network have also been accused of robberies, in-person sexual abuse of minors, kidnapping, weapons violations, swatting, and murder.

The US Department of Justice is pursuing further charges against alleged members of these groups through federal grand jury proceedings, according to court records filed earlier this year in the case of Harm Nation founder Kyle Spitze. A young English participant in 764 also faces terrorism charges for allegedly plotting to kill a homeless man. The network is also connected to MKU, a nihilist Eastern European skinhead crew whose members are accused of a series of random attacks and killings in Ukraine and Russia.

In addition:

In communications with a former Tempel ov Blood member viewed by WIRED, Sutter openly discussed viewing CSAM with other members of his nexion, and seemed obsessed with conspiracy theories like Project Monarch that involved child abuse. The former ToB member also noted Sutter’s fascination with the case of Belgian serial killer, rapist, and pedophile Marc Dutroux. Shortly before taking the Agony’s Point Press X account offline in March of this year, the account posted a photo of an occult altar featuring a blood-smeared photo of Dutroux next to human and animal skeletal remains, as well as a severed doll’s head inked with lightning bolts and a swastika, on top of a flag featuring a Nazi death’s head and the Nazi slogan “Meine ehre ist meine treue” (my honor is my allegiance).

...

There's also evidence that Sutter was perhaps active in the Order of Nine Angles much earlier than previously thought. In old online Satanist texts, a man under the alias "Wulfran Hall" is credited as contributing to some of the original O9A ritual music in 1997. This was alongside early members including Richard Moulton, aka "Christos Beest." Wulfran Hall is known to be an alias used by Sutter shortly after he began to collaborate with federal officials in the early 2000s.

Sutter was also focused heavily on music while running Tempel Ov Blood. As part of this far-right Satanic movement, Sutter had a music project named "Gulag," which ran alongside his Martinet Press. Both of these projects promoted ultraviolence, demonic Satanism, ritualistic torture, and pedophilia.

Further disturbing content included in this article.

### **3. Abuse within Epstein Network Intersects with Forms of Ritual Abuse**

In early February, 2026, millions of the Jeffrey Epstein and Ghislaine Maxwell files were publicly released by the U.S Department of Justice. See: <https://www.justice.gov/epstein/search>

These files reference alleged crimes that many survivors of ritual abuse have also described.

I will include the references and links to a few of these files. Note: Highly disturbing content:

1) An email allegedly from Epstein dated April 25, 2009, that says: "I loved the torture video": <https://x.com/eyuplovely/status/2018730345131020393?s=20>

2) An undated email from a redacted party with a subject line: "Snipe hunt is over. Moon crickets in field bag" and an email body that says: "Guess what? They're niggers."  
<https://x.com/smalls2672/status/2018458533801435276?s=20>

3) An email dated May 26, 2023, from a redacted party that states that billionaire Leon Black, Epstein's friend, "bites parts of her vagina, violence was arousing for him, very painful for her": <https://x.com/PiperK/status/2018429303642567155?s=20>

4) An email dated October 2, 2020, from "Bryan Miller" stating: "Back in the 90s, Ghislaine Maxwell recruited a girl from for [sic] a modeling career. Instead of modeling she was sold as a slave for sex and torture. Prince Andrew was was [sic] an accessory to death as he tortured her and me to force her murder."  
<https://www.justice.gov/epstein/files/DataSet%209/EFTA00151161.pdf>

5) Alleged post dated February 3, 2011, from film director Barry Josephson to Jeffrey Epstein: "I've been thinking a lot about that question that you asked Bill Gates, 'How do we get rid of poor people as a whole'...and I have an answer..."  
[https://x.com/liz\\_churchill10/status/2019242247984984275](https://x.com/liz_churchill10/status/2019242247984984275)

6) Email dated December 29, 2020, from redacted source, states:

{redacted} spoke of this going on at Zorro Ranch [Epstein's ranch in New Mexico beginning in the 1990s]. She has said on record that Epstein offered her money to do this. Birth babies for black market use.

Link: <https://www.justice.gov/epstein/files/DataSet%209/EFTA00165118.pdf>

7) Alleged email exchange between Bryan Bishop and Epstein, dated July 21, 2018, with subject line: Designer babies:

From Bryan:

Jeffrey, Here is a deck about my designer baby project:

<http://diyhpl.us/~bryan/designer-babies-deck.pdf>

[The diyhpl.us wiki (diyhpl.us/wiki) is a wiki for open source hardware, do-it-yourself biohacking and practical human enhancement engineering projects which could be called transhumanism.]

I have talked with Austin again, and we have a series of questions about how serious you are about wanting this, and what the ground rules are for me even exploring this with you and getting to next steps.

Most of these questions are around your requirements for secrecy and privacy, specifically regarding reputational risk and also any financial involvement. I think there would also need to be some understanding about goals and feasibility of different results.

I think that one way this could be done is under the banner of my designer babies project, since the other deliverable is similar and shares so many of the same procedures and lab requirements. This might offer a sufficient level of deniability.

I propose another call on Monday in the afternoon to discuss these issues, please propose a time.

Thank you.

- Bryan

From Epstein:

im traveling in mid east until the 1<sup>st</sup> let's do it after that , i have no issue with investing the problem is only if i am seen to lead

Link: <https://x.com/Eliseevanews/status/2019573371101671779/photo/1>

8) Alleged email from Jeffrey Epstein to Bryan Bishop, dated August 30, 2018, with subject line: More genetic editing (cont.). Epstein text includes: I like implant embryo , wait 9 months. = C2 great ending

<https://x.com/RobertSkvarla/status/2018284847593095454?s=20>

9) Email exchange between Jeffrey Epstein and Gino Yu, dated January 17, 2018, stating:

Gino Yu wrote:

Am in Paris and was about to write you and it popped up. She is a classic “stage 3” in the model. Outlier who is intelligent, was traumatised when she was young (sexual abuse), and now gradually coming into her own and becoming self realised (can share our text interactions with her permission). Starting to develop special abilities.

This trip we’ve found a lot of stories like this (though she is more on the extreme side given her biographical history). Have been working with many such people with the model with good success.

Incidentally, she is based in NYC. Can set up a meeting if you have interest.

In London, I met with a group that leverages Iboga and spiritual traditions from Gabon to offer this:

ALTERNATE PARADIGMS

Link: <https://x.com/ByzGeneral/status/2018365991059677453/photo/1>

10) Evolutionary and social biologist, Robert Trivers’ email dated December 17, 2018, to Epstein discussing using molecular control to produce novel gender phenotypes:

[https://x.com/princess\\_kim\\_k/status/2018199088701825297?s=20](https://x.com/princess_kim_k/status/2018199088701825297?s=20)

11) Email from redacted source to the FBI, dated September 1, 2022:

Special Agent [redacted]

I am a Threat Intake Examiner (TIE) at the FBI National Threat Operations Center (NTOC) Unit where we receive information from the public regarding criminal activity and threats to national security. The following information is being forwarded for your situational awareness and any action deemed appropriate.

On 08/31/2022, at 10:00 a.m. Eastern Time, Anonymous Complainant Internet Protocol (IP) address [I will redact this], which resolves to Madison, Alabama 35756, submitted an online tip to the FBI National Threat Operations Center (NTOC) via [tips.fbi.gov](https://tips.fbi.gov), regarding new information pertaining to Jeffery Epstein in Maddison ,Alabama.

Date Submitted: 08/31/2022 10:00:30 AM EST  
Transaction Number: o917v5gr  
Violation: Human-Trafficking  
Emergency: False  
Threat To Life: False  
Submitted Text:

Jeffery Epstein was bringing children to the Omni to human sex trafficking them out to rich business people. If you go to 901 E Cary St Suite 210, Richmond, VA 23219 in the South State Bank on the top floor- there is a housekeeping door (I think inside the mens restroom once you enter on the right). Inside this are should be a crawl space in the ceiling, a water faucet, and a wall on the right. The wall on the right (behind the actual wall) contains a passageway with an inscription about "Gabe"- a human trafficking victim that Jeffery Epstein kept. I do not know what is behind the wall, but I remember as kids we were both brought to this area and trafficked in and out of the premises, along with other kids.

Link: <https://x.com/beinlibertarian/status/2018001359849545854>

12) Email between two FBI correspondents with names redacted dated March 17, 2025, asking for guidance in redacting photographs. The text includes:

Bluf: IMD RIDS requests guidance redacting photographs – who is protected under this transparency task?

...

IMD-RIDS needs clear and specific guidance to redact these photographs. Some photographs depict victims, unknown-unidentified females and males, former U.S. presidents, Secretary of State, and other celebrities.

Link: <https://x.com/GeneralMCNews/status/2020190748210278808?s=20>

13) Email from redacted source dated November 25, 2019, stating:

What is interesting about Jeffrey Epstein is yet to be written. Did you know somewhere in the hills outside the Zorro, two foreign girls were buried on orders of Jeffrey and Madame G? Both died by strangulation during rough, fetish sex.

[Note: The author of this email asks for one bitcoin to be transferred to an account. This raises questions about the motives of this source and the credibility and of this allegation]

Link: <https://x.com/DaveAtherton20/status/2018758187734978937>

## G. The Evidence of Abusive Mind Control

Mind control is a widely-recognized form of abuse in the field of psychology. The American Psychological Association's *Dictionary of Psychology* defines mind control as follows:

an extreme form of social influence used to indoctrinate an individual in the attitudes and beliefs of a group, usually one that is religious or political in nature. See brainwashing; coercive persuasion.

the control of physical activities of the body, particularly autonomic functions, by mental processes. See autogenic training; biofeedback. See also mind-body intervention.

Some well-known academic texts on the subject of abusive mind control are:

*Operation Mind Control: The CIA's Plot Against America*, by Walter Bowart and Richard Condon (1978). CreateSpace Independent Publishing Platform.

*Combating Cult Mind Control: The Guide to Protection, Rescue and Recovery from Destructive Cults*, by Steven Hassan, Ph.D. Park Street Press (1998, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition in 2015).

*The Mind Manipulators : a non-fiction account*, by Alan W. Schefflin and Edward M. Opton, Paddington Press (1978) .

*The Search for the Manchurian candidate: The CIA and mind control: The secret history of the behavioral sciences*, by John Marks (1979). W.W. Norton.

*The CIA Doctors: Human Rights Violations by American Psychiatrists*, by Colin Ross (2006). Manitou Communications

The evidence of the existence of highly dangerous forms of mind control, “coercive persuasion,” “brainwashing,” etc., is incontrovertible. For example, it is widely known that cult leaders systematically psychologically manipulated, that is mind-controlled, their victims to commit mass suicide in both: 1) the “Jonestown” massacre, in 1978, led by Jim Jones and his Peoples Temple in Guyana, and 2) the Heaven’s Gate mass suicide led by Marshall Applewhite in 1998 in San Diego, California.

The fact that cult leaders have the capacity to psychologically manipulate or “mind-control” victim-followers to kill themselves en masse forces us to acknowledge the existence of less drastic effects of abusive mind control. This includes abusive mind control strategies such as deprivation of basic needs, confinement, intensive training, indoctrination/inculcation into abusers’ belief systems, operational conditioning (punishment and reward), threats, torture, hypnosis, deception, false promises, illusions, etc., inflicted on individuals and groups to induce the execution of a wide range of behaviors that serve cult leaders, such as maintaining silence,

participating in the abuse, submitting to being sex-trafficked, recruiting other victims, etc. Victims of the Jeffrey Epstein/Ghislaine Maxwell sex ring describe some of these tactics.

Strategies of abusive mind control exist in a continuum of sophistication and effectiveness. I presented this content in this peer-reviewed chapter: Lacter, E. (2008). Mind control: Simple to complex. In A. Sachs & G. Galton (Eds). *Forensic aspects of dissociative identity disorder*, pp. 185-195. London: Karnac.

At the most extreme end of the continuum of psychological sophistication is the systematic manipulation of dissociated identities.

Psychologically-sophisticated abusers who understand DID, including abusers who have learned methods to induce new dissociated identities to form, then apply the above-described kinds of mind control strategies to manipulate and develop these identities. Systematic abuse is applied to cause identities to develop beliefs about themselves, to obey directives, and to execute behaviors that serve the abusers, including controlling other dissociated identities and responding to instructions communicated through trained phrases, hand signals, alphanumeric codes, and more.

Incontrovertible evidence of abusive mind control is provided in the declassified documents of the MKULTRA Program of the United States of America Central Intelligence Agency (CIA).

In 1953, Allen Dulles, then director of the CIA, named Dr. Sidney Gottlieb to direct the CIA's MKULTRA Program. This program included experiments conducted by psychiatrists to create amnesia, new dissociated identities, new memories, and responses to hypnotic access codes. In 1972, then-CIA director Richard Helms and Gottlieb ordered the destruction of all MKULTRA records. A clerical error spared seven boxes, containing 1738 documents, over 17000 pages. This archive was declassified through a Freedom of Information Act Request in 1977, though the names of most people, universities, and hospitals are redacted.

The CIA assigned each document a number preceded by "MORI" for "Management of Officially Released Information"—the CIA's automated electronic system at the time of document release. These documents are accessible on the internet. The United States Senate held a hearing exposing the abuses of MKULTRA, entitled "Project MKULTRA, the CIA's Program of Research into Behavioral Modification" (1977).

The following released MORI documents describe the following:

MORI 144686 (1952), Project ARTICHOKE, asks: "Can we get control of an individual to the point where he will do our bidding against his will and even against such fundamental laws of nature such as self-preservation?"

MORI 017395 states that Subproject 136 (1961) would use drugs and hypnosis to induce and control dissociative states, including multiple personality disorder, and would use “psychological tricks,” reward, punishment, and electroshock to control behavior, including that of children.

MORI 190527 (1951) details an experiment that successfully placed two girls in “very deep trance,” and used post-hypnotic coded words to make them carry and activate a bomb, followed by instructions for absolute amnesia.

MORI 190713 (1955), “Hypnotism and Covert Operations,” discusses placing the “conscious mind in a state of suspended animation” to make subjects “have amnesia both for the fact of having been hypnotized and the origin of whatever new idea or impetus to action has been implanted in his unconscious mind.”

In a May 13, 1968, article in the Providence Evening Bulletin, George Estabrooks, described as a former consultant for the Federal Bureau of Investigation and CIA, is quoted to have stated, “the key to creating an effective spy or assassin rests in splitting a man’s personality, or creating multipersonality” (Ross, 2000, p. 162). Ross, C. (2000). *Bluebird: Deliberate Creation of Multiple Personality by Psychiatrists*. Manitou Communications. For more on Estabrooks’ efforts, also see: [https://www.cia.gov/readingroom/docs/DOC\\_0000140402.pdf](https://www.cia.gov/readingroom/docs/DOC_0000140402.pdf)

On March 15, 1995, New Orleans clinical social worker Valerie B. Wolf and two of her clients, Claudia S. Mullen and Christine D’Nicola Ebner appeared before President Clinton’s Advisory Committee on Human Radiation Experiments in Washington, D.C. to testify on mind control experimentation on children. Their testimony is published on the National Security Archive on this website: <https://nsarchive2.gwu.edu/radiation/dir/mstreet/commeet/meet12/trnsc12a.tx>

On December 23, 2024, the National Security Archive declassified over 1,200 documents, including transcripts from the United States Senate’s 1975 Select Committee to Study Governmental Operations with Respect to Intelligence Activities. This committee was chaired by Senator Frank Church and is often referred to as the *Church Committee*. These declassified documents include the *Church Committee’s* closed interviews of Sidney Gottlieb, director the CIA’s MKULTRA program.

The background on the establishment and proceedings of the Church Committee is as follows:

On January 21, 1975, Senator John Pastore introduced a resolution to establish a select committee to investigate federal intelligence operations and determine “the extent, if any, to which illegal, improper, or unethical activities were engaged in by any agency of the Federal Government.” The Senate approved the resolution, 82-4.

The committee decided that most of its hearings would be held in closed, executive session, in order to protect intelligence sources and methods. The committee held a series of public hearings in September and October of 1975 to educate the American public

about the “unlawful or improper conduct” of the intelligence community, highlighting a few carefully selected cases of misconduct. These hearings examined a CIA biological agents program, a White House domestic surveillance program, IRS intelligence activities, and the FBI’s program to disrupt the civil rights and anti-Vietnam War movements.

(See: the United States Senate website:

<https://www.senate.gov/about/powers-procedures/investigations/church-committee.htm>)

The newly-declassified documents on the CIA MKULTRA Program are published on the National Security Archive on this website:

<https://nsarchive.gwu.edu/briefing-book/dnsa-intelligence/2025-10-30/top-secret-testimony-cias-mkultra-chief-50-years-later?eType=EmailBlastContent&eId=9fc9e033-bcb8-4178-93d8-6dfcda3df7cc>

Inducement of the formation of dissociated identities and psychological manipulation of these identities, that is, abusive mind control, by abusers is well-documented in the professional literature on ritual abuse and mind control. For example, see:

Lacter, E. (2011). Torture-based mind control: Psychological mechanisms and psychotherapeutic approaches to overcoming mind control. In O.B. Epstein, J. Schwartz, & R. Wingfield (Eds.) *Ritual abuse and mind control: The manipulation of attachment needs* (pp. 57-142). London: Karnac.

Miller, A. (2012). *Healing the Unimaginable: Treating Ritual Abuse and Mind Control*. Karnac.

Noblitt, J. R. & Noblitt, P.P. (2014). Empirical and forensic evidence of ritual abuse. In *Cult and ritual abuse: narratives, evidence, and healing approaches*, 3rd Edition. Praeger.

Salter, M. (2013a). *Organised sexual abuse*. Routledge: Oxford.

Salter, M. & Woodlock, D. (2022) The anti-epistemology of organised abuse: Ignorance, exploitation, inaction. *British Journal of Criminology*. 63. 10.1093/bjc/azac007.

Survivor accounts offer detailed descriptions of abusive mind control. Two representative memoirs are:

Rutz, Carol. (2001). *A nation betrayed*. Grass Lake, Michigan: Fidelity Publishing.

Sullivan, Kathleen (2003) *Unshackled*.

Many more are listed below in the section on: “Lived-Experience Accounts of Ritualistic Abuse and Mind Control.”

There is also some basis of abusive mind control in research. In the following studies, some of the participants disclosed that their abusers had the knowledge and capacity to manipulate their dissociated identities to control their victims:

Canadian Centre for Child Protection (C3P) (2016a). Child Sexual Abuse Images on the Internet: A Cybertip.ca Analysis. Canadian Centre for Child Protection. Retrieved from:  
<https://www.protectchildren.ca/en/resources-research/child-sexual-abuse-images-report/>

Canadian Centre of Child Protection (C3P) (2017b). Survivors' Survey: Full Report. C3P. Link (scroll down to click on pdfs):  
<https://protectchildren.ca/en/resources-research/survivors-survey-results/>

Middleton, W. (2015). Tipping Points and the Accommodation of the Abuser: Ongoing Incestuous Abuse during Adulthood. *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy*, 4, 4-17.

Middleton, W. (2023). Beyond Death: Enduring Incest – The Fusion of Father with Daughter. In M. J. Dorahy, S. N. Gold, & J. A. O'Neil (Eds.). *Dissociation and the Dissociative Disorders: Past, Present, Future*. Routledge, pp. 223-237.

Schröder, J., Nick, S., Richter-Appelt, H., & Briken, P. (2020). Demystifying ritual abuse - insights by self-identified victims and health care professionals. *Journal of Trauma & Dissociation*, 21(3), 349–364. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15299732.2020.1719260>

For example, in the study by Schröder et al., 80.4% of the 165 individuals who identified themselves as victims of organized abuse (88% of whose abuse included ritual abuse), reported that their abuse included “induction of dissociative personality states.”

In abusive mind control, abusers often assign names or other stimuli to particular identities in order to be able to call them forward into executive control of mental functions in order to then direct them to execute particular behaviors that serve them.

This is a very complex form of psychological manipulation, i.e., mind control. I will provide a relatively simple example that illustrates how abusers control victims through such tactics:

Tammy (pseudonym) was enrolled in a preschool controlled by producers of sadistic child abuse materials (CSAMs), unbeknownst to her family. One day, during reading circle, the abusers transported Tammy off-site where they tortured and filmed her abuse for the first time. When they finished, they commanded: “When you are here, you are *Janie*. When you are home, you are Tammy [original name]. Tammy will not remember *Janie* or this place. Tammy will only remember that you were in reading circle today.”

*Janie*, was the “stage name” that Tammy’s abusers used in their distribution of CSAMs. Pairing their command with torture, as well as Tammy’s own need to dissociate this terrifying memory, accomplished the abusers’ objective of reinforcing the formation of

the new self-state, *Janie*, and in inducing the formation of a dissociative barrier between *Janie* and Tammy, making Tammy amnesiac for *Janie* and this abuse. When the abusers wanted to access the identity, *Janie*, they could simply call her name, then *Janie* would take executive control, and Tammy would recede and be amnesiac for the episode.

In the work to overcome the harm caused by abusive mind control, it is important to help clients to recover their memory of such “programmed” cues in order to help them develop conscious control over their dissociated identities being accessed and exploited by the use of these cues.

## **H. Coerced Perpetration within Ritual Abuse**

Dr. Hanson also devotes a section of her report (2025) to ritual abuse networks coercing victims to harm other victims, as survivors have been disclosing in therapy for decades. She writes:

This works both to silence victims, as they believe that what they have ‘done’ means that they too are abusers and would be prosecuted if they told, and achieves sadistic ends – it is perhaps the ultimate cruelty and most intrusive violation to coerce someone into doing things that are against their ‘moral core’, so that they are holding the distress, guilt and shame that actually belongs with the instigators.

Hanson explains that these abusers place children in “false choice situations” that trap them into doing harm to other victims. For example, children are “told that they must hurt another child or that this child will be harmed more severely,” (Hanson, 2025, p. 24).

Hanson provides an example cited by Salter (2013a) quoting survivor “Anne”:

I remember once, I was made to hold a knife while an adult held a baby. And, to me, it was a feeling that they were trying to make me feel guilty, so that I would never speak... they try and make you feel involved, make you feel like you are in it... that was one of the most traumatic times.

Hanson provides an example cited by Scott (2001) quoting survivor Sinead:

I always felt like it was happening to me, because I could always see the pain on her face, but she wouldn’t show it. She would always wink at me or smile, when I knew she was hurting, and it was me that was hurting her. It was a case of ‘if you don’t it we’ll do it, but we’ll kill her afterwards’, and ‘if you really love her, you’ll hurt her’

Hanson further explains that “a victim may experience such severe horrors that they reach a limit, beyond which they move to take on a perpetrating role in the hope that this ensures their survival or provides some relief from further overwhelming powerlessness, terror, degradation and loss.

Hanson provides an example cited by Salter (2013a, p.167-8 ) quoting survivor “Lily”:

[“Lily”] (2013a) described reaching this point after her second pregnancy was violently terminated, breaking a promise from her father that she would be able keep this baby:

That was the point, I think, where I really just gave in. And that was really the point where I moved into being a perpetrator. Because of the despair. It was like there was no point anymore. And the hope that, as a perpetrator, you’ll get treated better.

Hanson explains that ritual abusers also record coerced perpetration to further extort and silence victims:

Abusers are frequently reported to have made recordings of victims engaged in forced harm and moral injury situations, which are then used to threaten and blackmail (along the lines of ‘if you tell, we’ll show this video’). In Schröder, Nick et al.’s (2020) survey, 78% of the 165 individuals reporting organised abuse (often involving ritual) said that they had been extorted through recordings of forced violence against others. (2025, p. 25)

### **Examples of Strategies in Coerced Harm**

Abuser strategies to coerce victims to harm other victims include the following:

1. The victim is physically trapped in a setting that the abusers completely control.
2. The abusers ensure that the victim has no opportunity to escape through suicide.
3. The abusers inflict forms of torture that cannot be endured for even a moment, but that can last for hours. Electroshock is particularly effective. Abusers can remotely deliver electroshock using hand-held devices as they direct victims to harm or kill other victims.
4. When victims resist directives or even only hesitate to harm or kill another victim, the abusers typically inflict worse and/or more prolonged torture on that intended victim and then blame the first victim for this suffering. For example, if a child does not stab a younger child to death, the abusers may slowly kill the younger child over a flame in view of the child. In many cases, after the abusers punish the second victim, they still coerce the first victim to complete the act.

Anneke Lucas, in her book, *Quest for Love: Memoir of a Child Sex Slave* (2022), describes how her abusers applied this strategy the first time they coerced her to kill. First, they told her that as a reward, she could choose a puppy from a litter to keep. After allowing her to bond with the puppy for two days, they ordered her to stab it to death. When she refused, her abusers tortured the puppy in front of her as punishment. She stabbed it to stop their torture. She then felt responsible for its death, as her abusers had originally intended. Thereafter, whenever they directed her to kill, she describes that it felt like a mercy killing (personal communication, 2023).

5. The abusers direct a victim to harm or kill another victim under the threat of killing the first victim's loved one, e.g., a friend, parent, sibling, pet, or threaten to kill multiple victims. The victim has already been witness to the abusers' capacity and readiness to murder people.

6. The abusers punish the resisting child by coercing them to perpetrate even more horrific abuse on another victim or multiple victims. The following is a fictional example:

In the television show, *Criminal Minds*,” in an episode called *Revelations* (2015), a serial killer, Tobias Hankle, kidnaps and tortures FBI Special Agent Spencer Reid. Hankle shows Reid two women on video live-stream and tells him to: “Choose one to die.... Choose one to die, and save a life. Otherwise, they're all dead.” This work of fiction captures this simple and common tactic used against victims of ritual abuse and production of child abuse materials. Script:

<https://transcripts.foreverdreaming.org/viewtopic.php?f=31&t=12858>

7. The abusers then mock the victim for causing the increased torture that they did themselves or that they then coerced the child to do. This reliably entraps children in horrible self-condemnation despite all logic that argues against this.

8. Many survivors report that their abusers subjected them to days-long torture to induce rage-filled identities to form, whom they could then exploit to kill others. Svali (1996) explains:

... The child is severely beaten, for a long period of time, by the trainer, then told to hit the other child in the room, or they will be beaten further. If the child refuses, it is punished severely, the other child is punished as well, then the child is told to punish the other child. If the child continues to refuse, or cries, or tries to hit the trainer instead, they will continue to be beaten severely, and told to hit the other child, to direct its anger at the other child. This step is repeated until the child finally complies... The child will be taught that this is the acceptable outlet for the aggressive impulses and rage that are created by the brutality the child is constantly being exposed to.

9. Another abuser tactic is to coerce a young child to kill a baby, child, or animal, and to immediately, as a group, feign horror, shock, and moral outrage that the child did such a thing, labeling the child a “killer,” “murderer,” etc. At that moment of group shaming, the child's mind is likely to form a new dissociated self-state who has no memory of the coercion applied moments before, but who only knows that it did something unforgivable and believes itself to be a murderer.

Through application of these strategies, abusers induce identities to form who will: 1) harm other victims while under direct torture and entrapped in their abuse sites, 2) be further developed through mind control to carry out the abusers' directives and agendas in the outside world, and 3) be further developed through mind control to carry out the abusers' directives and agendas by controlling the inner system of identities.

On my website, a number of articles go into greater depth on the strategies that ritual abusers inflict on victims to coerce them to harm other victims, the kinds of identities that form in this abuse, and the self-compassion that victims can develop to overcome this trauma:

1. Coerced Perpetration: Current Understandings:

<https://endritualabuse.org/coerced-perpetration-current-understandings>

2. Are Victims of Extreme Abuse Responsible for Harm Done to Others While Not under Direct Torture? A Complex Psychological, Moral, and Legal Issue:

<https://endritualabuse.org/are-victims-responsible>

3. Work with "Abuser Personalities":

<https://endritualabuse.org/work-with-abuser-personalities/>

## **I. Hanson Report (2025) on the Murder of Children Organized Ritualistic Abuse**

Hanson devotes a section of her 2025 report to the issue of human "sacrifice" and other murders within ritual abuse, and the difficulty many people have in accepting such claims as credible.

She cites cases of long-undetected homicides, including child homicides, including:

1. Josef Fritzl

See: <https://www.cbsnews.com/news/josef-fritzl-austria-imprisoned-daughter-24-years-could-be-up-for-parole/>

2. Fred and Rosemary West. Hanson: "Fred West was charged with 12 murders, but committed suicide before his trial. Rosemary West was convicted of 10 murders" (Hanson, 2025, p. 30)

Also see: <https://time.com/7285264/fred-and-rose-west-true-story-netflix/>

3. A case of a missing 8-year-old boy in Ireland.

See: <https://www.bbc.com/news/articles/cm2zn04kvzxo>

4. Samuel Little, convicted serial killer with 50 verified homicides.

See: <https://www.fbi.gov/news/stories/samuel-little-most-prolific-serial-killer-in-us-history-100619>

Hanson includes a number of compelling survivor descriptions of murder by their ritual abuse offenders, including:

1. Punishment of victims for attempting to report their abuse

2. Murder of victims who attempted disclosure to teach a lesson to other victims to not “tell”
3. Forcing victims to participate in murders of other victims to make them believe themselves complicit
4. Child sacrifice in rituals
5. Sacrifice of infants induced to be born before term with no registered birth
6. Murder of people close to a victim, including their own babies
7. Murder of homeless people, marginalized people whose disappearances are not investigated
8. Torture-level abuse that went too far

Hanson closes this section as follows:

In recent years, the existence of hidden homicides caused by domestic abuse has been widely acknowledged in the media,<sup>26</sup> driven in large part by the pioneering work of Jane Monckton Smith, a former police officer whose concerns about domestic abuse and its investigation led her into academia.<sup>27</sup> Headway has been made in detecting these crimes through adopting a willingness to explore the worst case scenario – to see it as possible, perhaps best summed up in the poet Ralph Hodgson’s remark that ‘some things have to be believed to be seen’. This stance is not yet routinely applied to situations in which homicides linked to organised abuse may be hidden. (Hanson, 2025, p. 30)

### **J. Ritualistic Abuse as Family-Based Non-State Torture**

Canadian human rights activists, Jeanne Sarson and Linda MacDonald have produced a large body of research and literature that presents ritualistic abuse within the frameworks of “non-state torture” and “human trafficking” “child sex trafficking.”

They publish accounts by self-reported victims of ritualistic abuse, including being trafficked by familial abusers to other like-minded child abuse offenders who inflicted torture-level sadistic abuse and produced extreme CSAMs. They draw strong comparisons between the descriptions of torture provided by self-reported victims of ritualistic abuse to forms of torture used in state-sponsored and other political torture. They argue that victims of non-state torture deserve the same recognition, resource, and remedies available to victims of state-sponsored torture. They presented their findings at The United Nations Commission on the Status of Women in 2012.

Their publications are listed in full here: <https://nonstatetorture.org/research/publications>

A few of their recent publications include:

Sarson, J., Gordon, E.B., & MacDonald, L. (2019). Family-based non-state torturers who traffic their daughters: Praxis principles and healing epiphanies. In J. Winterduk & J. Jones (Eds.), *The Palgrave International Handbook of Human Trafficking*, (pp. 839–863).  
[https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-63058-8\\_51](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-63058-8_51)

Sarson, J. & MacDonald, L. (2020). Having Non-State Torture Recognized by the UN and Member States as an Infringement of Women's Human Rights Is Imperative. *Canadian Woman Studies/Les Cahiers de la Femme*, Volume 33(1 & 2), 143-155.

Sarson, J. and MacDonald, L. (2017). No Longer Invisible: Families that Torture, Traffic, and Exploit their Girl Child. *Oñati Socio-legal Series* [online], 8 (1), 85-105. Available from: <http://ssrn.com/abstract=3086626>

## **K. Lived-Experience Accounts of Ritualistic Abuse and Mind Control**

In the past few years, there is a growing movement to honor the contributions of survivors with lived experience in child abuse, trafficking, and having dissociated identities. “Lived experience” and “plurality” movements are securing a position in mainstream psychology. Psychologists, etc., are more fully recognizing the value and importance of the perspective of individuals with lived experience and seeking their perspectives in research design, policy development, etc.

Credentialed therapists who have a history of plurality and extreme abuse are also organizing to educate the public and mental health professionals about dissociation and extreme abuse. For example, the Refractory is an organization of therapists, coaches, and researchers who are “plural,” that is, having plural or dissociated identities: <https://powertotheplurals.com/refractory>.

In the field of ritual abuse and abusive mind control, many survivors have written powerful autobiographical accounts. Among those that I find the most evocative are the following:

Adams, J. (1999). *Drawn Swords: My Victory Over Childhood Ritual Abuse*. Mr. Light and Associates. Posted in full on my website: <https://endritualabuse.org/drawn-swords-my-victory-over-childhood-ritual-abuse-by-jeanne-adams-ritual-abuse-survivor-and-activist/>

Burke, S. (2010). *Wholeness: My Healing Journey from Ritual Abuse*. Authorhouse.

Fotheringham, T. (2008). Patterns in mind-control: A first person account. In J.R. Noblitt & P.S. Perskin Noblitt (Eds.) *Ritual abuse in the twenty-first century: Psychological, forensic, social and political considerations* (pp. 491-540). Bandon, Oregon: Robert Reed Publishers.

Fotheringham, T & Lacter, E (2009). A survivor speaks out.  
Video: <http://endritualabuse.org/survivor-trish-fotheringham-speaks-out/>

Hoffman, W. (2016). *Forceps: Poems about the Birth of the Self* (Fiction). Karnac.

Hoffman, W. (2019). *White Witch in a Black Robe: A True Story About Criminal Mind Control*. Aeon Books, Ltd.

Hoffman, W. (2019). *The Enslaved Queen: A Memoir about Electricity and Mind Control*. Aeon Books, Ltd.

Hoffman, W. (2020). *A Brain Of My Own: A Memoir About Dissociation Dissolved*. Aeon, Ltd.

Hoffman, W. (2022), *After Amnesia and During*, Survivorship and SmartNews websites.

Hoffman, W. (2023) *Belonging*, poems, Kelsay Books.

- Hoffman, W. (2025). *Self's Stony Soil*. Independently published.
- Hoffman, W. & Miller, A. (2018). *From the Trenches: A Victim and Therapist Talk about Mind Control and Ritual Abuse*. Routledge.
- Karriker, W. (2011). *Morning Come Quickly*, Sandime [fictionalized account].
- Kolton, S. (2022). *Brain Storm: A Life in Pieces*. FLR Press.
- Lucas, A. (2022). *Quest for Love: Memoir of a Child Sex Slave*. Unconditional Books.
- Rutz, C. (2001). *A nation betrayed: The Chilling True Story of Secret Cold War Experiments Performed on Our Children and Other Innocent People*. Grass Lake, Michigan: Fidelity Publishing.
- Sullivan, K. (2006). *Unshackled: A Survivor's Story of Mind Control*. Dandelion Books.
- Svali (1996). How the cult programs people. Retrieved November 4 2023, from: [http://www.bibliotecapleyades.net/sociopolitica/esp\\_sociopol\\_illuminati\\_svali01a.htm](http://www.bibliotecapleyades.net/sociopolitica/esp_sociopol_illuminati_svali01a.htm)
- Svali (2018). *It's Not Impossible: Healing from Ritual Abuse and Mind Control*. Independently Published.
- Svali (2024a). *Never Give Up: The Autobiography of a Survivor of Ritual Abuse and Mind Control*. Independently Published.
- Svali (2024b). *Never Give Up Part Two: The Struggle*. Independently Published.
- Svali (2025). *Never give up part three: Getting free*. Independently Published.
- Taylor, B. (1999). *Thanks For The Memories ... The Truth Has Set Me Free! The Memoirs of Bob Hope's and Henry Kissinger's Mind-Controlled Slave*. Brice Taylor Trust.
- Wehner, J.H (2022). *Walking with Aletheia: a survivor's memoir*. Logosophia, LLC
- Weinstein, H. (1988). *Father, Son and CIA*. Halifax, Nova Scotia, Canada: Formac Publishing Co.
- Additional IHTSJ Conference presentations related to the subject of organized ritualistic abuse:
- Logan Knight:  
You Just Keep Going
- Anneke Lucas (author of *Quest for Love: Memoir of a Child Sex Slave*):  
Power Dynamics in Healing from Extreme Abuse
- Chloe Collins, JD, MELP:  
Dissociative Amnesia and My Journey to Healing
- Liberty Sarkar, QSW (UK) & Amanda Pulley, MSW:  
Establishing Evidenced-Based Programming for Both Residential and Community Based  
Anti-Trafficking Programs

Anjela Glueckert, BA:

Understanding Ritual Abuse/Familial Sex Trafficking: From One Survivor's Perspective\*

Iain Bryson, MA:

A Father's Fight To Expose and End Familial Human Trafficking that Started with the International Abduction of His Own Daughter\*

## **IX. Increased Networking among Child Abuse and Trafficking Perpetrators on Dark Web Forums, Chatrooms, Etc., to Further Their Crimes**

More than ever before, offenders are networking with each on internet forums, chat rooms, and in peer-to-peer networks. On these venues, CSAM perpetrator-consumers:

1. arrange to physically face-to-face traffic children
2. trade and sell CSAMs,
3. share technological strategies to conceal their crimes from law enforcement,
4. normalize and encourage each other's abuse of children
5. freely express unbridled sexual sadism,
6. normalize, indulge, and encourage every manner of human cruelty
7. become habituated/inured to less extreme sadism
8. boast about their "successes" and compete to one-up each other's sadism (Daly, 2018)
9. share methods to groom, terrorize, and manipulate victims into submission and silence,
10. share strategies for extorting sexual content from victims,
11. By some reports, share knowledge of how to exploit victims' dissociative responses and dissociated identities to control and silence victims,

Europol's 2021 report, Internet Organised Crime Threat Assessment, states:

"The use of these specialised platforms is not limited to the dissemination of material but opens a forum of exchange for like-minded people where offenders can share experiences, methods to commit abuse, and successful countermeasures to evade or hinder detection."

They also discuss the abuse content that they view, freely express their unbridled sexual sadism, and boast about their "successes." They normalize, indulge, and encourage every manner of human cruelty. They compete to be the most gruesome and sadistic (Daly, 2018). On these forums, they become habituated/inured to less extreme sadism. The social affirmation that these peer groups provide likely serves to disinhibit offenders who may have had prior lines they would not cross (Wyre, 1992).

Matthew Graham, sentenced to 15 years for crimes the judge described as "pure evil" stated before his arrest:

“At first I felt ashamed in myself for being attracted to such a thing,” “But as time went on I slowly grew more accepting of myself. It wasn’t until I came across the Tor paedo community that I was able to truly feel comfortable with attractions.” (Daly, 2018)

These forums are a breeding ground for increasingly sadistic child abuse that helps to fuel the demand that drives the exponential growth of these violent crimes against children.

During COVID, activity on dark web forums has also increased (Europol, June 19, 2020a).

Europol’s 2021 report, Internet Organised Crime Threat Assessment, explains:

“The use of these specialised platforms is not limited to the dissemination of material but opens a forum of exchange for like-minded people where offenders can share experiences, methods to commit abuse, and successful countermeasures to evade or hinder detection.”

Europol’s 2024 report, “Internet Organised Crime Threat Assessment (IOCTA),” explains:

Forums and chatrooms are still essential networking environments for CSE offenders who exchange CSAM and discuss abuses perpetrated and fantasies, how to acquire original CSAM, techniques to groom children and OpSec [Operations Security] tips. More proficient offenders usually network in dark web forums that appear to be more and more specialised and tailored to sexual preferences. These offenders have increasingly high levels of technical knowledge, and measures to conceal their traces. The forums have specialised sections for technical and OpSec related matters with tips and training options. As these digital environments are often subject to LE takedowns, technical vulnerabilities and Distributed Denial of Service (DDoS) attacks, they usually do not have a lifespan longer than two years. To overcome such issues, the administrators in charge of these forums create mirror sites, holding a copy of its content and, whenever their site is taken down, they quickly recreate it at a new address. End-to-end encrypted (E2EE) communication platforms are increasingly being used by offenders to exchange CSAM and for communication purposes. (p. 25)

...

These interactions are facilitated through numerous forms of internet technology, including websites, email, peer-to-peer networks, internet gaming sites, social networking sites, messaging apps, anonymized networks, instant messaging, Internet Relay Chat (IRC), newsgroups, and bulletin boards. The emergence of these online communities has promoted communication between offenders in ways previously inconceivable in real life. The communities normalize and radicalize an offender’s sexual interest in children, facilitate sharing knowledge and best practices among offenders on how to avoid detection or sexually abuse children, and desensitize them to the physical and psychological damages inflicted on the children being exploited. (DoJ 2023c, p. 122)

...

Most Dark Web child exploitation communities are open forums or chat sites, which instantly connect offenders of varying degrees of sophistication. Some sites require users to pay a fee to gain access, generally using cryptocurrency payments, commercializing the abuse suffered by victims whose images are trafficked. Others require new or prospective members to provide newly produced CSAM, pushing offenders even further into their abuse of children. This amplification effect is endemic of the Dark Web, as offenders feel freer to discuss their sexual interests with others and share more niche or extreme images in the haven of these anonymized sites. These communities provide a forum for offenders to bond with one another, share stories about their past, and often go beyond just viewing and trading images to collaboratively targeting children to extort more CSAM or to gain face-to-face access to children they otherwise would never encounter.<sup>330</sup> (DoJ, 2023c, p. 125)

The United States Department of Justice 2023 Report on Child Sexual Abuse (2023c) similarly describes how offenders network in online communities:

Offenders can connect on internet forums and networks to share their interests, desires, and experiences abusing children, reveal tips for evading detection, share and trade CSAM, and livestream the abuse of a child for others to watch and direct.<sup>8</sup> These online communities promote communication and collaboration among offenders, fostering a larger relationship premised on their shared sexual interest in children. Online communities attract and encourage new individuals to join them in the sexual exploitation of children, increasing both the supply and demand side, as well as motivating more severe abuse to satiate and impress each other.

<sup>8</sup> Based on investigative and prosecutorial information provided by the authors.

<sup>9</sup> Id. Page 5

This community effect is particularly strong on protected spaces like Tor hidden services, where there is a thriving community for these like-minded offenders to congregate, discuss their shared interest in the sexual abuse of children, normalize their behavior, and encourage each other. Prior to the internet and anonymization technology such as Tor, offenders generally provided support to each other only if they met in person and disclosed their mutual sexual interest in children. On Tor, the novice becomes the expert quickly, learning how to access more material, what techniques to use to entice victims and gain their trust, and how to conceal activity from family members and law enforcement. Offenders not only encourage each other but have been known to compete with one another.<sup>10</sup> They see the sexual abuse of a child as a sport, trying to one-up others and show who is willing to take more risks or engage in more deviant conduct to victimize a child. Ego and power play large roles as offenders attempt to get more “likes” on their posts of CSAM or more followers on their sites. On some sites, administrators may deny access to certain CSAM content unless an offender produces and posts new

CSAM. Whether for access, bragging, or sharing, these communities encourage more production of CSAM, which means more abuse and more victims. This poses a grave danger to children. (DoJ, 2023, Pp. 5-6)

I am very concerned about the degree to which modern child sex traffickers and producers of CSAMs are acquiring and implementing knowledge of victims' dissociative responses to more effectively control and silence them. The following is a case example that describes this practice (this example is also included on p. 113):

Tammy (pseudonym) was enrolled in a preschool controlled by large-scale producers of sadistic child abuse materials (CSAMs), unbeknownst to her protective family. One day, during reading circle, the abusers transported Tammy off-site where they tortured and filmed her for the first time. When the abusers finished, they commanded: "When you are here, you are *Janie*. When you are home, you are Tammy. Tammy will not remember *Janie* or this place. Tammy will only remember that you were in reading circle today." *Janie* was the stage name that Tammy's abusers used in their distribution of CSAMs.

Pairing their command with torture, as well as Tammy's own need to dissociate this terrifying memory, accomplished the abusers' objective of reinforcing the formation of the new self-state, *Janie*, and in inducing the formation of a dissociative barrier between *Janie* and Tammy, making Tammy amnesiac for *Janie* and this abuse. When the abusers wanted to access the dissociated identity, *Janie*, they would simply say her name, *Janie* would take executive control, and Tammy would recede and be amnesiac for the episode.

## **X. Extreme Increases in Online Sexual Extortion of Children Apart from Any Physical Contact Between Perpetrators and Victims**

Offenders extort children online to produce CSAMs, including torture-level CSAM. Victims include very young children first contacted on gaming platforms. This is known as "sexual extortion" or "sextortion."

A simple definition is offered by the University of Southern California (2024):

Sexual Extortion (sextortion): occurs when someone threatens to distribute sexually explicit images or videos of you unless you comply with their demands. This is a combined form of Sexual Violence and Blackmail/Extortion.

Link: <https://sites.usc.edu/clientservices/definitions-related-to-sextortion/>

This form of abuse has become an escalating problem in the past two years, prompting the FBI to release a Public Service Announcement in 2023, Alert Number: I-091223-PSA in 2023, entitled: "Violent Online Groups Extort Minors to Self-Harm and Produce Child Sexual Abuse Material:"

<https://www.ic3.gov/PSA/2023/PSA230912>. Here is coverage by the British Broadcasting System: <https://www.bbc.com/news/articles/cx9wezr1d1vo>

The FBI to released a related Public Service Announcement on March 6, 2025 Alert Number: I-030625-PSA: “Violent Online Networks Target Vulnerable and Underage Populations Across the United States and Around the Globe: <https://www.ic3.gov/PSA/2025/PSA250306> . This PSA warns about violent online networks, like 764, stating:

“These networks use threats, blackmail, and manipulation to coerce or extort victims into producing, sharing, or live-streaming acts of self-harm, animal cruelty, sexually explicit acts, and/or suicide. The footage is then circulated among members of the network to continue to extort victims and exert control over them.”

...

“The networks use extortion and blackmail tactics, such as threatening to swat [1] or dox [2] their victims, if the victims do not comply with the network's demands. The actors can manipulate or coerce victims to produce Child Sexual Abuse Material (CSAM) and other videos depicting animal cruelty and self-harm. Self-harm activity can include cutting, stabbing, or fansigning. [3] Members of the networks threaten to share the explicit videos or photos of the victims with the victims' family, friends, and/or post the photos and videos to the internet. The networks control their victims through extreme fear and many members have an end-goal of forcing the victims they extort or coerce to live-stream their own suicide for the network's entertainment or the threat actor's own sense of fame.”

1 Swat also referred to as swatting is the action or practice of making false emergency calls to police or other emergency services in an attempt bring about the dispatch of armed police officers such as a SWAT team to a particular address. ←

2 Dox also referred to as doxxing is the action of obtaining and publishing personally identifiable information (PII) on the internet, usually for malicious intent. ←

3 Fansigning is writing or cutting specific numbers, letters, symbols, or names onto one's body.

At the IHTSJ Conference, the following presentations covered these forms of trafficking:

Gail Dines, PhD & Mandy Sanchez, PhD will present on:

**Social Media, Porn, Artificial Intelligence: The New Faces of Trafficking**

Sarah Ray, Msc, will present on:

**The Influenced™ Program: Empowering Students to Navigate Dangers in their Digital World\***

Lorena Vollrath-Bueno, JD, will present on:

**Generative AI and the New Landscape of Exploitation\***

Sonali Jha, PhD, will present on:

**AI and Sextortion: Student Vulnerability, Awareness, and Prevention**

In 2024, Europol described this threat as follows:

The online sexual extortion of minors is a rising threat, perpetrated by criminals driven by both a sexual interest towards children and financial gain. (Europol, 2024, P. 24)

...

Self-generated sexual material is also often the result of online sexual grooming and extortion. In this setting, the perpetrator identifies the victim online, often on gaming platforms or social media, and after gaining their trust through grooming, perpetrators obtain sexually explicit material and use it as leverage for extortion. A feeling of shame and the hope that the threats might stop often lead victims to produce more self-generated sexual material.

In addition to extortion for new CSAM, some offenders also extort money from their victims. Through a similar criminal process, perpetrators approach their victims pretending to be peers looking for a romantic relationship, then turn into blackmailers once they have received the first explicit image from the minor. They threaten the victim that they will share the explicit image online or send it to close contacts. The victim often pays out of shame and, in many cases, the extortion process lasts for a considerable time. (Europol, 2024, p. 25)

Europol made a press release on this subject on February, 5, 2025. This press release begins with:

Law enforcement targets online cult communities dedicated to extremely violent child abuse: US Homeland Security Investigations, supported by Europol and the French Police, arrested members of an online community dedicated to grooming, sexual abuse, acts of cruelty, torture and murders

Europol (2015) describes the gruesome, brutal nature of this abuse, including murder, as follows:

Law enforcement authorities target members of prolific online communities dedicated to the sexual abuse of children and manipulation of vulnerable minors into committing violent crimes. This coercion into committing violent crime spans multiple areas, including acts of cruelty against people and animals, murder and self-harm. These extremist communities are part of a larger online network, so called “The Com”. Through this network, extremists around the world collude to groom and abuse children. These groups operate virtually in easily accessible online spaces such as social media platforms, mobile applications and online gaming platforms. International cooperation via Europol has intensified in the past year, leading to the identification of dangerous individuals and the safeguarding of victims, mostly vulnerable minors.

Link:

[https://www.europol.europa.eu/media-press/newsroom/news/law-enforcement-targets-online-cult-communities-dedicated-to-extremely-violent-child-abuse?mtm\\_campaign=newsletter](https://www.europol.europa.eu/media-press/newsroom/news/law-enforcement-targets-online-cult-communities-dedicated-to-extremely-violent-child-abuse?mtm_campaign=newsletter)

Multiple sources indicate that many victims of such online extortion of CSAMs are very young.

In 2024, the British Broadcasting System (BBC) published an article titled: Three-year-olds groomed online, charity warns (Chris Vallance on April 22, 2024) that indicated:

Sexual predators are grooming children under six into performing “disturbing” acts of sexual abuse via phones or webcams a charity has warned.

The Internet Watch Foundation (IWF) said it had discovered more than two thousand remotely filmed child abuse images of three to six-year-olds online in 2023.  
<https://www.bbc.com/news/articles/cx9wezr1d1vo>

The Internet Watch Foundation’s 2022 Annual Report (2023) reports:

From the first half of 2020 to 2022, the IWF reported a 360% increase in the instances of ‘self-generated’ sexual imagery of 7-10 year olds.[56] Furthermore, the majority of child sexual abuse material featuring children aged 0-6 years is of the highest severity, classified as ‘Category A’ material.[57] Children aged 11-13 years have featured in more than half of the child sexual abuse imagery detected in the past three years by the IWF, [58] most of which is ‘self generated’. On the dark web, 45% of respondents in a survey of child sexual abuse material users disclosed that they mostly seek abuse imagery of children aged 4-13 years. [59] (Cited by WeProtect Global Alliance (2023), p. 12)

The majority of child sexual abuse material featuring children aged 0-6 years is of the highest severity, classified as ‘Category A’.<sup>8</sup> Online grooming, which was identified in the previous Global Threat Assessment as a key concern, has evolved particularly insidiously within social gaming environments. New insight from risk intelligence organisation Crisp reveals that individuals seeking to abuse children in these environments are able to lock them into high-risk grooming conversations in as little as 19 seconds after the first message, with an average time of just 45 minutes. (Cited by WeProtect Global Alliance, 2023, pp. 4-5)

In my work as a psychotherapist, I hear accounts of ritualistic abusers who began their abuse hands-on, but then continued their abuse through online extortion to coerce victims to abuse other victims, such as in sibling groups, to maintain their abuse, terrorization, and control.

Also see:

Chauviré-Geib, K., & Fegert, J. M. (2024). Victims of Technology-Assisted Child Sexual Abuse: A Scoping Review. *Trauma, Violence & Abuse*, 25(2), 1335–1348. <https://doi.org/10.1177/15248380231178754>  
[https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC10913305/pdf/10.1177\\_15248380231178754.pdf](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC10913305/pdf/10.1177_15248380231178754.pdf)

## **XI. Use of Generative Artificial intelligence (GAI) to Generate or Alter CSAM and Extort Victims**

Gail Dines, PhD & Mandy Sanchez, PhD will present at the IHTSJ conference on: **Social Media, Porn, Artificial Intelligence: The New Faces of Trafficking**

Since 2023, generative artificial intelligence (GAI) technology has enabled new forms of CSAM.

On March 12, 2024, John Shehan, Senior Vice President of the Exploited Children Division & International Engagement of the National Center for Missing & Exploited Children (2024) testified to the United States House Committee on Oversight and Accountability Subcommittee on Cybersecurity, Information Technology, and Government Innovation, on the use of generative artificial intelligence (GAI) to generate or alter CSAM and the associated threats. He stated:

The emergence over the past year of generative artificial intelligence (GAI) platforms that can be used to create child sexual abuse material (CSAM)<sup>1</sup> and facilitate child sexual exploitation is a recent example of a new technology that is challenging efforts to keep children safe and to detect, identify, remove, investigate, and prosecute online CSAM and sexually exploitative content relating to children.

Shehan's testimony offers a description of the myriad of ways in which GAI is now being used to abuse and extort children. See:

<https://oversight.house.gov/wp-content/uploads/2024/03/Final-Written-Testimony-of-John-Shehan.pdf>

One dangerous application of GAI is to alter a clothed image of a child to make the child appear nude, to then threaten to circulate this image in order to extort money or behavior from a victim.

Europol's 2024 Report on Internet Organised Crime Threat Assessment also addresses this emerging threat:

The use of AI, which allows CSE offenders to generate or alter CSAM, is set to further proliferate in the near future. The production of artificial CSAM increments the amount of illicit material in circulation and complicates the identification of victims as well as perpetrators. (P. 24)

...

AI models able to generate or alter images are being abused by offenders to produce CSAM and for sexual extortion. Such models have developed quickly, with output that now increasingly resembles genuine material, making it harder to identify as artificially generated. AI-generated CSAM has already been reported in 2023 and is expected to become prominent in the near future.

This poses great challenges to LEAs in identifying the real victims as well as the legal framework under which the investigation should fall. Even in the cases when the content is fully artificial and there is no real victim depicted, AI-generated CSAM still contributes to the objectification and sexualisation of children. The generation of these types of artificial images increases the amount of CSAM material in circulation and makes it

harder to identify both victims and perpetrators. This production process is also widely available and does not require high levels of technical expertise, potentially broadening the number and spectrum of perpetrators. These files can easily be used for cyberbullying\* or for sexual extortion.

The greater the volume of artificial CSAM in circulation, the more difficult it will become to identify offenders or victims through image recognition. In order to counter such emerging challenges, specialised CSE investigators will have to find new investigative pathways and tools. 2024 (P. 25-26)

...

### Cyberbullying with AI-altered CSAM

LEAs in Spain looked into its first cases of image manipulation with AI linked to cyberbullying in 2023. The suspects, all minors and some younger than 14 years old, were taking pictures of at least 22 young girls and digitally altering those images with an AI powered application in order to convert them into sexually explicit images and perpetrate acts of cyberbullying. The artificial images were then widely disseminated on social media and communication applications, with the victims suffering significant psychological damage.

Reference: Reuters, 25 September 2023, ‘Spanish prosecutor to probe AI-generated images of naked minors’

\* Cyberbullying is bullying with the use of digital technologies. It can take place on social media, messaging platforms, gaming platforms or mobile phones. It is repeated behaviour that aims to frighten, rile or shame its victims.” (P. 26)

A 2024 Report by United Nations Special Rapporteur similarly addressed the severity of this new online threat to children:

The report elaborates on how the misuse of existing and emerging technologies exacerbates and amplifies children’s exposure to risks, harms and various forms of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse.

“Existing technologies are misused to sexually harass, take and share non-consensual images and videos, generate child sexual abuse materials, sexually extort children and livestream child sexual abuse,” Singhateh said.

“Emerging technologies such as deepfakes, nudifying, de-aging, artificial intelligence, embedded peer-to-peer file sharing and voice cloning , amplify and extend existing methods to exploit children and produce child sexual abuse materials,” the expert said.

The report points out that without immediate action, the phenomenon will be further exacerbated by pre-existing inequalities, resulting in additional violations of the rights of children, with a disproportionate impact on those from vulnerable and marginalised groups.

For further information on GAI-facilitated CSAM, see:

Federal Bureau of Investigation (March 29, 2024). FBI Alert Number: I-032924-PSA: Child Sexual Abuse Material Created by Generative AI and Similar Online Tools is Illegal. Downloaded January 2025: <https://www.ic3.gov/PSA/2024/PSA240329>

Federal Bureau of Investigation (December 3, 2024). Public Service Announcement Alert Number: I-120324-PSA: Criminals Use Generative Artificial Intelligence to Facilitate Financial Fraud. Downloaded January, 2025: <https://www.ic3.gov/PSA/2024/PSA241203?ftag=MSF0951a18>

Internet Watch Foundation (July 2024). What has Changed in the AI CSAM Landscape? Downloaded January, 2025: [https://www.iwf.org.uk/media/drufozvi/iwf-ai-csam-report\\_update-public-jul24v12.pdf](https://www.iwf.org.uk/media/drufozvi/iwf-ai-csam-report_update-public-jul24v12.pdf)

News Nation, (2024) Tip line overwhelmed by AI-generated child abuse material <https://www.msn.com/en-us/money/other/tip-line-overwhelmed-by-ai-generated-child-abuse-material/ar-AA1nxlox>

## **XII. Greater Evidence of Abuse in Daycare and Schools**

Child abuse that occurs in schools, or that is facilitated by school personnel is also under-represented in reports on child sex trafficking.

Based in my work as a psychologist, I believe school-based sexual abuse is increasing, perhaps, in part, due to the enormous modern-day financial profits to be made in production of CSAMs.

Ross Cheit, JD, Ph.D., Professor Emeritus of International and Public Affairs and Political Science at Brown University, led a large scale and meticulous forensic investigation into the preschool and daycare child sexual abuse cases of the 1980s and 1990s, and published the findings in a large volume: *The Witch-hunt Narrative: Politics, Psychology, and the Sexual Abuse of Children* (2014). This book documents the significant forensic evidence of child sexual abuse in most of these cases, which had been mis-characterized by the False Memory Syndrome Foundation and many other participants in the *memory wars* as a witch-hunt. Dr. Cheit continues to document cases of child abuse and the validity of recovered memories of child abuse on his website: <https://www.recoveredmemory.org/about-the-team>

In 2021, the Mexico Oficina de Defensoría de Derechos de la Infancia (The Office of the Ombudsman for the Rights of the Child) published a comprehensive 73-page report (in English)

about child sexual exploitation in preschools and schools in Mexico. It is titled: “It’s a Secret: Child Sexual Exploitation in Schools. It begins:

Over the years ODI has litigated cases in which very young children describe suffering unimaginable violence in public and private preschools and grade schools. Hurt in groups by multiple adults, the aggressions the children describe surpass even the most severe cases of child sexual abuse that had been documented up to this day. Subjected to a combination of sexual, physical and psychological violence, what the children describe could be indicative of several public and private schools having been captured by criminals and used to commit crimes of online child sexual exploitation.

This report documents cases litigated by ODI in representation of boys and girls that have been victims of organized sexual violence in schools. It also includes information taken from cases covered by the media and data obtained from public records. Recommendations issued by local and federal human rights commissions served as an important source. The cases identified are notably different from the unfortunately numerous cases of child sexual abuse committed by individual teachers against one or more students. These cases demonstrate patterns of criminal behavior characterized by organized aggressions committed by multiple adults perpetrated in mass scale within the premises of a given school. (P. 7)

I have not yet found a comparable report on this subject by a United States government agency. However, I have not completed a literature search on child abuse in the schools.

As a psychotherapist, I am witness to accounts of horrific organized sexual abuse, sex trafficking, and CSAM production, perpetrated in schools of all grade levels, preschool through grade school, junior high, and high school, a) within fully corrupted schools, or b) by staff in infiltrated schools, both onsite, and in locations where offenders transport children offsite during school hours. This can occur in without parental knowledge and in neighborhoods of all social strata.

### **Example: A Child Sexual Abuse Ring at the Archbishop Keough High School in Baltimore**

The Netflix documentary, *The Keepers*, documents the 1969 unsolved murder of Sister Cathy Cesnick, an English teacher at the all-girls Archbishop Keough High School in Baltimore.

Many victims report being sexually abused by a number of clergy at this school, including the Director of Religious Studies and the School Counselor/Chaplain.

Jean Wehner was one of Sister Cathy’s students and is featured in *The Keepers*. Jean makes a credible case that her abusers killed Sister Cathy because Jean had just disclosed her sexual abuse to Sister Cathy and Sister Cathy was planning to act to protect her.

In 2022, Jean authored a book, *Walking with Aletheia: A Survivor's Memoir*. This book describes her abusers use of their spiritual authority to control and silence her. She goes into great depth about her dissociative processes and lengthy healing journey. I review her book here: <https://endritualabuse.org/the-keepers-trafficking-ring-widens/>

Lynn Schirmer is a colleague who describes herself as “a survivor of trafficking and human experimentation, beginning in childhood,” including victimization with the United States MKULTRA program. Lynn reports that she suffered torture-level abuse by Dr. Richter, a doctor named in *The Keepers* as complicit in the sexual abuse of the students at Keough High School.

Schirmer discusses this abuse in a two-part interview with Shane and Gemma, two activists who have been bringing to light Sister Cathy's murder and the abuse at Keough High School. See: <https://www.itsfoulplay.com/21-sister-cathy/s2-ep45-sister-cathy-a-survivors-account-unveiling-mkultra>  
<https://www.itsfoulplay.com/21-sister-cathy/s2e46-sister-cathy-a-survivors-account-unveiling-mkultra-part-2>

The Israeli case discussed above on which survivor testimony was just presented (2025) in the Israeli Knesset alleges organized ritual abuse taking place in infiltrated schools.

### **XIII. Greater Evidence of Clergy Abuse**

I have yet to review the current status of clergy abuse.

Two important references are:

Commonwealth of Australia (December 15, 2017). The Final Report of the Royal Commission into Institutional Responses to Child Sexual Abuse Downloaded January, 2025:  
<https://www.royalcommission.gov.au/child-abuse/final-report>  
[https://www.royalcommission.gov.au/system/files/2021-08/final\\_report\\_-\\_preface\\_and\\_executive\\_summary.pdf](https://www.royalcommission.gov.au/system/files/2021-08/final_report_-_preface_and_executive_summary.pdf)

Mcgraw, D., Ebadi, M., Dalenberg, C., Wu, V., Naish, B., & Stal, L. (2019). Consequences of Abuse by Religious Authorities: A Review. *Traumatology*. 25. 10.1037/trm0000183.

### **XIV. Indications of Increased Use of Drugs to Abuse and Control Victims**

As a psychologist, I am increasingly hearing client reports of offenders using drug agents to:

1. induce immobility
2. cause victims to feel pain and distress while immobilized,
3. induce noxious states to abuse or punish
4. associate sexual abuse with pleasure
5. reward
6. induce confusion or hallucinations
7. increase suggestibility

8. Induce amnesia for the abuse
9. create addictions

I have yet to review the research to find data on drugs used in child sexual abuse.

## **XV. Greater Evidence of Child Abuse Within Children’s Recreational Organizations**

Some references:

Hamilton, M.A. & Timon, C.E. (2020). Scouting Abuse: Analysis of Victims’ Experiences, Part I. ChildUSA. <https://childusa.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/Analysis-of-Victims-of-Abuse-in-Scouting-Part-1-1.pdf>

Hamilton, M.A. & Timon, C.E. (2021). Preliminary Report: Five Key Findings of the Elite Athlete Survey. ChildUSA. <https://childusa.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/Five-Key-Findings-from-the-EAS-7.9.2021-Updated.pdf>

## **XVI. Increased Abuse and Neglect Secondary to Increased Poverty and Homelessness**

The Nottingham report (2023) discusses that children of poverty are at higher risk of child sex trafficking and CSAM production. However, this report places significant emphasis on CSAM production in economically-disadvantaged countries, such as the Philippines.

Many North American clients have reported to me and my colleagues that their CSAM perpetrators and ritual abusers kidnap and exploit homeless children, teens, and adults, in the production of CSAMs and snuff films. Traffickers can easily kidnap a whole family off of the street, particularly in isolated areas in the night, entice them or force them into a van, and take them to their abuse sites facility, without anyone realizing or reporting that these individuals have gone missing.

I am very concerned about recent increases in homelessness and the profitability of child abuse are contributing to the higher prevalence of of CSAM production and hands-on trafficking.

At the IHTSJ Conference, the issue of trafficking among the homeless was covered by Fonda J. Royster, MA in the presentation:

Breaking the Cycle: Addressing Unaccompanied Homelessness\*

### **Who Needs this Information?**

We all need to increase our knowledge of modern-day sex trafficking of pre-adolescent children, including its prevalence, severity, production of CSAMs, the role of familial traffickers, and the role of organized crime networks in the perpetration of child abuse and child sex trafficking.

This is necessary in order to recognize, identify, and protect victims. Our institutions need to get up to speed: law enforcement, child protection, the judiciary, medical and mental health professionals and professional organizations, educators, researchers, the media, and society at large. Even protective parents have no way to recognize that their children have been abused in these ways unless awareness of these forms of abuse is raised in society on a large scale.

My own work is psychotherapy. Even in the field of psychology, even in the sub-fields of trauma and dissociation, we have a long way to go in educating ourselves about the current trends in the abuse of children. When a therapist is uneducated about the evolving nature of child abuse and the forms of abuse that a client has experienced, and perhaps even expresses incredulity directly or indirectly, this can irreparably damage the ability of the client to get help. Clients, and their trauma-bearing dissociated self-states, are usually only able to disclose abuse content that they believe their therapists will find believable. Survivors are very sensitive to the risk of being disbelieved, dismissed, judged to be delusional, schizophrenic, etc.

When psychologists are aware of the severe, sophisticated, and evolving nature of extreme and organized forms of child abuse, this creates a therapeutic space for clients to process and disclose this content in therapy. Survivors can sense how deep we run, how much knowledge and sorrow we hold, and will open up or shut down accordingly.

The Canadian Centre emphasizes the critical role of knowledgeable therapists (C3P, 2017a, p.36):

Therapists and counsellors can play a significant role in the recovery of organized sexual abuse survivors. For example, over one-third of these (n=67) indicated that their therapist was the first person they told about their hands-on abuse — see Graph 67. These survivors also highlighted the difficulty in connecting with a therapist who could meet their unique needs. When asked if they had seen more than one therapist/counsellor/treatment provider, most (93%) of these survivors said they had seen more than one service provider (n=66) — see Graph 68. Reasons for changing counsellors varied, but for more than half (51%) one of the reasons given was because the survivor felt their existing therapist was unable to help them (n=62) — see Graph 69

The Canadian Centre explains the dangers of institutional disavowal (C3P, 2017a, p.39):

“The efforts of perpetrators to silence their accounts through threats and violence was in many ways perpetrated by institutionalized forces of disavowal and disbelief that actively undermined their efforts to seek care and support, and prevented them from finding justice for the crimes committed against them and witnessed by them,”xiv

A survivor explained the devastation of not being believed as follows (C3P, 2017a, p.35):

“Be aware that people are capable of doing extreme and atrocious things to one another, even if you would like to deny that. Not being believed is often as painful as the abuse itself.” – Survivor, in response to the question “What do you want therapist to know”

The Canadian Centre report concludes with an urgent plea for action (C3P, 2017a, p. 41):

The reasons outlined above are significant barriers to victims reporting their abuse and in no way should such fears or apprehensions be marginalized. Still, given the very real probability that several of the survey respondents are still being abused, and given the near certainty that other children are currently victims of multi-perpetrator sexual abuse, now more than ever, there is a real and tangible urgency “to raise the profile of organized abuse among those most likely to encounter sexual abuse cases.” [xv] We hope, therefore, that both the courage in coming forward and the accounts provided by the respondents of our survey will help increase public awareness, encourage other survivors to disclose and seek help, and provide a measure of hope to both survivors and current victims. Ultimately, the challenge is how to integrate the data we have collected into policy and practice. [xvi]

Per C3P, 2017a, p. 43:

Due to the horrifying and seemingly incredible nature of child sexual abuse, disbelief and skepticism remain common responses from those confronted with disclosures of child sexual abuse. Perhaps it is easier to dismiss such accounts as made-up stories, coerced testimonies, or the result of mental health problems (as many professionals have done in the past), than to accept the possibility that some people are capable of inflicting unspeakable physical and mental trauma on children. Wanting something to be true because it is easier for one to accept or to comprehend, however, does not (and will not) change the fact that such people do exist and that child sexual abuse – and its capture in images and videos – is a reality experienced by too many children.

More information on many of these issues can be found on my website: [www.endritualabuse.org](http://www.endritualabuse.org)

## References

- ABC.Net Australia (2018). Australian Peter Scully given life sentence for human trafficking, rape in Philippines, reports say (<http://www.abc.net.au/news/2018-06-14/australian-peter-scully-convicted-in-philippines/9868958>)
- Acar, K.V. (2017). Child abuse materials as digital goods: Why we should fear new commercial forms, *Economics Discussion Papers*, No. 2017-15, Kiel Institute for the World Economy (IfW), Kiel. Full text available here: <https://www.econstor.eu/bitstream/10419/157247/1/884350916.pdf>
- Adams, J. (1999). Drawn Swords: My victory over childhood ritual abuse. Available in full here: <https://endritualabuse.org/drawn-swords-my-victory-over-childhood-ritual-abuse-by-jeanne-adams-ritual-abuse-survivor-and-activist/>
- Allert, J.L. (2022). Domestic Minor Familial Sex Trafficking A National Study of Prevalence, Characteristics, and Challenges across the Justice Process. Institute for Shelter Care. Full-text: <https://humantraffickingsearch.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/07/Familial-Trafficking-Study-FINAL.pdf>
- Becker, T., Karriker, W., Overkamp, B., & Rutz, C. (2007). *Extreme Abuse Survey Project*. Retrieved June 12, 2010, from: <http://extreme-abuse-survey.net>
- Becker, T., Karriker, W., Rutz, C., & Overkamp, B. (2013). Extreme abuse survey series: Development, findings, and consequences. Catawba, NC: Sandime.
- Bowart, W. & Condon, R. (1978). Operation Mind Control: The CIA's Plot Against America. CreateSpace Independent Publishing Platform
- Bracket Foundation. (2019). Artificial Intelligence - Combating online sexual abuse of children. Retrieved January 2023, from: <https://respect.international/ai-combating-online-sexual-abuse-of-children/>
- Brannock, M. K., Quesenberry, D. L., Smith, M. G., & Blackwell, R. L. (2024). Familial sex trafficking in the United States: A scoping review guided by the Three Ps Framework to end human trafficking. *Child abuse & neglect*, 158, 107143. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chiabu.2024.107143>  
[https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S0145213424005337?dgcid=raven\\_sd\\_via\\_email](https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S0145213424005337?dgcid=raven_sd_via_email)
- Brown, R. (2023). Prevalence of viewing online child sexual abuse material among Australian adults. In *Trends and issues in crime and criminal justice*. No. 682. Canberra: Australian Institute of Criminology.
- Bryant, N. (2012). *The Franklin Scandal: A Story of Powerbrokers, Child Abuse & Betrayal*. Trine Day.
- Bryant, N. (2021, November 30). The Jeffrey Epstein Cover Up: Pedophilia, Lies, and Ghislaine Maxwell. Scheer Post. <https://scheerpost.com/2021/11/30/the-jeffrey-epstein-cover-up-pedophilia-lies-and-videotape>
- Bryant, N. (2014). The Franklin Scandal: The Cover-up of Child Abuse and it's Analogues to Associative Identity Disorder. In V. Sar, W. Middleton & M. Dorahy (Eds.) *Global Perspectives on Dissociative Disorders: Individual and Societal Oppression*, pp 155-183.
- Bureau of Justice Statistics (BJS): 2023 Trafficking in Persons Report: [https://2021-2025.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2023/05/Trafficking-in-Persons-Report-2023\\_Introduction-Additional-Pagesv4\\_FINAL.pdf](https://2021-2025.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2023/05/Trafficking-in-Persons-Report-2023_Introduction-Additional-Pagesv4_FINAL.pdf)
- Bursztein, E., Clarke, E., DeLaune, M., Eliff, D.M., Hsu, N., Olson, L., Shehan, J., Thakur, M., Thomas, K., & Bright, T. (2019). Rethinking the Detection of Child Sexual Abuse Imagery on the Internet. The World Wide Web Conference. Full text available here: <https://storage.googleapis.com/gweb-research2023-media/pubtools/5020.pdf>

Canadian Centre for Child Protection (C3P) (2016a). Child Sexual Abuse Images on the Internet: A Cybertip.ca Analysis. Canadian Centre for Child Protection. Retrieved from: <https://www.protectchildren.ca/en/resources-research/child-sexual-abuse-images-report/>  
Link to pdf (scroll down): <https://protectchildren.ca/en/resources-research/child-sexual-abuse-images-report>

Canadian Centre for Child Protection (C3P) (2016b). Child Sexual Abuse Images on the Internet: Summary of key findings. Canadian Centre for Child Protection (C3P). Retrieved from:  
Link to pdf (scroll down): <https://protectchildren.ca/en/resources-research/child-sexual-abuse-images-report>

Canadian Centre for Child Protection (C3P) (2017a). Survivor's Survey Executive Summary. Retrieved on August 20, 2017, from: [https://content.c3p.ca/pdfs/C3P\\_SurvivorsSurveyExecutiveSummary2017\\_en.pdf](https://content.c3p.ca/pdfs/C3P_SurvivorsSurveyExecutiveSummary2017_en.pdf)

Canadian Centre of Child Protection (C3P) (2017b). Survivors' Survey: Full Report. C3P.  
Link (scroll down to click on pdfs): <https://protectchildren.ca/en/resources-research/survivors-survey-results/>

Chauviré-Geib, K., & Fegert, J. M. (2024). Victims of Technology-Assisted Child Sexual Abuse: A Scoping Review. *Trauma, Violence & Abuse*, 25(2), 1335–1348. <https://doi.org/10.1177/15248380231178754>  
[https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC10913305/pdf/10.1177\\_15248380231178754.pdf](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC10913305/pdf/10.1177_15248380231178754.pdf)

Cheit, R. (2014). *The Witch-hunt Narrative: Politics, Psychology, and the Sexual Abuse of Children*. Oxford University Press.

Child Helpline International (2023). Online Child Sexual Exploitation and Abuse (OCSEA) An escalating problem that is alarmingly underreported.  
<https://childhelplineinternational.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/11/2023-OCSEA-Report.pdf>

Commonwealth of Australia (December 15, 2017). The Final Report of the Royal Commission into Institutional Responses to Child Sexual Abuse Downloaded January, 2025:  
<https://www.royalcommission.gov.au/child-abuse/final-report>  
[https://www.royalcommission.gov.au/system/files/2021-08/final\\_report\\_-\\_preface\\_and\\_executive\\_summary.pdf](https://www.royalcommission.gov.au/system/files/2021-08/final_report_-_preface_and_executive_summary.pdf)

Cubitt, T., Napier, S., & Brown, R. (2021). Predicting Prolific Live Streaming of Child Sexual Abuse. *Trends and Issues in Crime and Criminal Justice*(634), 1-21.

Daly, M. (2018) Inside the Repulsive World of 'Hurtcore', the Worst Crimes Imaginable. *Vice*:  
[https://www.vice.com/en\\_uk/article/59kye3/the-repulsive-world-of-hurtcore-the-worst-crimes-imaginable](https://www.vice.com/en_uk/article/59kye3/the-repulsive-world-of-hurtcore-the-worst-crimes-imaginable)

Dance, G.J.X. (December 23, 2019). Fighting the Good Fight Against Online Child Sexual Abuse. *New York Times*.

Dedase-Escoton, V., Walker, S., Schurter, D., Moreno, E., Diaz, N., & Silva, S. (2020). A Study on Online Sexual Exploitation of Children for Aftercare Reintegration. Retrieved January 2022, from  
[https://osec.ijm.org/documents/19/IJM-Aftercare-Reintegration\\_research-2021.pdf](https://osec.ijm.org/documents/19/IJM-Aftercare-Reintegration_research-2021.pdf)

Department of Homeland Security (2024). Know the Threat: Online Child Sexual Exploitation & Abuse. Full text online: [https://www.dhs.gov/sites/default/files/2024-04/24\\_0408\\_k2p\\_csea-onepager.pdf](https://www.dhs.gov/sites/default/files/2024-04/24_0408_k2p_csea-onepager.pdf)

Dombert, B., Schmidt, A. F., Banse, R., Briken, P., Hoyer, J., Neutze, J., & Osterheider, M. (2016). How common is men's self-reported sexual interest in prepubescent children? *The Journal of Sex Research*, 53(2), 214–223.

Dorahy, M., Gold, S. & O'Neil, J. (2022). *Dissociation and the Dissociative Disorders: Past, Present, Future*. Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group. 10.4324/9781003057314.

Dube, S. R., Felitti, V. J., Dong, M., Chapman, D. P., Giles, W. H., & Anda, R. F. (2003). Childhood abuse, neglect, and household dysfunction and the risk of illicit drug use: The Adverse Childhood Experiences Study. *Pediatrics*, 111(3), 564-572.

Divakarmurthy, P., Requião da Cunha, B., Passold, J.F., Oliveira, M., & Menezes, R. (2024). Unravelling the dynamics of child sexual exploitation material circulation on the Dark Web. *PLoS ONE*19(7): e0306516. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0306516> In full text here: <https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC11268584/pdf/pone.0306516.pdf>

ECPAT International. (2017). Online child sexual exploitation: An analysis of emerging and selected issues. Retrieved January 2023, from [http://ecpat.de/wp-content/uploads/2018/08/Journal\\_No12-ebook.pdf](http://ecpat.de/wp-content/uploads/2018/08/Journal_No12-ebook.pdf)

ECPAT, & INTERPOL (2018). Towards a global indicator on unidentified victims in child sexual exploitation material. Technical report. <https://bit.ly/3155vHd>. [ECPAT: End Child Prostitution in Asian Tourism]

ECPAT France. (2022). Deep Dive into the Phenomenon of Live Online Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation: How to Better Protect Children? Retrieved January 2022, from [https://ecpat-france.fr/www.ecpat-france/wp-content/uploads/2022/06/Recherche-live-streaming\\_web.pdf](https://ecpat-france.fr/www.ecpat-france/wp-content/uploads/2022/06/Recherche-live-streaming_web.pdf)

Edwards, E.E., Middleton, J., & Cole, J. (2022). Family-Controlled Trafficking in the United States: Victim Characteristics, System Response, and Case Outcomes. *Journal of Human Trafficking*, 10, 411 - 429.

Ellis, A., Simiola, V., Brown, L. S., Courtois, C. A., & Cook, J. M. (2017). Effect of evidence-based therapy relationships on treatment outcome for adults with trauma: A systematic review. *Journal of Trauma & Dissociation*, 16:1-29. doi: 10.1080/15299732.2017.1329771

European Commission, European Union (August, 2025). Protecting children from sexual abuse. Downloaded August, 2025: [https://home-affairs.ec.europa.eu/policies/internal-security/protecting-children-sexual-abuse\\_en](https://home-affairs.ec.europa.eu/policies/internal-security/protecting-children-sexual-abuse_en)

Europol (2018). Internet Organized Crime Threat Assessment. 2018 Report. Downloaded January 2025. <https://www.europol.europa.eu/sites/default/files/documents/iocta2018.pdf>

Europol (June 19, 2020a). Exploiting Isolation: Offenders and Victims of Online Child Sexual Abuse during the COVID-19 Pandemic. Retrieved September 8, 2020: <https://www.europol.europa.eu/publications-documents/exploiting-isolation-offenders-and-victims-of-online-child-sexual-abuse-during-covid-19-pandemic>

Europol. (2020b). Catching the virus: cybercrime, disinformation and the COVID-19 pandemic. Retrieved January 2023, from [https://www.europol.europa.eu/cms/sites/default/files/documents/catching\\_the\\_virus\\_cybercrime\\_disinformation\\_and\\_the\\_covid-19\\_pandemic\\_0.pdf](https://www.europol.europa.eu/cms/sites/default/files/documents/catching_the_virus_cybercrime_disinformation_and_the_covid-19_pandemic_0.pdf)

Europol. (2020c). Internet Organized Crime Threat Assessment. 2020 Report Retrieved January 2025, from: [https://www.europol.europa.eu/sites/default/files/documents/internet\\_organised\\_crime\\_threat\\_assessment\\_iocta\\_2020.pdf](https://www.europol.europa.eu/sites/default/files/documents/internet_organised_crime_threat_assessment_iocta_2020.pdf)

Europol (2021). Internet Organised Crime Threat Assessment. 2021 Report. Downloaded January 2025: [https://www.europol.europa.eu/cms/sites/default/files/documents/internet\\_organised\\_crime\\_threat\\_assessment\\_iocta\\_2021.pdf](https://www.europol.europa.eu/cms/sites/default/files/documents/internet_organised_crime_threat_assessment_iocta_2021.pdf)

Europol (2022a). Child sexual exploitation. <https://www.europol.europa.eu/crime-areas-and-statistics/crime-areas/child-sexual-exploitation>. Accessed 1/6/2025

Europol (2022b). Online sexual coercion and extortion of children. <https://www.europol.europa.eu/crime-areas/child-sexual-exploitation/online-sexual-coercion-and-extortion-of-children>

Europol (2024). Internet Organised Crime Threat Assessment (IOCTA), Publications Office of the European Union, Luxembourg.

<https://www.europol.europa.eu/cms/sites/default/files/documents/Internet%20Organised%20Crime%20Threat%20Assessment%20IOCTA%202024.pdf>

Europol (February 5, 2025). Press Release. Law enforcement targets online cult communities dedicated to extremely violent child abuse. Downloaded February, 2025.

[https://www.europol.europa.eu/media-press/newsroom/news/law-enforcement-targets-online-cult-communities-dedicated-to-extremely-violent-child-abuse?mtm\\_campaign=newsletter](https://www.europol.europa.eu/media-press/newsroom/news/law-enforcement-targets-online-cult-communities-dedicated-to-extremely-violent-child-abuse?mtm_campaign=newsletter)

Farley, M. & Kennedy, M. (2024). Torture and its sequelae among prostituted women in the United States. *European Journal of Psychotraumatology*, 15(1), 1-12. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/20008066.2024.2404307>

Federal Bureau of Investigation (September 12, 2023). Public Service Announcement FBI: Alert Number: I-091223-PSA: Violent Online Groups Extort Minors to Self-Harm and Produce Child Sexual Abuse Material. Downloaded January 2025: <https://www.ic3.gov/PSA/2023/PSA230912>

Federal Bureau of Investigation (March 29, 2024). FBI Alert Number: I-032924-PSA: Child Sexual Abuse Material Created by Generative AI and Similar Online Tools is Illegal. Downloaded January 2025: <https://www.ic3.gov/PSA/2024/PSA240329>

Federal Bureau of Investigation (December 3, 2024). Public Service Announcement Alert Number: I-120324-PSA: Criminals Use Generative Artificial Intelligence to Facilitate Financial Fraud. Downloaded January, 2025: <https://www.ic3.gov/PSA/2024/PSA241203?ftag=MSF0951a18>

Federal Bureau of Investigation (2024). FBI: What We Investigate: Violent Crimes Against Children <https://www.fbi.gov/investigate/violent-crime/vcac>

Finkelhor, D., Turner, H., Colburn, D. (2022). Prevalence of online sexual offenses against children in the US. *JAMA Netw Open* 5(10). doi:10.1001/jamanetworkopen.2022.34471 <https://childhelplineinternational.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/11/2023-OCSEA-Report.pdf>

Finkelhor, D., Turner, H., & Colburn, D. (2023). Which dynamics make online child sexual abuse and cyberstalking more emotionally impactful: Perpetrator identity and images?. *Child abuse & neglect*, 137, 106020. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chiabu.2023.106020>

Finkelhor, D., Turner, H.A., & Colburn, D. (2024). The prevalence of child sexual abuse with online sexual abuse added. *Child abuse & neglect*, 149, 106634 . <https://childusa.org/wp-content/uploads/2024/02/Finkelhor-CSA-with-OSCA-included-2024.pdf>

Finkelhor, D., Turner, H., Colburn, D. and Walsh, W. (2023) Online Child Sexual Exploitation and Abuse Findings from a National Survey <https://childhelplineinternational.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/11/2023-OCSEA-Report.pdf> 2023-OCSEA-Report.pdf <https://www.unh.edu/ccrc/sites/default/files/media/2023-11/ocsea-slide-bulletin-nov-5-2023.pdf>

David Finkelhor conducts his research at Crimes against Children Research Center: <https://www.unh.edu/ccrc>

Fotheringham, T & Lacter, E (2009). A survivor speaks out. Video: <http://endritualabuse.org/survivor-trish-fotheringham-speaks-out/>

Franchino-Olsen, H., Chesworth, B. R., Boyle, C., Rizo, C. F., Martin, S. L., Jordan, B., Macy, R. J., & Stevens, L. (2022). The Prevalence of Sex Trafficking of Children and Adolescents in the United States: A Scoping Review. *Trauma, Violence, & Abuse*, 23(1), 182-195. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1524838020933873>  
Full text: <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/1524838020933873>

- Gallagher, B. (2007). Internet-initiated incitement and conspiracy to commit child sexual abuse (CSA): The typology, extent and nature of known cases. *Journal of Sexual Aggression*, 13(2), 101-119. doi:10.1080/13552600701521363
- Gannon, C., Blokland, A. A., Huikuri, S., Babchishin, K. M., & Lehmann, R. J. (2023). Child sexual abuse material on the darknet. *Forensische Psychiatrie, Psychologie, Kriminologie*, 17(4), 353-365.
- Garcia, L. S., & Manikan, F. Y. (2014). Gender Violence on the Internet: The Philippine Experience. Retrieved January 2022, from: [https://www.genderit.org/sites/default/files/monograph\\_finalz\\_1.pdf](https://www.genderit.org/sites/default/files/monograph_finalz_1.pdf)
- Gewirtz-Meydan, A., Walsh, W., Wolak, J., & Finkelhor, D. (2018). The complex experience of child pornography survivors. *Child Abuse & Neglect*, 80, 238-248. doi:10.1016/j.chiabu.2018.03.031
- Gilbert, R., Kemp, A., Thoburn, J., Sidebotham, P., Radford, L., Glaser, D., & Macmillan, H. L. (2009). Recognising and responding to child maltreatment. *Lancet (London, England)*, 373(9658), 167–180. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(08\)61707-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(08)61707-9)
- Greenbaum, J. (2020). A Public Health Approach to global child sex trafficking. *Annual Review of Public Health*, 41(1), 481–497. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-publhealth-040119-094335>.
- Greenbaum, J., Kaplan, D., & Young, J. (2023) Exploitation, labor and sex trafficking of children and adolescents: health care needs of patients. *Pediatrics*, 151(1):e2022060416.
- Greenberg, A. (2024). Child Abusers Are Getting Better at Using Crypto to Cover Their Tracks. Retrieved 1/14/2025 from: <https://www.wired.com/story/csam-sellers-monero-rise/>
- Greijer, S. & Doek, J. (2016): Guidelines for the Protection of Children from Sexual Exploitation and Sexual Abuse (aka the Luxembourg Guidelines) Interagency Working Group on Sexual Exploitation of Children. file:///C:/Users/Ellen%20P%20Lacter/Downloads/Terminology-guidelines-396922-EN%20(1).pdf
- Hamilton, M.A. & Timon, C.E. (2020). Scouting Abuse: Analysis of Victims' Experiences, Part I. ChildUSA. <https://childusa.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/Analysis-of-Victims-of-Abuse-in-Scouting-Part-1-1.pdf>
- Hamilton, M.A. & Timon, C.E. (2021). Preliminary Report: Five Key Findings of the Elite Athlete Survey. ChildUSA. <https://childusa.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/Five-Key-Findings-from-the-EAS-7.9.2021-Updated.pdf>
- Hanson, E. (July 3, 2025). Organised ritual abuse and its wider context: Degradation, deception and disavowal. Published jointly by *The National Association for People Abused as Children* (NAPAC): <https://napac.org.uk>, and *The Hydrant Programme*: <https://www.hydrantprogramme.co.uk> .] Link: <https://www.hydrantprogramme.co.uk/assets/NPCC-Organised-ritual-abuse-and-its-wider-context-Degradation-deception-and-disavowal-July-2025-v2.pdf>
- Hoffman, W. (2016). *Forceps: Poems about the Birth of the Self* (Fiction). Karnac.
- Hoffman, W. (2019). *White Witch in a Black Robe: A True Story About Criminal Mind Control*. Aeon Books, Ltd.
- Hoffman, W. (2019). *The Enslaved Queen: A Memoir about Electricity and Mind Control*. Aeon Books, Ltd.
- Hoffman, W. (2020) . *A Brain Of My Own: A Memoir About Dissociation Dissolved*. Aeon, Ltd.
- Hoffman, W. (2022), *After Amnesia and During*, Survivorship and SmartNews websites.
- Hoffman, W. (2023) *Belonging*, poems, Kelsay Books.

Hoffman, W. (2025). *Self's Stony Soil*. Independently published.

Hoffman, W. & Miller, A. (2018). *From the Trenches: A Victim and Therapist Talk about Mind Control and Ritual Abuse*. Routledge.

Huikuri, S. (2022). *The Darkest Side of the Darknet: How Do Online Communities of Pedophiles Contribute to the Justification of Sexual Violence Against Children?* Retrieved January 2022, from [https://www.theseus.fi/bitstream/handle/10024/756178/Polamk\\_Katsauksia\\_25.pdf?sequence=1](https://www.theseus.fi/bitstream/handle/10024/756178/Polamk_Katsauksia_25.pdf?sequence=1)

Insoll, T., Ovaska, A.K., Vaaranen-Valkonen, N. (2021). *CSAM Users in the Dark Web: Protecting Children Through Prevention*. <https://perma.cc/M7E7-9YBS>

International Justice Mission (2020a). *Behind the Screens: A Compilation of Case Studies and Learnings about the Online Sexual Exploitation of Children*. Retrieved January 2023, from [https://osec.ijm.org/documents/11/Behind\\_the\\_Screens\\_Fullspread\\_FINAL\\_Nov14.2020.pdf](https://osec.ijm.org/documents/11/Behind_the_Screens_Fullspread_FINAL_Nov14.2020.pdf)

International Justice Mission (2020b). *Online Sexual Exploitation of Children in the Philippines: Analysis and Recommendations for Governments, Industry, and Civil Society*. Retrieved January 2025, from [https://ijmstoragelive.blob.core.windows.net/ijmna/documents/studies/Final-Public-Full-Report-5\\_20\\_2020\\_2021-02-05-055439.pdf](https://ijmstoragelive.blob.core.windows.net/ijmna/documents/studies/Final-Public-Full-Report-5_20_2020_2021-02-05-055439.pdf)

International Justice Mission (2020c). *Falling Short: Demand-Side Sentencing for Online Sexual Exploitation of Children: Composite Case Review, Analysis, and Recommendations for the United Kingdom*. Retrieved January 2025, from [https://osec.ijm.org/documents/4/FALLING\\_SHORT\\_-\\_Demand-side\\_Sentencing\\_-\\_Case\\_Review\\_October\\_2020.pdf](https://osec.ijm.org/documents/4/FALLING_SHORT_-_Demand-side_Sentencing_-_Case_Review_October_2020.pdf)

The International Organization for Migration (IOM), Part of the United Nations System. "Family members are involved in nearly half of child trafficking cases." Web article: [https://www.iom.int/sites/g/files/tmzbd1486/files/our\\_work/DMM/MAD/Counter-trafficking%20Data%20Brief%20081217.pdf](https://www.iom.int/sites/g/files/tmzbd1486/files/our_work/DMM/MAD/Counter-trafficking%20Data%20Brief%20081217.pdf)  
In order to access CTDC open data portal, access this link: <https://www.ctdatacollaborative.org/>

Internet Organised Crime Threat Assessment, Europol (2015). *Online Child Sexual Exploitation*. Retrieved from <https://www.europol.europa.eu/iocta/2015/online-child-exploit.html>

Internet Watch Foundation (2016). *Annual Report 2016*. Downloaded January 2025: [https://www.iwf.org.uk/media/phkhovou/iwf\\_report\\_2016.pdf](https://www.iwf.org.uk/media/phkhovou/iwf_report_2016.pdf)

Internet Watch Foundation (2017). *Trends in Online Child Sexual Exploitation: Examining the Distribution of Captures of Live-streamed Child Sexual Abuse*. Retrieved from: <https://www.iwf.org.uk/sites/default/files/inlinefiles/Distribution%20of%20Captures%20of%20Live-streamed%20Child%20Sexual%20Abuse%20FINAL.pdf>

Internet Watch Foundation. (2021). *The Annual Report*. Retrieved January 2025. Full text here: <file:///C:/Users/Ellen%20P%20Lacter/Downloads/IWF-Annual-Report-2021.pdf>

Internet Watch Foundation (2023). *2022 Annual Report*. Downloaded January 2025: [https://annualreport2022.iwf.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2023/04/IWF-Annual-Report-2022\\_FINAL.pdf](https://annualreport2022.iwf.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2023/04/IWF-Annual-Report-2022_FINAL.pdf)

Internet Watch Foundation (2024). *IWF Annual Report 2023*. Downloaded January, 2025: <https://www.iwf.org.uk/annual-report-2023/>

Internet Watch Foundation (2024). *What has Changed in the AI CSAM Landscape?* Downloaded January, 2025 [https://www.iwf.org.uk/media/drufozvi/iwf-ai-csam-report\\_update-public-jul24v12.pdf](https://www.iwf.org.uk/media/drufozvi/iwf-ai-csam-report_update-public-jul24v12.pdf)

Internet Watch Foundation (2024). Artificial intelligence and the production of Child Sexual Abuse Imagery. Downloaded January 2025:  
<https://www.iwf.org.uk/about-us/why-we-exist/our-research/how-ai-is-being-abused-to-create-child-sexual-abuse-imagery/>

Interpol (January 28, 2016). Terminology Guidelines for the Protection of Children from Sexual Exploitation and Sexual Abuse Adopted by the Interagency Working Group in Luxembourg. Downloaded January, 2025: [Interpol Terminology-guidelines-396922-EN.pdf](https://www.interpol.int/News-and-media/Publications2/Annual-reports2)

Interpol (2017). Interpol Annual Report 2017. Retrieved from:  
<https://www.interpol.int/News-and-media/Publications2/Annual-reports2>

Interpol (March 6, 2018). Study finds boys and very young children at greater risk of severe online sexual abuse. Downloaded January, 2025  
<https://www.interpol.int/News-and-Events/News/2018/Study-finds-boys-and-very-young-children-at-greater-risk-of-severe-online-sexual-abuse>

Interpol (2018). International Child Sexual Exploitation database. Downloaded January, 2025:  
<https://www.interpol.int/en/Crimes/Crimes-against-children/International-Child-Sexual-Exploitation-database>  
This 2018 webpage provides links to these two Interpol reports:  
Summary: Towards a Global Indicator on Unidentified Victims in Child Sexual Exploitation Material - February 2018  
Technical report: Towards a Global Indicator on Unidentified Victims in Child Sexual Exploitation Material - February 2018

Interpol (2024). Appropriate terminology. Downloaded January, 2025:  
<https://www.interpol.int/en/Crimes/Crimes-against-children/Appropriate-terminology>

Karriker, W. (2011). *Morning Come Quickly*, Sandime [fictionalized account].

Keller, M.H. & Dance, G.J.X. (September 28, 2019). The Internet Is Overrun With Images of Child Sexual Abuse. What Went Wrong? The New York Times. Downloaded January 2025:  
<https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2019/09/28/us/child-sex-abuse.html>

Kolton, S. (2022). *Brain Storm: A Life in Pieces*. FLR Press.

London, K., Bruck, M., Ceci, S. J., & Shuman, D. W. (2005). Disclosure of child sexual abuse: What does the research tell us about the ways that children tell? *Psychology, Public Policy, and Law*, 11(1), 194–226.  
[doi.org/10.1037/1076-8971.11.1.194](https://doi.org/10.1037/1076-8971.11.1.194).

Luders, W. (2007) Child Pornography Web Sites: Techniques Used to Evade Law Enforcement, 26 *FBI L. Enforcement Bulletin* 7, at 17; Stacia Glenn, Child Porn Thriving on Web, *San Bernadino County Sun* (Cal.), Nov. 5, 2006 (reports "[c]hild pornography is now a multi-billion-dollar commercial enterprise")

Mains, B. (2010). Virtual Child Pornography, Pandering, and the First Amendment: How Developments in Technology and Shifting First Amendment Jurisprudence Have Affected the Criminalization of Child Pornography. *Hastings Constitutional Law Quarterly*, 37(4). Full text available here:  
[https://repository.uclawsf.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1879&context=hastings\\_constitutional\\_law\\_quaterly](https://repository.uclawsf.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1879&context=hastings_constitutional_law_quaterly)

Marks, J. (1979). *The Search for the Manchurian candidate: The CIA and mind control: The secret history of the behavioral sciences*. W.W. Norton.

Marsh, E. International Association of Chiefs of Police (IACP) (2024). No One Can Hurt You Like Family: What We Know About Familial Trafficking Identification and Response. Dispatch 17(1). Webpage:  
[https://cops.usdoj.gov/html/dispatch/01-2024/familial\\_trafficking.html](https://cops.usdoj.gov/html/dispatch/01-2024/familial_trafficking.html)

- Mcgraw, D., Ebadi, M., Dalenberg, C., Wu, V., Naish, B., & Stal, L. (2019). Consequences of Abuse by Religious Authorities: A Review. *Traumatology*, 25. 10.1037/trm000183.
- McMaugh, K., Roufeil, L., Salter, M., & Middleton, W. (2024b). “Holding the badness”: Therapists’ experiences of treating incestuous abuse continuing into adulthood. *Psychological Trauma: Theory, Research, Practice, & Policy*, 1-8.
- Mexico Oficina de Defensoría de Derechos de la Infancia (2021): It’s a secret: Child sexual exploitation in schools. Downloaded January 2025: [https://dispensariodi.com/wp-content/uploads/2021/05/ita%C2%B4s-a-secret\\_child-sexual-exploitation-in-schools.pdf](https://dispensariodi.com/wp-content/uploads/2021/05/ita%C2%B4s-a-secret_child-sexual-exploitation-in-schools.pdf)
- Middleton, W. (2015). Tipping Points and the Accommodation of the Abuser: Ongoing Incestuous Abuse during Adulthood. *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy*, 4, 4-17.
- Middleton, W. (2023). Beyond Death: Enduring Incest – The Fusion of Father with Daughter. In M. J. Dorahy, S. N. Gold, & J. A. O’Neil (Eds.). *Dissociation and the Dissociative Disorders: Past, Present, Future*. Routledge, Taylor and Francis Group, pp. 223-237.
- Misstear, R. & Turner, R. (2011). Satanic sex cult face years in jail after being found guilty of catalogue of sexual offences. Wales Online. Link: <https://www.walesonline.co.uk/news/wales-news/satanic-sex-cult-face-years-1845296>
- Morton J. (2017). Interidentity amnesia in dissociative identity disorder. *Cognitive neuropsychiatry*, 22(4), 315–330. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13546805.2017.1327848>
- National Center for Missing and Exploited Children (2024). CyberTipline 2023 Report. Downloaded January 2025: <https://www.missingkids.org/gethelpnow/cybertipline/cybertiplinedata>
- National Center for Missing and Exploited Children (2025). CyberTipline 2024 Report. Downloaded August 2025: <https://www.missingkids.org/gethelpnow/cybertipline/cybertiplinedata>
- National Center for Missing and Exploited Children (2024). United States House Committee on Oversight and Accountability Subcommittee on Cybersecurity, Information Technology, and Government Innovation. Testimony of John Shehan. Downloaded January, 2025: <https://oversight.house.gov/wp-content/uploads/2024/03/Final-Written-Testimony-of-John-Shehan.pdf>
- The National Child Traumatic Stress Network (undated). About child sex trafficking. <https://www.nctsn.org/what-child-trauma/traumatypes/sex-trafficking/about-child-sex-trafficking>
- News Nation, (2024) Tip line overwhelmed by AI-generated child abuse material <https://www.msn.com/en-us/money/other/tip-line-overwhelmed-by-ai-generated-child-abuse-material/ar-AA1nxlox>
- Noblitt, J. R. & Noblitt, P.P. (2014). Empirical and forensic evidence of ritual abuse. In *Cult and ritual abuse: narratives, evidence, and healing approaches*, 3rd Edition. Praeger. This chapter is available in full on my website: <https://endritualabuse.org/empirical-and-forensic-evidence-of-ritual-abuse/>
- Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons, Christine Bellatorre and Jessa Crisp, Human Trafficking Expert Consultant Network (July 30, 2024). The Misconceptions of Child Trafficking - United States Department of State Fact Sheet. Downloaded January, 2025: <https://www.state.gov/the-misconceptions-of-child-trafficking>
- Olson, H. & Whitfield, R. (2020). “What every parent should know about preventing child trafficking.” Internet article: <https://www.childrensmercy.org/parent-ish/2020/12/preventing-human-trafficking/>

- OUR Rescue (2024). When Trafficking is a Family Business (2024). Internet article: <https://ourrescue.org/education/education/when-trafficking-is-a-family-business>
- Owen, G. & Savage, T. (2015). The TOR Dark Net. Global Commission in Internet Governance. Retrieved August, 2025: [https://www.cigionline.org/sites/default/files/no20\\_0.pdf](https://www.cigionline.org/sites/default/files/no20_0.pdf)
- Pacheco, E. L. M., Buenaventura, A. E., & Miles, G. M. (2023). “She was willing to send me there”: Intrafamilial child sexual abuse, exploitation and trafficking of boys. *Child Abuse & Neglect*, 142, 105849.
- Pack, S. (2024). How to heal from Satanic Ritual Abuse: A Christian perspective. Pack Publishing
- Petit, J.M. (2008). Report by the Special Rapporteur on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography, supra 162, Paragraph 13.
- Polaris Project. (2023a). Human trafficking during the COVID and post-COVID era: An analysis of data on human trafficking situations reported to the U.S. National Human Trafficking Hotline from 2020-2022 (pp. 1–10). <https://polarisproject.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/Hotline-Trends-Report-2023.pdf>
- Polaris (2023). Sexual exploitation during the pandemic. <https://polarisproject.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/07/Sexual-Exploitation-During-the-Pandemic.pdf>
- Polaris Project. (2023b). In harm’s way: How systems fail human trafficking survivors: Survey results from the first National Survivor Study. <https://polarisproject.org/resources/in-harms-way-how-systems-fail-human-trafficking-survivors/>  
<https://polarisproject.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/06/In-Harms-Way-How-Systems-Fail-Human-Trafficking-Survivors-by-Polaris.pdf>
- Quale, E. (2008). The COPINE Project, *Irish Probation Journal*, 5, September. Retrieved August 24, 2025 from: [https://www.probation.ie/EN/PB/0/7E74855A3EAE073680258036004AF691/\\$File/IPJ2008QUAYLE.pd](https://www.probation.ie/EN/PB/0/7E74855A3EAE073680258036004AF691/$File/IPJ2008QUAYLE.pd)
- Ramiro, L. S., Martinez, A. B., Tan, J. R., Mariano, K., Miranda, G. M., & Bautista, G. (2019). Online child sexual exploitation and abuse: A community diagnosis using the social norms theory. *Child Abuse & Neglect*, 96, 104080.
- Raphael, J. (2020). Parents as Pimps: Survivor Accounts of Trafficking of Children in the United States. *Dignity: A Journal on Sexual Exploitation and Violence*. 4(4) Article 7. DOI: 10.23860/dignity.2019.04.04.07  
Available in full text here: <https://digitalcommons.uri.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1137&context=dignity>
- Reid, J.A., Huard, J. & Haskell, R.A. (2014). Family-Facilitated Juvenile Sex Trafficking. *Journal of Crime & Justice*. DOI:10.1080/0735648X.2014.967965
- Richards, R. D., and Calvert, C. (2007). Untangling child pornography from the adult entertainment industry: An inside look at the industry's efforts to protect minors. *California Western Law Review*, 44(2), 5. Full text available: <https://scholarlycommons.law.cwsl.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1092&context=cwlr>
- Ross, V. (2006). The CIA Doctors: Human Rights Violations by American Psychiatrists. Manitou Communications.
- Rutz, C. (2001). *A nation betrayed: The Chilling True Story of Secret Cold War Experiments Performed on Our Children and Other Innocent People*. Grass Lake, Michigan: Fidelity Publishing.
- Rutz, C. (2003). Healing from Ritual Abuse and Mind Control, a Presentation at the Sixth Annual Ritual Abuse, Secretive Organizations and Mind Control Conference, August 8-10, 2003. Retrieved June 12, 2010, from: <http://ritualabuse.us/smart-conference/conf03/healing-from-ritual-abuse-and-mind-control/>

- Salter, M. (2013a). *Organised sexual abuse*. Routledge: Oxford.
- Salter, M. (2013b). Through a glass, darkly: Representation and power in research on organized abuse. *Qualitative Sociology Review*, 9(3), 152-166.
- Salter, M. (2016). The privatisation of incest: The neglect of familial sexual abuse in Australian public inquiries. In Y. Smaal, A. Kaladeflos, & M. Finnane (Eds.), *The sexual abuse of children: Recognition and redress* (pp. 108-120). Melbourne: Monash University Press.
- Salter, M. (2017). Organized abuse in adulthood: Survivor and professional perspectives. *Journal of trauma & dissociation: the official journal of the International Society for the Study of Trauma and Dissociation (ISSTD)*, 18(3), 441–453. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15299732.2017.1295426>
- Salter, M., & Dagistanli, S. (2015). Cultures of abuse: ‘Sex grooming’, organised abuse and race in Rochdale, UK. *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy*, 4(2), 50-64. doi: 10.5204/ijcsd.v3i2.211
- Salter, M., & Hanson, E. (2021). “I need you all to understand how pervasive this issue is”: User efforts to regulate child sexual offending on social media. In J. Bailey, A. Flynn, & N. Henry (Eds.), *The Emerald international handbook of technology-facilitated violence and abuse* (pp. 729–748). Emerald Publishing. <https://doi.org/10.1108/978-1-83982-848-520211053> Downloaded January 2025: <https://typeset.io/pdf/i-need-you-all-to-understand-how-pervasive-this-issue-is-17gluviw58.pdf>
- Salter, M., & Whitten, T. (2022). A Comparative Content Analysis of Pre-Internet and Contemporary Child Sexual Abuse Material. *Deviant behavior*, 43(9), 1120-1134. doi:10.1080/01639625.2021.1967707
- Salter, M., & Wong, T. (2024). Parental Production of Child Sexual Abuse Material: A Critical Review. *Trauma, violence & abuse*, 25(3), 1826–1837. <https://doi.org/10.1177/15248380231195891> [https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC11155224/pdf/10.1177\\_15248380231195891.pdf](https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC11155224/pdf/10.1177_15248380231195891.pdf)
- Salter, M. & Woodlock, D. (2022) The anti-epistemology of organised abuse: Ignorance, exploitation, inaction. *British Journal of Criminology*. 63. 10.1093/bjc/azac007. Available in full text on ResearchGate.
- Salter, M., Woodlock, D., & Wong, T. (2023). The sexual politics of technology industry responses to online child sexual exploitation during COVID-19: "This pernicious elitism". *Child abuse & neglect*, 106559. Advance online publication. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chiabu.2023.106559>. Downloaded January 2025 from Science Direct.
- Sarson, J., Gordon, E.B., & MacDonald, L. (2019). Family-based non-state torturers who traffic their daughters: Praxis principles and healing epiphanies. In J. Winterduk & J. Jones (Eds.), *The Palgrave International Handbook of Human Trafficking*. (pp. 839–863). [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-63058-8\\_51](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-63058-8_51)
- Sarson, J. and MacDonald, L. (2017). No Longer Invisible: Families that Torture, Traffic, and Exploit their Girl Child. *Oñati Socio-legal Series* [online], 8 (1), 85-105. Available from: <http://ssrn.com/abstract=3086626>
- Sarson, J. & MacDonald, L. (2020). Having Non-State Torture Recognized by the UN and Member States as an Infringement of Women’s Human Rights Is Imperative. *Canadian Woman Studies/Les Cahiers de la Femme*, Volume 33(1 & 2), 143-155.
- Schröder, J., Nick, S., Richter-Appelt, H., & Briken, P. (2018). Psychiatric impact of organized and ritual child sexual abuse: Cross-sectional findings from individuals who report being victimized. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 15(11), 2417.

- Schröder, J., Behrendt, P., Nick, S., & Briken, P. (2020a). Hintergründe und psychische Folgen organisierter und ritueller Gewalt–Berichte an die Unabhängige Kommission zur Aufarbeitung sexuellen Kindesmissbrauchs. *Fortschritte der Neurologie· Psychiatrie*, 88(06), 374-378.
- Schröder, J., Behrendt, P., Nick, S., & Briken, P. (2020b). Was erschwert die Aufdeckung organisierter und ritueller Gewaltstrukturen?: Eine qualitative Inhaltsanalyse der Erlebnisberichte von Betroffenen und ZeitzeugInnen. *Psychiatrische Praxis*, 47(5), 249.
- Schröder, J., Nick, S., Richter-Appelt, H., & Briken, P. (2020). Demystifying ritual abuse - insights by self-identified victims and health care professionals. *Journal of Trauma & Dissociation*, 21(3), 349–364. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15299732.2020.1719260>
- Schwartz, H. L. (2013). *The alchemy of wolves and sheep: A relational approach to internalized perpetration in complex trauma survivors*. Routledge.
- Scott, S. (2001). *The politics and experience of ritual abuse: Beyond disbelief*. Open University Press.
- Seigfried-Spellar, K. C., & Rogers, M. K. (2013). Does deviant pornography use follow a Guttman-like progression? *Computers in Human Behavior*, 29(5), 1997–2003.
- Seto, M., Buckman, C., Dwyer, R., & Quayle, E. (2018). Production and Active Trading of Child Sexual Exploitation Images Depicting Identified Victims: NCMEC/Thorn Research Report. NCMEC. Retrieved from: [https://www.missingkids.org/content/dam/missingkids/pdfs/ncmec-analysis/Production%20and%20Active%20Trading%20of%20CSAM\\_FullReport\\_FINAL.pdf](https://www.missingkids.org/content/dam/missingkids/pdfs/ncmec-analysis/Production%20and%20Active%20Trading%20of%20CSAM_FullReport_FINAL.pdf)
- SharedHope. Familial Trafficking Warning Signs. Webpage: [https://sharedhope.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/SHI\\_Warning-Signs-of-Familial-Trafficking.pdf](https://sharedhope.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/SHI_Warning-Signs-of-Familial-Trafficking.pdf)
- Shay, J. (2014). Moral Injury, *Psychoanalytic Psychology*, 31(2), pp 182-191. Retrieved June 5, 2024: <https://www.themoralinjuryinstitute.com/wp-content/uploads/2019/12/Moral-Injury-J-Shay.pdf>
- Sinason, V. (1994) *Treating survivors of satanist abuse*. Routledge: Oxford.
- Solis, D. (December 11, 2024). Sex, power, and profit: A global comparative perspective on the US human trafficking crisis. *Harvard Review*. Downloaded January, 2025: <https://hir.harvard.edu/sex-power-and-profit-a-global-comparative-perspective-on-the-us-human-trafficking-crisis/>
- Sprang, G., & Cole, J. (2018). Familial sex trafficking of minors: Trafficking conditions, clinical presentation, and system involvement. *Journal of family violence*, 33(3), 185-195. doi:10.1007/s10896-018-9950-y
- Sullivan, K. (2006). *Unshackled: A Survivor's Story of Mind Control*. Dandelion Books.
- Svali (1996). How the cult programs people. Retrieved November 4 2023, from: [http://www.bibliotecapleyades.net/sociopolitica/esp\\_sociopol\\_illuminati\\_svali01a.htm](http://www.bibliotecapleyades.net/sociopolitica/esp_sociopol_illuminati_svali01a.htm)
- Svali (2018). *It's Not Impossible: Healing from Ritual Abuse and Mind Control*. Independently Published
- Svali (2024a). *Never Give Up: The Autobiography of a Survivor of Ritual Abuse and Mind Control*. Independently Published.
- Svali (2024b). *Never Give Up Part Two: The Struggle*. Independently Published.

Svali (2025). *Never give up part three: Getting free*. Independently Published.

Tate, T. (1991). *Children for the devil: Ritual abuse and Satanic crime*. Methuen.

Taylor, B. (1999). *Thanks For The Memories ... The Truth Has Set Me Free! The Memoirs of Bob Hope's and Henry Kissinger's Mind-Controlled Slave*. Brice Taylor Trust.

Terre des Hommes. (2013). *Fullscreen on View – An Exploratory Study on the Background and Psychosocial Consequences of Webcam Child Sex Tourism in the Philippines*. Retrieved January 2022, from <https://www.datocms-assets.com/22233/1630916713-sweetie-background-and-psychological-impact-of-webcam-child-sex-tourism.pdf>

Tumbado, JG (March 22, 2025). Supreme Court affirms life sentence for Peter Scully in landmark human trafficking ruling.

Link: [https://frontpageph.com/supreme-court-affirms-life-sentence-for-peter-scully-in-landmark-human-trafficking-ruling/#google\\_vignette](https://frontpageph.com/supreme-court-affirms-life-sentence-for-peter-scully-in-landmark-human-trafficking-ruling/#google_vignette)

United Nations (February 5, 2024): UN expert alarmed by new emerging exploitative practices of online child sexual abuse. Downloaded January, 2025:

<https://www.ohchr.org/en/press-releases/2024/02/un-expert-alarmed-new-emerging-exploitative-practices-online-child-sexual>

United Nations, (October 2024). Children facing higher risk of sexual abuse and exploitation from misuse of technologies: Special Rapporteur. Downloaded January, 2025:

<https://www.ohchr.org/en/press-releases/2024/10/children-facing-higher-risk-sexual-abuse-and-exploitation-misuse>

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (2024). *Global report on trafficking in persons 2024*. United Nations publication, Sales no.: E.24.XI.11. Downloaded January, 2025:

[https://www.unodc.org/documents/data-and-analysis/glotip/2024/GLOTIP24\\_special\\_points\\_final.pdf](https://www.unodc.org/documents/data-and-analysis/glotip/2024/GLOTIP24_special_points_final.pdf)

United States Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (2024). *About Sex Trafficking*.

<https://www.cdc.gov/sexual-violence/about/about-sex-trafficking.html>

United States Department of Homeland Security (2024). *Know the Threat: Online Child Sexual Exploitation & Abuse*. Full text online: [https://www.dhs.gov/sites/default/files/2024-04/24\\_0408\\_k2p\\_csea-onepager.pdf](https://www.dhs.gov/sites/default/files/2024-04/24_0408_k2p_csea-onepager.pdf)

United States Department of Justice (August, 2010). *National Strategy for Child Exploitation Prevention and Interdiction*, Report to Congress, p.3 <http://www.justice.gov/psc/docs/natstrategyreport.pdf>, p.3. 52

United States Department of Justice (April, 2016): *The National Strategy for Child Exploitation Prevention and Interdiction: A Report to Congress*. Downloaded January, 2025:

[https://www.justice.gov/d9/pages/attachments/2016/04/19/2016\\_natl\\_strategy\\_rpt\\_-\\_online\\_version\\_updated\\_final\\_08\\_16\\_2016.pdf](https://www.justice.gov/d9/pages/attachments/2016/04/19/2016_natl_strategy_rpt_-_online_version_updated_final_08_16_2016.pdf)

United States Department of Justice (2023a). *Child sex trafficking*. Downloaded January 13, 2025:

<https://www.justice.gov/criminal/criminal-ceos/child-sex-trafficking>

United States Department of Justice (2023b). *Human Trafficking Data Collection Activities*. Downloaded August 20, 2025: <https://bjs.ojp.gov/document/htdca23.pdf>

United States Department of Justice (2023b). *Citizen's Guide To U.S. Federal Law On Child Sex Trafficking*. Downloaded January 13, 2025:

<https://www.justice.gov/criminal/criminal-ceos/citizens-guide-us-federal-law-child-sex-trafficking>

United States Department of Justice (2023c). Child Sexual Abuse Material: Working group report. National Strategy for Child Exploitation Prevention & Interdiction, a Report to Congress - 2023, Subject Matter Expert Working Group Reports. Downloaded January, 2025: [https://www.justice.gov/d9/2023-06/child\\_sexual\\_abuse\\_material\\_2.pdf](https://www.justice.gov/d9/2023-06/child_sexual_abuse_material_2.pdf) Included in the 2023 Department of Justice Report: National Strategy for Child Exploitation Prevention and Interdiction: <https://www.justice.gov/psc/national-strategy-child-exploitation-prevention-and-interdiction>

United States Department of State (2021). Navigating the Unique Complexities in Familial Trafficking Fact Sheet Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons. Webpage: <https://www.state.gov/navigating-the-unique-complexities-in-familial-trafficking/>

University of Nottingham Rights Lab (2023). Legal and institutional responses to the online sexual exploitation of children The Netherlands country case study. Downloaded August, 2025: <https://www.nottingham.ac.uk/research/beacons-of-excellence/rights-lab/resources/reports-and-briefings/2023/october/legal-and-institutional-responses-to-the-online-sexual-exploitation-of-children-the-netherlands-country-case-study.pdf>

Vallance, C. ( April 22, 2024). Three-year-olds groomed online, charity warns. British Broadcasting System (BBC). Downloaded January 2025: <https://www.bbc.com/news/articles/cx9wezr1d1vo>

Varrella, A. (2017). Live Streaming of Child Sexual Abuse: Background, Legislative Frameworks and the Experience of the Philippines. *ECPAT International Journal*, 12, 47-61.

Voller, V.K., Maass, K.L., Weinfurter, E.V. & Martin, L. (2024). The hidden and misunderstood problem of familial sex trafficking of minors in the United States: A scoping review of the literature. *Child Welfare*, 102(2), pp 145-180. Pdf on Ebsco and in my folder.

Waters, F. (April 16, 2008). “Challenges and Solutions for Protecting our Children from Violence and Exploitation in the 21st Century.” Testimony of Special Agent Flint Waters. Lead Agent for the Wyoming Internet Crimes Against Children Task Force, Wyoming Division of Criminal Investigation Office of the Attorney General for the United States Senate Committee on the Judiciary Subcommittee on Crime and Drugs. Downloaded January, 2025: Full text: <https://www.judiciary.senate.gov/imo/media/doc/08-04-16WatersTestimony.pdf>

WeProtect Global Alliance (2019). Global threat assessment 2019. Working together to end the sexual exploitation of children online. London: Open Government Licence. <https://www.weprotect.org/global-threat-assessment/>

WeProtect Global Alliance. (2020). Impact of covid-19 on online child sexual exploitation. WeProtect Global Alliance. Downloaded January 2025: <https://www.weprotect.org/resources/library/impact-of-covid-19-on-child-sexual-exploitation-online/>

WeProtect Global Alliance (2023). Global Threat Assessment 2023: Analysis of the Sexual Threats Children Face Online. Downloaded January 2025: <https://www.weprotect.org/global-threat-assessment-23/>.

White, C. N., Robichaux, K., Huang, A., & Luo, C. (2024). When families become perpetrators: A case series on familial trafficking. *Journal of Family Violence*, 39(3), 435–447. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10896-023-00522-w>

Whitfield, C. L., Silberg, J., & Fink, P. J. (2000). Exposing Misinformation Concerning Child Sexual Abuse and Adult Survivors. *Journal of child sexual abuse*, 9(3-4), 1–8. [https://doi.org/10.1300/J070v09n01\\_01](https://doi.org/10.1300/J070v09n01_01)

Weinstein, H. (1988). *Father, Son and CIA*. Halifax, Nova Scotia, Canada: Formac Publishing Co.

Williams, R. (2022). The US now hosts more child sexual abuse material online than any other country. *MIT Technology Review*. Full text here: <https://www.technologyreview.com/2022/04/26/1051282/the-us-now-hosts-more-child-sexual-abuse-material-online-than-any-other-country/>

Woodhams, J., Kloess, J. A., Jose, B., & Hamilton-Giachritsis, C. E. (2021). Characteristics and behaviors of anonymous users of dark web platforms suspected of child sexual offenses. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 12, 623668.

Wortley, R., Findlater, D., Bailey, A., & Zuhair, D. (2024). Accessing child sexual abuse material: Pathways to offending and online behaviour. *Child abuse & neglect*, 154, 106936. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chiabu.2024.106936>  
[https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC11155224/pdf/10.1177\\_15248380231195891.pdf](https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC11155224/pdf/10.1177_15248380231195891.pdf)  
<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0145213424003260>

Wyre, R. (1992). Pornography and Sexual Violence: Working with Sex Offenders., In Catherine Itzen (Ed.): *Pornography; Women, Violence and Civil Liberties*. Pp.237-247).

Zeyzus Johns, B. A., Casola, A. R., Rea, O., Skolnik, N., & Fidler, S. K. (2024). Safe-Guarding Youth from Online Sexual Exploitation in the Digital Era: A Role for Primary Care. *American journal of lifestyle medicine*, 15598276241268236. Advance online publication. <https://doi.org/10.1177/15598276241268236>

Zimmerman, C., Hossain, M., Yun, K., Gajdadziev, V., Guzun, N., Tchomarova, M., Ciarrocchi, R. A., Johansson, A., Kefurtova, A., Scodanibbio, S., Motus, M. N., Roche, B., Morison, L., & Watts, C. (2008). The Health of Trafficked Women: a Survey of Women entering Post-trafficking Services in Europe. *American Journal of Public Health*, 98(1), 55–59. <https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.2006.108357>.